Notes

INTRODUCTION

1. According to the 2001 census of India, India's population on March 1, 2001 was 1,027,015,247 persons. The growth rate between 1991 and 2001 was 21.34 percent. Annual growth is estimated at ca. twenty million. In 2001 35 percent of India's population was under fifteen years old.

2. There is a website that lists and describes all Hindu temples in North America with impressive detail: www.garamchai.com/temples.htm.

3. Francis C. Assisi, "The Hinduization of America."

4. "De-anglicizing Asian Academia."

5. Recently Oxford University Press was forced to withdraw a book authored by Professor P. B. Courtright of Emory University, giving a Freudian interpretation of Gaṇeśa that was not only found offensive by Hindus but also is untenable from a scholarly standpoint, although it fits into the postmodernist paradigm. On the wider context see Alan Roland, "The Uses (and Misuses) of Psychoanalysis in South Asian Studies: Mysticism and Child Development."

6. See W. Halbfass, "Indien und die Geschichtsschreibung der Philosophie."

7. L. Dumont, "A Fundamental Problem."

8. Among "Western scholars" are also included Indian scholars who have adopted the presuppositions of contemporary Western scholarship, and among "Indian scholars," non-Indians have been included who have accepted traditional principles of Indian scholarship. A very detailed and well-documented analysis of this situation has been presented by Y. G. Rosser in "The Groan: Loss of Scholarship and High Drama in 'South Asian' Studies."

9. Malati J. Shendge, an Indian scholar who also had studied in the West, made a strong plea for "The Interdisciplinary Approach to Indian Studies."

10. Agehananda Bharati, (alias Leopold Fischer) a Western scholar who spent years in India, noted in a paper entitled "Psychological Approaches to Indian Studies: More Cons than Pros": "I strongly believe that psychological models are infertile and quite inadequate for Indian studies, particularly for antiquarian research."

11. L. Dumont, "A Fundamental Problem," 161. The emphases are L. Dumont's.

12. In 1991 the University of California at Berkeley established its first chair for Tamil as part of its Indian Studies program. *Hinduism Today* (November 1991): 28. Philip Lutgendorf, in an essay on "Mediaeval Devotional Traditions: An Annotated Survey of Recent Scholarship," in A. Sharma (ed.), *The Study of Hinduism*, 200–60, has documented a great number of translations from diverse Indian languages.

13. The usual way the name is written on local road signs is Vrindaban. The correct transliteration would be Vṛndāvana, "Vṛnda Forest." One can also find Brindaban, Brindabon, and Brindavan.

14. K. Klostermaier, *In the Paradise of Krishna* and "Remembering Vrindaban."

15. K. Klostermaier, "Hinduism in Bombay."

16. According to the 2001 Indian census, Hindus form 82 percent of India's population, Muslims 12.12 percent, Christians 2.34 percent, Sikhs 1.94 percent, Buddhists 0.76 percent, and Jains 0.40 percent.

17. See Alexandra George, *Social Ferment in India*, chapter 9, "The Tribes of India," 233–55. Also: Nirmal Minz, "Anthropology and the Deprived."

18. George, ibid., "The Scheduled Castes," 202–32. An interesting document shedding light on the life of an untouchable community is the so-called *Kahar Chronicle* by Tarashankar Banerjea. See Raja Kanta Ray, "The Kahar Chronicle."

19. R. Inden, "Orientalist Constructions of India."

1. THE BEGINNINGS OF HINDUISM

1. It would be wrong, however, to accuse the English as beings the "inventors of Hinduism," as Hadwa Dom, a Dalit activist does, in a recent internet article *The English Invention of Hinduism* "The Myth of One Hindu Religion Exploded."

2. The latest and most detailed exposition of the views and arguments of the two hostile camps is provided in the lengthy articles that have appeared in the *Journal of Indo-European Studies* (JIES) under the title "Indo-Aryan Migration Debate." Vol. 30/3&4 (Fall/Winter 2002) and Vol. 31/1&2 (Spring/Summer 2003). The controversy is brought to a sharp focus by the lead article of N. Kazanas, "Indigenous Indo-Aryans and the *Rigveda*," M. Witzel's response "Ein Fremdling im Ṛgveda," and N. Kazanas "Final Reply." In these articles the whole phalanx of pro- and anti-invasionist arguments is arrayed, and sharp taunts and missiles are exchanged reminiscent of religious wars of the past. Vishal Agarwal published on the Internet "A Reply to Michael Witzel's 'Ein Fremdling im *Ṛgveda*'" refuting not only Witzel's arguments but also highlighting the uncivil and offensive tone of his writings. It is telling that Witzel used the popular Indian Marxist fortnightly *Frontline* for his uncalled for attacks on all scholars who did not agree with him on the Aryan invasion theory.

3. One of the prominent Indian scholars who quite early rejected the Aryan invasion theory was Aurobindo Ghose. In *The Secret of the Veda*, written between 1914 and 1916, he points out that the text of the Veda has no reference to any such invasion.

4. Edition used: third edition, Oxford, Clarendon Press 1906 (reprint 1959).

5. In 1767 James Parsons had published a long work, entitled *The Remains of Japhet, Being Historical Enquiries into the Affinity and Origins of the European Languages*, using samples from over a dozen languages extending from Irish to Bengalī.

6. Ibid., 101.

7. The argument was entirely linguistic speculative, and wildly contradictory assertions were made from the same linguistic basis by various authors. Among them there was neither agreement on methodology nor on the interpretation of "linguistic facts."

8. M. Müller, *The Six Systems*, 35.

9. See Vishal Agarwal, "The Aryan Migration Theory."

10. G. Feuerstein, S. Kak, D. Frawley, *In Search of the Cradle of Civilization*.

11. S. Kalyanaraman has devoted a large part of his life to the search for the River Sarasvatī and the study of the settlements in its basin. As a result of his research, he published in 2003 seven volumes that provide an enormous amount of detail relating to the Sarasvatī civilization. Due to his efforts, the government of India is taking up several projects to bring the Sarasvatī back to life and to interlink the north Indian river systems.

12. Whereas Harappa and Mohenjo Daro occupy an area of approximately two hundred acres each, Lakhmirwala and Rakhigari cover almost five hundred acres and several others also situated in the former Sarasvatī basin either exceed or come close to the largest Indus valley settlements.

13. A. Seidenberg, "The Geometry of the Vedic Rituals." Traditional North Indian builders still use the same standard of measurements that had been used by the builders of Harappa and Mohenjo Daro.

14. "The Purāṇic Tradition of Historiography in India."

15. Philip von Zabern (ed.), *Vergessene Städte am Indus: Frühe Kulturen in Pakistan vom 8. bis zum 2. Jahrtausend v. Chr.*

16. The most complete representation and summary of research is found in E. Neumayer, *Prehistoric Indian Rock Paintings*. Attempts at interpretation are made by Kapila Vatsyayan in an essay entitled "Prehistoric Paintings."

17. E. Mayr, *Toward a New Philosophy of Biology*: "The time would seem to have come for the translators and interpreters of Aristotle to use a language appropriate to his thinking, that is the language of biology, and not that of sixteenth-century humanists" (56).

18. As Walter S. Fairservis has said: "One of the most complex, important and indeed vexing problems confronting South Asian archaeologists today is the relationship of early Vedic culture(s), as described in the *Ṛgveda*, to archaeological remains." "The Harappan Civilization and the Ṛgveda," in M. Witzel (ed.), *Inside the Texts—Beyond the Texts*. At the end of his article, Fairservis lists a number of cultural traits attested in the *Ṛgveda* and paralleled in Harappan cultural remains. He also insists that "rather than there being a gap between the later 3rd Millennium remains and those of the 2nd Millennium, suggestive of the demise of the earlier and the sudden appearance of the later, in fact some artifactual material is contemporaneous and thus a continuity existed" (61).

19. The most extensive work relating to this is Asko Parpola's *Deciphering the Indus Script*, a marvel of scholarship and a treasury of information about early Indian history, but far from offering a convincing decipherment of these signs.

20. Subhash Kak, *The Astronomical Code of the Ṛgveda*.

21. *In Search of the Cradle of Civilization*.

22. French scientists recently discovered in Baluchistan, close to the Indus valley, a great many fossil remnants of hominids from the Oligocene.

2. HINDU *DHARMA*: ORTHODOXY AND HERESY IN HINDUISM

1. "The word *dharm* in Hindī has an almost totally identical application to that of the English word 'religion' which has, of course, an enormous semantic spread, and it would seem highly probable that the English word and concept is the major determinant factor in the Hindī usage." S. Weightman and S. M. Pandey, "*Dharm* and *Kartavy* in Modern Hindī" in W. D. O'Flaherty and J. D. M. Derret (eds.), *The Concept of Duty in Southeast Asia*, 223. The same authors also point out that the word *mat* (literally "thought," "doctrine") is equally common and used like the word *dharm*: *Hindūdharm* = *Hindūmat*.

2. In Gautama's *Nyāya-Sūtra*, *dharma* is "a specific property of an object."

3. Pandit Dinanath Sarma, "Sanātana dharma," *Kalyāṇa*.

4. *HDhS*, vol. 1, 1.

5. *Manusmṛti* II, 6; cf. also *Yājñavalkyasmṛti* I, 7.

6. *Manusmṛti* II, 9.

7. Ibid., 11.

8. J. C. Heesterman, "On the Origin of the Nāstika."

9. *Manusmṛti* II, 17–24.

10. *Manusmṛti* I, 111–18.

11. "Sanātana dharma hi sarvabhauma dharma yā mānava dharma hai," *Dharmāṅka* (*Kalyāna*) [Hindī], my own translation.

12. *Bhagavadgītā* III, 35.

13. *Manusmṛti* VIII, 15.

14. W. D. O'Flaherty in her introduction to *The Concept of Duty in Southeast Asia*, xiii ff., comments on the essentially indefinable character of *dharma* and the clash between existing definitions. She also points out that *dharma* and *adharma* are correlative, that *devas* only appear where there are demons, and that "*dharma* is a problem rather than a concept, vague, indeterminable . . . an ambiguous concept."

15. P. V. Kane in his monumental *History of Dharmaśāstra* refers to over two thousand books!

16. The informative essay on "Use and Misuse of the Dharma," by A. Kunst, in W. D. O'Flaherty and J. D. M. Derret (eds.), *The Concept of Duty in Southeast Asia*, 3–17, shows some of the development.

17. "The Concept of Duty in Ancient Indian Jurisprudence: The Problem of Ascertainment," in *The Concept of Duty in Southeast Asia*, 18–65.

18. From *Gautama's Nyāyasūtras with Vātsyāyana Bhāṣya*, ed. and trans. Ganganatha Jha, I, 18.

19. *Yogasūtras* II, 30–32.

20. Vaikunthavāsi Śrī Bābu Sādhucaranprasād, *Dharmaśāstrasaṇgraha*, a digest of Hindu law for practical use, with selections from forty-six *smṛtis* according to topics, gives a good idea of the range of *dharmaśāstra*.

21. The best-known and best-documented case is that of Raja Ram Mohan Roy, who successfully fought for the abolition of *satī*.

22. "Hinduism, A Static Structure or a Dynamic Force?" in *Nehru Abhinandan Granth*, 421–25. The author was formerly head of the Department of Ancient Indian History and Culture, Banares Hindu University.

23. "Moral Foundations of Indian Society," ibid., 464–69. The author was the editor of the multivolume *Dharmakośá* (Wāī: Dharmakośa Maṇḍala, 1937–1961) and one of the most outstanding pandits of contemporary India.

24. Apart from the countless instances that one encounters in daily life in India itself, Indian dailies quite frequently carry letters to the editor with massive complaints like the following from *Times of India* (8 March 1968):

> At the national integration conference held at Delhi in September last a code of conduct was prescribed to be observed by political leaders. The code required them not to exploit communal and caste feelings for political purposes. Hardly six months later, during the recent general elections, one saw in Poona the sorry spectacle of the code of conduct being flagrantly violated by the political leaders in general and the Congress leaders in particular. In each of the six constituencies in Poona the Congress candidate nominated was of the same caste that was in overwhelming majority in that particular constituency. The election speeches of the leaders conveyed the impression that they were totally unaware of the existence of the code of conduct. Every candidate openly preached caste hatred and exhorted the electorate to vote for him as he belonged to their caste. Perhaps never before were caste and communal feelings so deeply aroused as they were during the recent general elections in Poona. (V. D. Mahajan).

Another reader complained that: "even after twenty years of freedom untouchability in the villages is still as virulent as ever. The social justice said to have been one to the Scheduled Castes and Tribes has just not been adequate" (Raja Sekhara Rao).

25. "Sādhana," *RS* 16, 2 (1969): 36–50.

26. The most complete and systematic description is to be found in: Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva* [Hindī]. H. H. Wilson's *Religious Sects of the Hindus* (originally published in 1861; reprint 1958) is incomplete, unsystematic, and in quite a few instances incorrect.

27. G. S. Ghurye, *Indian Sādhus*, 110 ff. and 177 ff.

28. *Liṅgapurāṇa* I, 107, 41 ff.

29. We have to interpret some of these as a reaction against persecution on the part of non-Vaiṣṇavas such as Citrasena, who at the instigation of Śaiva monks prohibited the worship of Viṣṇu in his realm, ordered his officers to persecute the Vaiṣṇavas, and had the images of Viṣṇu thrown into the ocean. Cf. R. C. Hazra, *Studies in the Upapurāṇas*, vol. 2, 362 f.

30. W. O'Flaherty, "The Origin of Heresy in Hindu Mythology"; S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 3, 19. See *Kūrma Purāṇa*, chapter 15.

31. For a more extensive treatment of this topic, see K. Klostermaier, "Hindu Views of Buddhism."

32. Cf. *HCIP*, R. C. Majumdar, general ed., vol. 3, 437; S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 5, 45; M. Winternitz, *Geschichte der Indischen Literatur*, vol. 3, 426 ff.; Alkondavilli Govindacharya, *The Divine Wisdom of the Dravida Saints*, 78 ff.

33. *Viṣṇupurāṇa* III, 18, 15 ff. My translation.

34. P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 2, part 2, 716 ff.

35. Nārāyaṇa Bhaṭṭa's *Maṇimañjarī* as summarized by S. N. Dasgupta, HIPh, vol. 4, 52.

36. The English translation by E. B. Cowell and A. E. Gough is incomplete, it leaves out the last chapter on Advaita Vedānta. See K. Klostermaier, "Śaṁkaradarśanam."

37. *Brahma Sūtra Bhāṣya* I, 1, 2: Thibaut's translation, Part I, 15.

38. W. Ruben, "Materialismus im Leben des Alten Indien"; Dale Riepe describes himself in *The Philosophy of India and Its Impact on American Thought* as "interested in the naturalistic and materialistic philosophy in India," mentioning his dissertation on *The Naturalistic Tradition in Indian Thought*. In India M. N. Roy (*Materialism*, written in 1934, published 1940; reprint Calcutta: Renaissance Publishers 1951), on his way toward Radical Humanism via Marxism-Leninism, drew attention to the often underplayed materialistic stream of the Indian tradition.

39. II, 4, 12.

40. *Sarvadarśanasaṁgraha* I.

41. This has been proposed, for example, by Raymond Panikkar in *Kerygma und Indien*, 84 ff.

42. They also claim quite often personal infallibility!

43. See "Holy War in India."

44. "No Hold Barred Battle."

45. *India Today* (15 April 1993): 36.

3. THE VEDA: REVELATION AND SCRIPTURE IN HINDUISM

1. Most details mentioned in "Procedure of Reciting *Śrīmad Bhāgavata*," 6–8 apply (with appropriate modifications) to the recitation of other Hindu scriptures too.

2. Almost all the important popular scriptures have been supplied with a *Māhātmya*, a praise of the greatness of the work, containing also profuse promises attached to the reading of the scripture.

3. See, e.g., K. Sivaraman, "The Word as a Category of Revelation," in H. Coward and K. Sivaraman (eds.), *Revelation in Indian Thought, A Festschrift in Honor of Professor T. R. V. Murti*. 45–64.

4. Some interesting details are mentioned by A. Esteller in "The Quest for the Original *Ṛgveda*" and "The *Ṛgveda Saṃhitā* as a 'Palimpsest'."

5. The *guru-paraṃparā*, the succession of teachers, had to be memorized by each student as legitimation of his knowledge. In *Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad* IV, 6, sixty links of this chain of tradition are mentioned, going back through mythical figures to Brahmā, the creator himself, who revealed it.

6. P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 1 (1930): 70–75.

7. See G. Srinivasa Murti's introduction to *Śrī Pāñcarātra Rakṣa of Śrī Vedānta Deśika*, ixx–xii.

8. The most exhaustive account is given in J. Gonda, *Vedic Literature (Saṃhitās and Brāhmaṇas)*. On the Vedic schools, see L. Renou, *Les écoles védiques et la formation du Veda*. See also S. W. Jamison and M. Witzel, "Vedic Hinduism," in A. Sharma (ed.) *The Study of Hinduism*, 65–113.

9. For annotated text, see T. Aufrecht, *Die Hymnen des Ṛgveda* and *Ṛgveda with the commentary of Sāyaṇa*, M. Müller (ed.). The best complete translation is H. F. Geldner's *Ṛgveda deutsch*. For a complete metric English translation see R. T. H. Griffith, *The Hymns of the Ṛgveda*.

10. For text, see Ram Sarma Acarya, *Sāmaveda*, the metric translation by T. R. H. Griffith, *The Hymns of the Sāmaveda*.

11. For text, see A. Weber, *Yajurveda Vājasaneyīsaṃhitā*, 2 vols., the metric translation by T. R. H. Griffith, *The Hymns of the Yajurveda*.

12. For text, see R. Roth and W. D. Whitney, *Atharvaveda Saṃhitā*, the translation by W. D. Whitney, *Atharvaveda Saṃhitā*.

13. L. Renou, *Vedic India*.

14. Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, 81 ff.

15. Text: Pandurang Jawaji, *Śīkṣādivedaṣadaṅgāni*.

16. In later times, all these auxiliary sciences developed into independent scholarly disciplines, each with a voluminous literature of its own.

17. Max Müller edited and translated *Śaunaka's Ṛgvedapratiśākhya* (Leipzig 1856).

18. Gonda, *Vedic Literature*, 43.

19. I, 6, 3, 10: The story and the fatal formula are often repeated in the epics and Purāṇas.

20. For details, see J. Gonda, *Vedic Literature*, chapter 8: "The Brāhmaṇas."

21. As, for instance, in the *Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad*. On *Āraṇyakas*: J. Gonda, *Vedic Literature*, chapter 9.

22. Text: W. C. Sastri Pannikar (ed.), *One Hundred and Eight Upaniṣads*. Most of these have been translated in the Adyar Library Series. English translation of the major early Upaniṣads with Sanskrit text and notes: S. Radhakrishnan, *The Principal Upaniṣads*.

23. Thus a *Ramakrishna Upaniṣad* has been published by the Ramakrishna Mission. Dhanjibhai Fakirbhai, an Indian Christian, composed a *Khristopaniṣad*.

24. For details consult L. Renou, *Vedic India*, 50 ff.

25. One of the most important Vaiṣṇava Saṃhitās is the *Ahirbhudhnyasaṃhitā*. No translation in any Western language exists so far. An important Śaivite Āgama is the *Ajitāgama*: No translation is available in any Western language. An important Śākta Tantra is the *Tripurārahasyam*, Swami Sanatanadevaji Maharaja, ed. [*Jñānakhanda* only]. English translation by A. U. Vasaveda.

26. F. O. Schrader, *Introduction to the Pāñcarātra and the Ahirbudhnya Saṃhitā*. For a useful, brief introduction, see Jean Filliozat, "Les Āgamas Çivaites," in N. R. Bhatt (ed.), *Rauravāgama*. Lately F. H. Daniel Smith has done extensive research in the literature (largely still in manuscript) of Vaiṣṇava Āgamas.

27. *Śrī Pāñcarātra Rakṣa of Śrī Vedānta Deśika*, Introduction, VI & IX.

28. "Purāṇas and Their Authority in Religious Matters," *Kalyāṇa Kalpatāru*, 5 ff.

29. For details consult L. Renou, *Vedic India*, 41 ff. Texts and translations are too numerous to be mentioned here; this type of literature has been extensively studied by nineteenth-century European Indologists. For a fairly representative selection of translated texts, see *Sacred Books of the East* (*SBE*), vols. 29 and 30. The most complete treatment is found in Jan Gonda, *The Ritual Sūtras*.

30. The unquestioned authority in this field was P. V. Kane: his seven-volume *History of Dharmaśāstra* offers an unrivaled wealth of details about works, their authors, and materials pertaining to *smṛti*. The major Western authorities in this field are Duncan M. Derrett, formerly Professor of Oriental Law at the School of African and Oriental Studies in London, and Ludo Rocher, Professor of Indian Studies at the University of Pennsylvania.

31. Text: J. Jolly, *Mānava Dharmaśāstra*, English translation: G. Bühler, *The Laws of Manu*, *SBE*, vol. 25. There are many editions with commentaries available now.

32. For a brief discussion of historical problems related to the *Manusmṛti* see Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 1, 79–85, as well as G. Bühler's introduction to his translation.

33. See Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 1, 60–70.

34. Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, 755.

35. A great authority on Purāṇas, R. C. Hazra, wrote numerous books and papers on Purāṇas and *Upapurāṇas*. Two contributions of his on Purāṇas and *Upapurāṇas* in *CHI*, vol. 2, 240–86. The latest comprehensive work on the subject is L. Rocher, *The Purāṇas*.

36. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 5, 973–80, with ample references to original sources.

37. See A. D. Pusalker, "Purānic Studies."

38. Its main texts are the *Nyāya-sūtras* by Gautama. More about it in chapter 24.

39. In H. G. Coward, ed., *Studies in Indian Thought: Collected Papers of Prof. T. R. V. Murti*, 357–76. See also "Revelation and Reason" in the same volume, 57–71.

40. Ibid., viii.

41. Ganganatha Jha, *Pūrva-Mīmāṃsā in Its Sources*, 146. A recent study of this issue is Othmar Gächter, *Hermeneutics and Language in Pūrvamīmāṃsā: A Study in Śābara Bhāṣya*.

42. Mādhava, *Sarvadarśanasaṁgraha*, XIII, 6. An excellent introduction to this school: H. G. Coward in *Sphoṭa Theory of Language*. See also H. G. Coward *Bhartṛhari*.

43. Mādhava, *Sarvadarśanasaṁgraha*, XIII, 13.

44. There are numerous editions, e.g., by Devaprakasa Patanjala Sastri. A complete English translation (with text and notes) was done by Srisa Chandra Vasu, 2 vols.

45. V. S. Agrawala, *India as Known to Pāṇini*, 3: "Pāṇini, unlike Sakatāyana did not carry to extremes the theory of treating all nouns as verbal derivatives, but also recognized the formation of fortuitous words in the languages for which no certain derivation could be vouchsafed."

46. A complete edition of Patañjali's *Mahābhāṣya* with Kayyata's and several other glosses is published in ten volumes by Haryana Sahitya Samsthan, Gurukul Jhajjar (Rohtak), 1961. Parts have been translated into various European languages. For details see: H. G. Coward and K. Kunjunni Raja (eds.), *The Philosophy of the Grammarians*, vol. 5 of *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies*.

47. K. A. Nilakanta Sastri, *The Culture and History of the Tamils* 10.

48. (*Deva)nāgarī* is the name of the characters in which Sanskrit is usually written, though in various parts of the country, other characters have been used as well.

49. J. Gonda, *Vedic Literature*, 57.

50. According to Jan Gonda (*Vedic Literature*, 61), Langlois and Wilson, early translators of the entire Ṛgveda, "suffered under the defect that they were based on the (not always correctly understood) commentary of Sāyaṇa." Ludwig's translation is called "stiff and abrupt," and Grassman's a "wholly inadequate Germanization." Griffith's translation is defective too—he apparently put too much reliance on Sāyaṇa. Geldner "missed the exact meaning of many words." Renou "had to leave his translation unfinished." Roth and Kaegi had vainly attempted an unambiguous uniform translation.

51. J. Gonda, *Vedic Literature*, 62.

52. R. N. Dandekar, *Some Aspects of the History of Hinduism*, 136.

53. Madhav M. Deshpande, "Changing Conceptions of the Veda: From Speech-Acts to Magical Sounds," 4.

54. Ibid., 8.

55. *RV* III.55.

56. *RV* X.71.5.

57. *RV* VIII.100.11.

58. S. Kak, *The Astronomical Code of the Ṛgveda*, 18.

59. Deshpande, "Changing Conceptions of the Veda," 38. The texts of the Veda are still the object of intense study by Hindu scholars: numerous publications on the Vedas appear every year in Indian vernaculars from research institutions such as the Jhajhar Gurukul in Rohtak or the Vaidik Samṣodan Samsthan in Pune. Also much of Western Indological scholarship is still focused on Vedic studies. An "International Foundation for Vedic Education" has been recently founded in the United States, which held an International Veda Conference attended by top researchers in the field.

An Atharva Veda Conference was held in 1993 in New York. The great temple at Tirupati established in 2006 the Śrī Venkateśvara Vedic University, devoted exclusively to Vedic studies, "to preserve, foster and promote oral traditions of Vedic and related literature, with focus on the right intonations, to bring out the depth of rational approach and the scientific temper present in the Vedas." *India Today Online*, August 12, 2006.

60. See the famous *Vāk-Sūkta* in *Ṛgveda* X, 125.

61. J. Woodroffe, *Introduction to Tantra Śāstra*.

62. II, 23, 3.

63. *Taittirīya Upaniṣad* I, 8.

64. *Māṇḍūkya Upaniṣad*.

65. *Skandapurāṇa*, Viṣṇukhaṇḍa XVI, 30 ff.

66. *Times of India*, 9 October 1963.

67. See also H. G. Coward and W. Goa, *Mantra*.

68. S. K. Belvalkar, *Shree Gopal Basu Malik Lectures on Vedānta Philosophy*. The individual *śākhas* try to expurgate the contradictions in their literatures. The existing *Brahmasūtra* is essentially a (Sāmavedi) *Chāndogyasūtra* with later revisions and additions.

4. *ITHĀSA-PURĀṆA*: THE HEART OF HINDUISM

1. For general orientation, see M. Winternitz, "The Popular Epics and the Purānas," *A History of Indian Literature*, vol. 1, part 2. Among modern Western studies of the *Mahābhārata* the following stand out: B. A. van Nooten, *The Mahābhārata* and A. Hiltebeitel, *Ritual of Battle: Krishna in the Mahābhārata*. Among older studies: E. W. Hopkins, *The Great Epic of India*, H. Oldenberg, *Das Mahābhārata*, and H. Jacobi, *Das Rāmāyaṇa*. The most recent survey of literature on epics and Purāṇas is offered by A. Hiltebeitel, "India's Epics," in A. Sharma (ed.), *The Study of Hinduism*, 114–38 and G. Bailey "The Purāṇas," Ibid., 139–68.

2. For details, consult P. J. Chinmulgund and V. V. Mirashi (eds.), *Review of Indological Research in the Last 75 Years*, 670 ff., as well as V. S. Sukhtankar, "Introduction," in *Critical Edition, Mahābhārata*, *Ādiparvan*, i–cx, and G. H. Bhatt, "Introduction," in *Rāmāyaṇa, Critical Edition*, Bālakāṇḍa, xiii–xxxv, i–xviii. See also S. M. Katre, *Introduction to Textual Criticism*, with an appendix by P. K. Gode.

3. Vishnu S. Sukthankar writes in his "Prolegomena to the Critical edition of the *Mahābhārata*," in vol. 1, (*Ādiparvan*): "Next to the Vedas [the *Mahābhārata*] is the most valuable product of the entire literature of ancient India, so rich in notable works. Venerable for its very antiquity, it is one of the most inspiring monuments of the world and an inexhaustible mine for the investigation of the religion, mythology, legend, philosophy, law, custom, and political and social institutions of ancient India" (iii).

4. N. Sen, "The Influence of the Epics on Indian Life and Literature." For details of the immense influence on drama, poetry, and the fine arts in India and in the whole of Southeast Asia, see the above article and B. R. Chatterjee, "The *Rāmāyaṇa* and the *Mahābhārata* in Southeast Asia."

5. H. Raychaudhuri, "The *Mahābhārata*: Some Aspects of Its Culture." See also J. L. Fitzgerald, "The Great Epic of India as Religious Rhetoric: A Fresh Look at the *Mahābhārata*."

6. The names connected with the former theory are Larssen, Sørenson, Winternitz, and Meyer; with the latter, especially J. Dahlmann. About the theories and their criticism, see A. D. Pusalker, "The *Mahābhārata*: Its History and Character." See also Fitzgerald, "The Great Epic of India."

7. *Mahābhārata, Critical Edition*. Several vulgate editions are available, e.g., one in four volumes from the Gītāpress, Gorakhpur.

8. I, 1, 50. See also M. Mehta, "The Problem of the Double Introduction to the *Mahābhārata*."

9. The Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute has published a critical edition in two volumes. A vulgate edition is available from several publishers, amongst others from Gītāpress Gorakhpur (no date) with Hindī translation. (The same publisher has also brought out a vulgate edition of the entire *Mahābhārata* in four volumes with a *Nāmānukramāṇikā*).

10. *Yad ihāsti tad anyatrā yad nehāsti na tat kva cit*.

11. *Mahābhāratāṭparyanirṇaya*. Ch2: Engl. transl. by A. D. Pusalkar, "The Mahābhārata: Its History and Character," 68.

12. V. S. Sukthankar, *On the Meaning of the Mahābhārata*, 128 ff.

13. A complete English translation of the *Mahābhārata* was published by Pratap Chandra Roy toward the end of the last century; reprinted in twelve volumes by Oriental Publishing Co., Calcutta in the late fifties. A new English translation, following the critical edition, was begun by A. van Buitenen (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1973–1978), continued by J. L. Fitzgerald: vol. 12, *The Book of Peace*, part I, appeared in 2004. C. Rajagopalachari has published a one-volume rendering of important stories of the *Mahābhārata*, which has become very popular.

14. Pāṇḍu had been suffering under a curse that prevented him from having children of his own. So he arranged for his wives to conceive sons from gods: Kuntī begot Yudhiṣṭhira from Yama, Bhīma from Vāyu, and Arjuna from Indra. Madrī had twin sons, Sahadeva and Nakula, from the Aśvins.

15. *Āraṇyakaparvan*, chapters 295–98, condensed.

16. The present introduction contains the story of Vālmīki, who according to legend started out as a brigand, was converted into a Rāmabhakta, and did penance for his sins in a forest by keeping seated in meditation even while ants began building up an anthill (Sanskrit: *vālmīka*) around his body.

17. *Jātaka*, 461; about *Rāmāyaṇa* criticism, see A. D. Pusalker, "The Rāmāyaṇa" and C. Bulcke, *Rāmakathā* [Hindī].

18. See G. H. Bhatt's introduction to *Mahābhārata, Critical Edition*.

19. In the *Hindustan Times* (29 July 1972), a note appeared saying that the original manuscript of the *Rāmacaritamānasa* had been found in the house of a Pathan landlord in Malihabad, Uttar Pradesh, near Lucknow. There are countless editions of this work in India. The Gītāpress brought out the full text with an English translation in 1968.

20. See A. D. Pusalker, *Studies in Epics and Purāṇas of India*, 174 ff.

21. The Oriental Institute Baroda has published the *Rāmāyaṇa, Critical Edition*, in seven volumes (1960–1975). Vulgate editions are numerous and easily available from e.g., the Gītāpress.

22. Pusalker, "The *Rāmāyaṇa*," in *CHI*, 27 ff.

23. R. T. H. Griffith has brought out a metrical English translation of the *Rāmāyaṇa*. A prose translation, together with the Sanskrit text, appeared from Gītāpress Gorakhpur, *Kalyāṇa Kalpatāru*, 1960–1974. C. Rajagopalachari has summarized the stories of the *Rāmāyaṇa* in one volume, which also has become very popular. A new English prose translation, based on the critical edition, under the general editorship of R. Goldman, was published by Princeton University Press, 1984–1997. The introduction to the first volume (*Bālakāṇḍa*) by R. Goldman (3–59) deals both with the history of the *Rāmāyaṇa* text and the literature connected with it.

24. *Bālakāṇḍa*, chapter 67.

25. Laṅkā is often identified with Śrī Laṅkā; scholars are in disagreement, however, about its identity: many are inclined to look for it not far from eastern central India, where the rest of the Rāma story takes place.

26. *Uttarakāṇḍa*, 111, 21 ff.

27. See A. P. Karmarkar, "Religion and Philosophy of the Epics."

28. According to Swāmi Dāyānanda Sarasvatī, the founder of the *Ārya Samāj*.

29. Ludo Rocher, as part of the multivolume *History of Indian Literature*, edited by Jan Gonda, published a monograph on the Purāṇas that goes into the history of Purāṇa studies, the question of the number of Purāṇas, the controversies surrounding the division between *Mahāpurāṇas* and *Upapurāṇas*, the debate about the "*Ur-purāṇa*," and eventually lists all Purāṇas, giving short summaries of contents, indicating text editions, translations, and studies. See also G. Bailey, "The Purāṇas," in A. Sharma (ed.) *The Study of Hinduism*, 139–68.

30. R. C. Hazra, "The Purāṇas."

31. *Atharva Veda* XI, 7, 24. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad* IV, 5, 11.

32. R. C. Hazra, op. cit.

33. Sixth century CE.

34. See F. E. Pargiter, *Ancient Indian Historial Tradition*.

35. See the preface in Ibid. Criticized by P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 5, part 2, 850 ff.

36. M. A. Mehendale, "Purāṇas," in *HCIP*, vol. 3, 296.

37. Thus the *Devībhāgavata Purāṇa* of the Śāktas claims to be the real *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* and is accepted as such by the Śāktas. See C. Mackenzie Brown, "The Origin and Transmission of the Two *Bhāgavata Purāṇas*: A Canonical and Theological Dilemma."

38. So does the *Bhaviṣya Purāṇa*, which claims to be an ancient prophetical book about the future (*bhaviṣyam*).

39. All *Mahāpurāṇas* have been printed, most of them by several publishers; Motilal Banarsidasś series, *Ancient Indian Tradition and Mythology* aims at providing a

complete translation of all the *Mahāpurāṇas*. Older translations are available of the *Mārkaṇḍeya*, the *Bhāgavata*, *Matṣya*, the *Viṣṇu*, the *Agni*, and the *Garuḍa Purāṇas*. For the *Upapuraṇas* consult R. C. Hazra, *Studies in the Upapurāṇas*, two volumes, and L. Rocher, *The Purāṇas*.

40. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* VI, 8, 40 ff.

41. *Skanda Purāṇa*, Viṣṇukhaṇḍa Margaśirṣamāhātmya XVI, 30 ff.

42. *Newsweek* (21 September 1987): 74 ff. reviewed a performance of Peter Brook's *The Mahābhārata*, a nine-hour long recreation of the Indian epic. He and his coworkers had been preparing this modern dramatization for twelve years. *India Today* (15 February 1987): 84, reported: "Britain's most influential body—the Inner London Education Authority—is to stage a 100,000 Pound spectacular based on the *Rāmāyaṇa* to be performed by school children in London's Battersea Park in June this year." *India Today* (30 April 1987), under the title "Ramayan: Divine Sensation," reported the unexpected success of a current TV dramatization of the *Rāmāyaṇa* in India. The TV version of the *Rāmāyaṇa*, circulating also in the Hindu diaspora, had the consequence that a great many Hindus living in the West were requesting a Hindī-cum-English version of the *Rāmacaritamānasa*. Motilal Banarsidass brought out a sumptuous edition, which found wide acceptance abroad. *SEMINAR* devoted its January 1989 (353) issue to analyzing "The Rāmāyaṇa Syndrome."

43. The "International Rāmāyaṇa Institute" organized in June 2005 a two-day International Rāmāyaṇa Conference at Northern Illinois University.

5. THE *BHAGAVADGĪTĀ*

1. E. J. Sharpe, *The Universal Gītā: Western Images of the Bhagavadgītā, A Bicentenary Survey*. R. Minor (ed.), *Modern Indian Interpretation of the Bhagavadgītā*. Arvind Sharma, author of *The Hindu Gītā: Ancient and Classical Interpretations of the Bhagavadgītā* is also the founder/editor of the *Journal of Bhagavadgītā Studies*. Much information on recent literature is also found in the bibliographical essay by M. Eder, "The Bhagavadgītā and Classical Hinduism: A Sketch," in A. Sharma (ed.), *The Study of Hinduism*, 169–99.

2. The *Mahābhārata* contains also an *Anugītā* and many of the Purāṇas have Gītās, summarizing in a popular form their main ideas.

3. A Kashmirian text of the Gītā with quite considerable variants was discovered about sixty years ago. *The Mahābhārata, Critical Edition*, vol. 7, *Bhīṣmaparvan*, 114–18, with the critical notes (769–786) contains a wealth of information about the text and the commentaries as well as major studies on the *Bhagavadgītā*.

4. Bombay: Bhāratīya Vidyā Bhavan, 1965.

5. Ibid., 83 ff.

6. *Die Bhagavadgītā*, 32.

7. N. C. Chaudhuri, *Hinduism*, however, accepts the Gītā's dependence on Christian ideas.

8. S. Buddhiraja, *The Bhagavadgītā: A Study*.

9. English translation, in two volumes.

10. Mahadev Desai, *The Gītā According to Gandhi.*

11. Sri Aurobindo, *Essays on the Gītā.*

12. S. Radhakrishnan, *The Bhagavadgītā.*

13. S. K. Belvalkar, "Vedānta in the *Bhagavadgītā*," *Lectures on Vedānta Philosophy.*

14. Ibid., 118 ff., slightly revised.

15. Quoted in M. Winternitz, *A History of Indian Literature*, vol. 1, part 2, 375.

16. W. M. Callewaert and S. Hemraj, *Bhagavadgītānuvāda: A Study in Transcultural Translation.*

17. The term is *adhikāra*, qualification or prerequisite.

18. Despite the often-advocated spirit of tolerance in the Gītā the teaching is solidly Kṛṣṇaitic and would not admit that practicing any other religion would yield the same results.

19. *Bhagavadgītā* (*BG*) IX, 4–8.

20. Ibid., 16–19.

21. Ibid., 26–34, condensed.

22. The titles given at the end of the chapters are not found in many manuscripts and, in those in which they are found, they are not uniform; the critical edition leaves them out.

23. *BG* XI, 3.

24. *BG* XVIII, 51–55.

25. *BG* XVIII, 64–66; the term is *pāpa*, the Vedic technical word for "sin," not evil in the general sense as Rādhākrishnan translates.

26. Thomas McCarthy in the introduction (xxv) to his translation of Jürgen Habermas, *The Theory of Communicative Action*, vol. l., *Reason and the Rationalization of Society* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1984), 4: "Sociology became the science of crisis par excellence; it concerned itself above all with the anomic aspects of the dissolution of traditional social systems and the development of modern ones."

27. See the lengthy article by James A. Hijiya, professor of history at the University of Massachusetts Dartmouth, "The Gita of J. Robert Oppenheimer."

28. Heinar Kipphardt, *In the Matter of Robert J. Oppenheimer*, 74–5. [My own translation from the German original].

29. Published in Indian and Foreign Review, 1 March 1981, 27.

6. THE WORLD OF THE HINDU

1. A. A. Macdonell's *Vedic Mythology* originally published in 1897 in the *Encyclopedia of Indo-Aryan Research*, G. Bühler (ed.), vol. 3, part 1a, (reprinted 1963) is still the standard work. See also R. N. Dandekar, "Vṛtrahā Indra." On creation myths in general, see D. Maclagan, *Creation Myths: Man's Introduction to the World.* See also F. B. J. Kuiper, *Ancient Indian Cosmogony.*

2. *Ṛgveda* I, 185.

3. S. Kramrisch, "The Triple Structure of Creation in the *Ṛgveda*," 141.

4. *Ṛgveda* X, 82.

5. Ibid., verses 2, 3, 7.

6. *Ṛgveda* X, 90.

7. Ibid., verse 16.

8. *Ṛgveda* X, 129.

9. Kramrisch, "The Triple Structure," 147.

10. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad* I, 1, 4.

11. *Kaṭha Upaniṣad* 3, 10 ff.; *Ṛgveda* X, 121, 1; *Manusmṛti* I, 9.

12. *Manas* cannot be exactly translated; the nearest Western concept is the medieval *sensus communis*, the coordinating faculty of the senses, not intellect itself.

13. *Ahaṁkāra* is sometimes translated "egoism" (G. Bühler, in M. Eliade, *From Primitives to Zen*, 112), which gives a wrong idea.

14. *Manusmṛti* I, 1 ff.

15. Ibid., I, 64 ff.

16. Ibid., 65–74.

17. Ibid., 81–86.

18. S. M. Ali, *The Geography of the Purāṇas*, offers not only exhaustive references to the sources, but also many serious suggestions concerning the identity of ancient names with contemporary geography. See also maps on "Purāṇic India."

19. Ali, *The Geography of the Purāṇas*, 32 and Figure 62.

20. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* II, 4, and many parallels in other Purāṇas.

21. One *yojana* is approximately nine miles.

22. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* II, 2, and parallels.

23. Ibid. 3, and parallels.

24. Ibid. 3, 24–26.

25. The account is taken from a Vaiṣṇava scripture.

26. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* II, 4, 87.

27. Ibid., verse 98.

28. Ibid., 5–8.

29. Ibid., 5, 5.

30. Ibid., verses 13 ff.

31. Ibid., 7, 11.

32. Ibid., verses 15 ff.

33. Ibid. II, 7, 22 ff.

34. See the discussion of this date in P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 5, part 1, 648 ff.

35. A. D. Pusalker, "Historical Traditions," *HCIP*, vol. 1, 271–333.

36. According to Purāṇic accounts the Creator produced before the present creation several kinds of creatures, who, because they were produced from Brahmā's mind

in meditation, did not multiply themselves. He created "mind-born sons, like Himself," the nine Brahmārṣis, celebrated in Indian mythology, all absorbed in meditation and without desire of progeny. Brahmā's anger produced Rudra, half male and half female, who began multiplying into various beings. Finally he created Manu Svayambhuva "born of, and identical with his original self," and the female part of himself he constituted as *Śatarūpā* (*Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 7).

37. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 13, and parallels.

38. *Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa* I, 8, 1, 1–6 seems to be the oldest account. Also: *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* VIII, 24 ff.

39. To forestall a popular confusion: *Kali-yuga* comes from *kali*, "strife, fight," and has nothing to do with *Kālī*, "The Black One," the name of Devī, the Goddess in her terrible form.

40. Cf. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* IV, 21 ff., and parallels.

41. Ibid., 20.

42. Ibid., 24, 128 ff.

43. Ibid., verses 121 ff.

44. The representatives of the Ārya Samāj have been most prominent in this regard.

45. Address given on December 10, 1965.

46. For details of this notion, see P. Hacker, *Vivārta: Studien zur Geschichte der illusionistischen Kosmologie und Erkenntnistheorie der Inder*.

47. B. A. Armadio, "The World Made of Sound: Whitehead and Pythagorean Harmonics in the Context of Veda and the Science of Mantra."

7. THE MANY GODS AND THE ONE GOD OF HINDUISM

1. See entry *God* in Sir M. Monier-Williams, *Dictionary, English and Sanskrit*.

2. E.g., A. A. Macdonell, *Vedic Mythology*.

3. K. Bhattacharya, *Studies in Philosophy*, vol. 1, 35, connects the *devatās* with Plato's *ideas* and the concept of *universalia ante rem*. Through *upāsana* (worship) one ascends from the concrete individual things to their *adhyātma* (spiritual) and *adibhūta* (primeval) aspect, their absoluteness. *Devatā* would correspond to the *noumenon* of Kant.

4. R. N. Dandekar, "God in Hindu Thought," lecture held at Bharatiya Vidya Bhavan, 13 January 1968.

5. See A. Esteller, "The Quest for the Original *Ṛgveda*."

6. R. N. Dandekar, "Vṛtrahā Indra." The etymology of Indra is not clear as yet. A. A. Macdonell derives it from *indu*, "drop" (*A History of Sanskrit Literature*, 44); J. Gonda from *intoi*, "pushing" (*Die Religionen Indiens*, vol. 1, 60); R. N. Dandekar from *indu*, bringing it in connection with "virile power" ("Vṛtraha Indra"); S. S. Sastri connects it with *in*, *inva*, "to rule," and *ina*, "sun," "lord" ("Vṛṣakapi," 159). A very thorough and insightful study of Indra is provided by Hertha Krick, "Der Vaniṣṭusava und Indras Offenbarung."

7. R. N. Dandekar, "Vṛtrahā Indra."

8. It is important to note that the Vedic *devas* are in constant conflict with the *asuras*, the demons, and that their high position is due precisely to their power to subjugate the hostile forces. In this context see H. von Stietencron's essay, "Dämonen und Gegengötter: Überlegungen zur Typologie von Antagonismen."

9. The exact number is 1,028 (divided into ten *maṇḍalas*), from which eleven Vālakhilya hymns are usually subtracted, because neither the great Sāyaṇa (fourteenth century) had commented upon them nor were they mentioned in the list, considered authoritative, ascribed to Śaunaka.

10. *Ṛgveda* I, 164, 46.

11. *Ṛgveda* II, 12. Translation (modified): R. H. T. Griffith, *Hymns of the Ṛgveda.*

12. There are still remnants of Indra worship in some parts of India. See, e.g., G. C. Tripathi, "Das Indradhvaja Fest in Orissa: Die Überreste der Indra-Verehrung in Ostindien."

13. *Ṛgveda* I, 1.

14. *Ṛgveda* I, 35.

15. E.g., *Ṛgveda* VII, 86.

16. Vol. 1: *Varuṇa und die Wasser*; vol. 2: *Varuṇa und das Ṛta.*

17. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad* III, IX, 1, 9.

18. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 2, 66 ff. "The only God, *Janardana* takes the designation Brahmā, Viṣṇu, and Śiva accordingly as he creates, preserves, or destroys. Viṣṇu as creator creates himself, as preserver preserves himself, as destroyer, destroys himself at the end of all things."

19. E.g., the celebrated Maheśa (Śiva) *mūrti* in the main cave of Gharapurī (Elephanta). See S. Kramrisch, "The Image of Mahādeva in the Cave Temple on Elephanta Island."

20. According to this legend Viṣṇu and Brahmā had been disputing about their supremacy when a huge fiery column appeared before them. To find out about its nature Viṣṇu in the form of a boar dived down to find its lower end, and Brahmā in the form of a swan flew up to discover its upper extremity. After some time they met again. While Viṣṇu admitted that he had not found an end to it, Brahmā asserted that he had found the upper end and was hence greater than Viṣṇu and therefore the universal Lord. Just then the sides of the column opened and out stepped Śiva, the infinite, praising Viṣṇu for his truthfulness and establishing him second to Himself, severely chiding Brahmā for his lie and condemning him to remain without worship henceforth.

21. *Ṛgveda* III, 62, 10.

22. *Kūrma Purāṇa*, 20.

23. R. C. Hazra, *Studies in the Upapurāṇas*, vol. 1, 29 ff. H. von Stietencron has assembled much interesting information on sun worship in India and its possible connection with Iran in his monograph on Sūrya, *Indische Sonnenpriester: Sāmba und die Śākasdiśpīya Brāhmaṇa.*

24. The myth is told in both the epics and in most Purāṇas. The oldest version is probably in: *Vāyu Purāṇa* I, 30.

25. Cf. V. Paranjoti, *Śaiva Siddhānta*, 54 ff.

26. Cf. Ananda Coomaraswamy, *The Dance of Śiva*, 83.

27. *Śiva Purāṇa Śatarudrasaṃhitā*, 3.

28. Ibid., *Umāsaṃhitā*.

29. Ibid., *Rudrasaṃhitā Sātikhaṇḍa*, 38, 34.

30. A whole *Liṅga Purāṇa* is devoted to this.

31. A collection of hymns with English translation: F. Kingsbury and G. E. Philips, trans., *Hymns of the Tamil Śaivite Saints*.

32. *Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa* I, 1, 2, 13; I, 9, 3, 9; III, 6, 3, 3.

33. S. K. Chatterji, "Race Movements and Prehistoric Culture," 165.

34. Cf. A. D. Pusalker, "Historicity of Kṛṣṇa."

35. The *Viṣnusahasranāma* is found in the *Mahābhārata* and in all Vaiṣṇava Purāṇas and has been printed separately many times. It has also been commented upon by several authorities.

36. Cf. N. Macnicol, *Psalms of the Maratha Saints*. There are countless collections of such hymns in Indian vernaculars, most of them as yet not translated.

37. E. Neuman, *An Analysis of the Archetype The Great Mother*, 120 ff.

38. R. C. Hazra, *Studies in the Upapurāṇas*, vol. 2, 16.

39. H. Whitehead, *The Village Gods of South India*, 11.

40. *Mahābhārata, Sauptikaparvan*, 8, 64 ff., describes a vision of "Death-Night in her embodied form" just before the Great War begins!

41. A. P. Karmarkar, *The Religions of India*, 99.

42. H. von Stietencron, *Gaṅgā und Yamunā*.

43. Examples: in A. Daniélou, *Hindu Polytheism*, 350 ff.

44. Ibid., 291 ff.

45. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 8 ff.; *Śiva Purāṇa: Rudrasaṃhitā* III, etc.

46. See J. Gonda, "The Historical Background of the Name 'Satya' Assigned to the Highest Being."

47. On this whole issue, see K. Klostermaier, *Mythologies and Philosophies of Salvation in the* Theistic Traditions of India.

8. THE PATH OF WORKS: *KARMAMĀRGA*

1. A brief analysis is given by L. A. Ravi Varma, "Rituals of Worship."

2. This is done with reference to *Manusmṛti* VI, 35 ff.

3. *Ṛgveda* X, 90.

4. A. A. Macdonell, "Vedic Religion."

5. About the technical aspects of the *yajña*, see P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 2, part 2, 983 ff.

6. *Taittirīya Saṃhitā* I, 8, 4, 1.

7. See the informative article by N. Wyatt "*Aśvamedha* and *Puruṣamedha* in Ancient India."

8. See F. M. Smith, "Financing the Vedic Ritual: The *Mūlādhyayāpariśiṣṭa of Kātyāyana*."

9. In the same report we read: "In the West, people talk of peace; they hold an atom bomb in one hand and a peace dove in the other. Thus peace was destroyed. But in the East the guiding principle is *pañca śila*, which has its deep roots in the moral and spiritual tradition of the East. This is the true way to peace."

10. *Blitz* (11 April 1970) reported that the Brahmin who was hired to perform the sacrifice died through electrocution while performing the *yajña*.

11. F. Staal, *Agni: The Vedic Ritual of the Fire Altar.*

12. F. Staal has dealt with Vedic ritual by itself and in a comparative fashion in many other important publications, e.g., *The Science of Ritual*; "The Meaninglessness of Ritual," "The Sound of Religion." See also his "Exchange with a Reviewer of *Agni*."

13. *Chāndogya Upaniṣad* V, 3–10 contains the *pañcāgni vidyā*.

14. See G. M. Carstairs, *The Twice-Born*, which describes in meticulous detail the rituals performed by a Brahmin family in Poona.

15. From *Śaiva Upaniṣads*, T. R. Srinivasa Ayyangar and G. Srinivasa Murti (trans.), 165 ff.

16. Ibid., 203 ff.

17. Quite typically, even former leader of the Communist Party in Kerala N. Nambudiripad belonged to the Brahmin caste. In Tamiḷnāḍu the Draviḍa Munnetra Kazhagam (DMK) staged a kind of anti-Brahmin revolt.

18. *Manu* II, 176 prescribes already daily *tarpaṇa*.

19. *Caṇḍālas* were the offspring of a Brahmin father and a *śūdra* mother and were considered the lowest in the social hierarchy.

20. In the *Kaṭha Upaniṣad* Yama, the god of death himself, apologizes to Naciketas, a Brahmin youth who has come to him for not having served him.

21. *Taittirīya Upaniṣad* II, 2, 1.

22. *Chāndogya Upaniṣad* VII, 26, 2.

23. Details may be found under the heading *bhojana*, in Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 2, part 2, 757–800.

24. Vedic ritual has been a major preoccupation of Western Indology for more than a hundred years. Part of the fascination that this type of study held for Western scholars may have to do with the age of the texts concerned—the quest for origins was a widely shared concern of nineteenth-century scholarship—as well as with the formalism of the texts themselves: rituals are designed to bring order into the cosmos, and ritual literature is characterized by the meticulousness with which it regulates every movement and every sound. In that respect it resembles scholarship: it leaves nothing unexplained, leaves nothing to chance, or to the layman's inexpert handling of things.

Modern scholarship dealing with Vedic sacrifice ranges from early comprehensive reconstructions from texts like J. Schwab's *Das indische Tieropfer* and Sylvain

Lévi's still often referred to *La doctrine du sacrifice dans le Brahmanas*, to specialized studies like those of F. Staal (see note 12), J. Gonda's *Vedic Ritual: The Non-solemn Rites*, J. C. Heesterman's *The Inner Conflict of Tradition: Essays in Indian Ritual, Kingship and Society*. In addition to these the following works are of interest: W. Caland and V. Henry, *L'Agnistoma: Description compléte de la forme normals du sacrifice de Soma dans le culte védique*, 2 vols.; C. G. Diehl, *Instrument and Purpose: Studies on Rites and Rituals in South India*; L. Dumont, *Homo hierarchicus: Essai sur le systéme des castes*; L. Renou, *The Destiny of the Veda in India*; M. Strickmann, ed., *Classical Asian Rituals and the Theory of Ritual*; and R. Kloppenborg, ed., *Selected Studies on Ritual in the Indian Religions: Essays to D. J. Hoens*. How detailed this kind of study can become is shown in the most recent work of the doyen of European Indology, J. Gonda, *The Ritual Functions and Significance of Grasses in the Religion of the Veda*, with thousands of textual references.

25. Interesting economic details are supplied by D. D. Kosambi, *An Introduction to the Study of Indian History*, 94 ff.

26. A. Weber, "Über das Menschenopfer bei den Indern der vedischen Zeit," collected all Vedic evidence concerning human sacrifice. See *Aitareya Brāhmaṇa* VII, 13–18; II, 8; VI, 8; *Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa* I, 2, 3, 6; VI, 2, 2, 18, and so forth.

27. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* IX, 7, 20 describes a human sacrifice according to a Vedic ritual.

28. See P. E. Dumont, *L'Aśvamedha*.

29. The last seems to have been performed in the eighteenth century, as described in P. K. Gode's interesting article "The Aśvamedha Performed by Sevai Jayasingh of Amber 1699–1744 AD."

30. *Aitareya Brāhmaṇa* II, 18. According to the same text, the *medha* went from the goat into the earth and from the earth into rice. "All those animals from which the *medha* had gone [e.g., camel, ass, mule] are unfit to be sacrificed." See also *Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa* I, 2, 3, 6.

31. R. Gordon Wasson, "The Soma of the *Rig Veda*: What Was It?"

32. *Ṛgveda* VIII, 48, 3.

33. *Bhagavadgītā* IX, 26ff.

34. The ritual is minutely described in the *kriyā-pāda* of the Āgamas, Saṃhitās, and Tantras, the most elaborate of the four traditional parts of each of those scriptures.

35. The ritual of the famous Viṣṇu temple at Śrīraṅgam, as detailed in the *Parameśvara Saṃhitā*, is said to have been revealed to Yamunācārya by Lord Viṣṇu himself. Similarly the ritual of South Indian Śaivite temples, as outlined in the *Somaśaṃbhupaddhatī*, is associated with a Śiva revelation to its author.

36. A good example is R. V. Joshi, *Le rituel de la dévotion Kṛṣṇaite*.

37. The most famous is that of Ajamila, as reported in the *Bhāgavata Purāṇa*.

38. See M. Strickman, *Classical Asian Rituals*. See also A. J. Blasi, "Ritual as a Form of the Religious Mentality."

39. See note 9; also J. F. Staal, "Language and Ritual."

9. PURITY AND MERIT: THE TWIN CONCERNS OF *KARMAMĀRGA*

1. W. Cenkner, *A Tradition of Teachers: Śaṅkara and the Jagadgurus Today*, 150.

2. The importance of such activities in contemporary India cannot only be gauged from the increasing crowds at such events like the Kumbhamelā, with an attendance of up to thirty million pilgrims at the last in Ujjain, but also by the attention given it even in Western TV programs and news magazines.

3. P. V. Kane's aforementioned *History of Dharmaśāstra* is an inexhaustible source of information on all aspects of dharma.

4. A good account of it is given in S. K. Maitra, *The Ethics of the Hindus*, 81 ff.

5. Ibid., 83: "Thus for the Nyāya-Vaiśeṣikas righteousness is a quality of the *Ātman* or Self, i.e., is a subjective category to be distinguished from the objective act (*karma*) as well as from any impersonal transcendental category (*apūrva*) which may be generated by it. Nor is it any objective quality of an act which has any such super-sensuous category in its aid or support (*apūrvaprakṛtikarmaguṇa*)."

6. Ibid., 117 ff.

7. Ibid., 119.

8. S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 5, 134.

9. *Bhagavadgītā* III, 47. *Niṣkāma Karma*, special volume of *Kalyāṇa* 54 (1980), contains over one hundred articles (in Hindī) on this topic.

10. *Bhagavadgītā* XVI, 21.

11. Jayanta uses the triad *moha* (delusion), *rāga* (attraction), and *dveṣa* (aversion), which materially is exactly the same; he utilizes *lobha* and *krodha* as derivations of *rāga* and *dveṣa*.

12. This is a typical Vaiṣṇava injunction.

13. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* III, 12.

14. *Caraka Saṃhitā*, 45–51, *Sūtrasthānam* 8.

15. *Tirukkuṛaḷ*, nos. 72, 101, 156, 160, 203.

16. For detail, see Sadhucarana Prasad, *Dharmaśāstrasaṅgraha*. *Prāyaścittas* form chapter 21, the longest of all.

17. The *Manusmṛti*, as well as other *dharmaśāstras*, are quite up to date as regards protection of the environment: they punish by loss of caste the injuring of living plants, cutting down green trees for firewood, mining and all mechanical engineering that does damage to the environment, etc. See *Manusmṛti* XI, 64 ff.

18. Ibid., 53. In XII, 54 ff. (perhaps a later addition) Manu points out the various animal rebirths persons have to go through in consequence of their sins: "Those who committed *mahāpātakas*, having passed during large numbers of years through dreadful hells, obtain after that the following births: the slayer of a Brahmin enters the womb of a dog, a pig, an ass, a camel, a cow, a goat, a sheep, a deer, a bird, a Caṇḍāla, a Pukkasa; a Brahmin who drinks *sūra* shall enter the bodies of small and large insects, of moths, of birds feeding on ordure . . . the violator of the guru's bed enters a hundred times grasses, shrubs, and creepers."

19. See *Devībhāgavata Purāṇa* VIII, 22 ff.

20. *Manusmṛti* XI, 45 ff.

21. Ibid., 73–87. Note, however, that this applies only to a Brahmin; a man from a lower caste who kills a Brahmin has no such means available.

22. Ibid., 228–31.

23. Ibid., 31–33.

24. Thus in Viśvanātha Cakravarttin, *Bhaktirasāmṛtasindhubindu*. For Śaivite rules regarding violation of worship cf. *Somaśaṃbhupaddhatī*, vol. I, 102 ff. For the means of expiation, see *Śaiva-upaniṣads*, nos. 142 and 149, where *bhasma* (sacred ashes) is praised as the great remover of sins: "This *bhasma* alone is possessed of the special virtue of bestowing the knowledge of Hari and Śaṅkara, of destroying the most heinous sins resulting from the murder of a *brahmana* and the like and of bestowing great power and glory."

10. *SAṂSKĀRAS*: THE HINDU SACRAMENTS

1. On *saṃskāras* in general the most exhaustive source is P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 2, part 1. See also R. B. Pandey, *Hindu Saṃskāras*: Socio-religious Study of the Hindu Sacraments.

2. *Manusmṛti* II, 26.

3. *Dvi-jāti*, twice-born, is the designation of the upper three castes, *Brahmins*, *Kṣatriyas*, and *Vaiśyas*, whose initiation is considered to be a second, spiritual birth.

4. *Manusmṛti* II, 27ff.

5. The child gets a "secret name" immediately after birth that is known only to the parents. *Manusmṛti* II, 30, says that the official name giving should take place "on the tenth or twelfth on a lucky *tithi*, in an auspicious *muhūrta* under an auspicious constellation."

6. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* III, 10.

7. *Manusmṛti* II, 33.

8. Hindus calculate their years of life from the day of conception, not from the day of birth. A good study of the implication of *upanayana* is provided by B. K. Smith, "Ritual, Knowledge and Being: Initiation and Veda Study in Ancient India."

9. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* III, 10, says: "If he does not propose to enter into the married state, he may remain as a student with his teacher, first making a vow to that effect, and employ himself in the service of his guru and the guru's descendants; or he may become at once a hermit or adopt the order of the religious mendicant according to his original determination."

10. *Manusmṛti* III, 20–42, mentions *brahmā*, *daiva*, *ārṣa*, *prājānatya*, *āsura*, *gāndharva*, *rākṣasa*, and *paiśāca* forms of marriage. He explains them and says that some of these are "ignoble," though valid, as, e.g., forcible abduction of the bride (*rākṣasa*), seduction (*paiśāca*), love marriage (*gāndharva*), or bride buying (*āsura*).

11. J. D. M. Derret, *The Death of a Marriage Law: Epitaph for the Rishis*. Derret has written extensively on Hindu law and taught for many years Oriental law at the

London School of Oriental and African Studies. Among his well-known publications are *Hindu Law, Past and Present*; *Introduction to Modern Hindu Law*; *Critique of Modern Hindu Law*; *History of Indian Law* (*Dharmaśāstra*); *Essays in Classical and Modern Hindu Law*, 4 vols.

12. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* III, 10; *Garuḍa Purāṇa* 62 ff.

13. The most complete source for all details and variations of ritual is again Kane's *HDhS*, vol. 2, part 1.

14. *Ṛgveda* X, 85, 36.

15. Manu has, however, also a verse that would weaken this argument, when he says: "Many thousands of *brahmanas* who were chaste from their youth have gone to heaven without continuing their race" (V, 159).

16. Manusmṛti III, 56.

17. Ibid. 58 ff.

18. Ibid. VIII, 68.

19. Ibid. V, 154.

20. Ibid., 150.

21. *Ṛgveda* X, 14–18.

22. E.g., *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* III, 13.

23. The *Pretakalpa* of the *Garuḍapurāṇa* contains a wealth of information on beliefs concerning the afterlife.

11. THE PATH OF KNOWLEDGE: *JÑĀNAMĀRGA*

1. *Muktika Upaniṣad* I, 30, 39, gives the list of the acknowledged 108 Upaniṣads and their classification with regard to the four Vedas.

2. The Samskṛti Samsthān Bareli (Uttar Pradesh) brought out in 1967 a complete edition of the 108 Upaniṣads (with Hindī paraphrase) divided into three volumes entitled *Jñāna Khaṇḍa*, *Sādhana Khaṇḍa*, and *Brahma Vidyā Khaṇḍa*.

3. A survey of work done in the early twentieth century in this area is given in P. J. Chinmulgund and V. V. Mirashi, eds., *Review of Indological Research in the Last 75 Years*, 40 ff. See also the bibliography to the chapter "Vedic Hinduism" by S. W. Jamison and M. Witzel in A. Sharma (ed.), *The Study of Hinduism*, 65–113.

4. This is the chronology given by R. D. Ranade in his excellent and comprehensive study, *A Constructive Survey of Upaniṣadic Philosophy: Being an Introduction to the Thought of the Upaniṣads*.

5. Cf. R. D. Ranade, *A Constructive Survey*, 30–40.

6. *Muṇḍaka* II, 1, 1 ff.

7. *Chāndogya* III, 19.

8. *Praśna* IV, 1.

9. *Chāndogya* III, 14.

10. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* II.

11. *Chāndogya* VII, 17 ff.

12. Ellison Banks Findly, "Gārgī at the King's Court: Women and Philosophic Innovation in Ancient India."

13. E.g., *Śvetāśvatara* IX.

14. E.g., the *Māṇḍukya*, which reduces everything to OM.

15. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* IV, 5, 15.

16. E.g., *Chāndogya* VIII, 9 ff.

17. *Taittirīya* I, 7.

18. Thus Meister Eckhart in one of his sermons: "Why does my eye recognize the sky, and why do not my feet recognize it? Because my eye is more akin to heaven than my feet. Therefore my soul must be divine if it is to recognize God!" It is the Platonic and the later Stoic philosophy with its idea of cosmic harmony and correspondences between humans and the universe that has kept those ideas alive in the West.

19. *Chāndogya* II.

20. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* I, 2.

21. Ibid. III, 7.

22. *Māṇḍukya* I, 3 ff.

23. *Muṇḍaka* I, 1, 4 ff.

24. Neoplatonism, possibly under Indian influence, is the one Western intellectual tradition that comes closest to Vedānta. Plotinus, Proclus, Jamblichus, and others, too, speak of stages of ascent of the soul, of the need to turn inward and to dissociate consciousness from the senses.

25. *Īśa* 9.

26. End of *Chāndogya*.

12. *ĀTMAN* AND *BRAHMAN*: SELF AND ALL

1. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* III, 8.
2. Ibid., 9, 1, 9.
3. *Taittirīya* II, 1 ff.
4. *Chāndogya* VI, 8 ff.
5. Ibid. VIII, 7.
6. *Muṇḍaka* II, 2, 10 ff.
7. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* I, 4.
8. *Chāndogya* VI, 8, 7.
9. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* II, 5, 19.
10. *Aitareya* III, 1, 3.
11. *Kaṭha* I, 2, 23.

13. *KARMA, VIDYĀ, MOKṢA*: LIBERATION FROM REBIRTH

1. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* IV, 4, 1–7.

2. *Ibid.* I, 2, 7; III, 2, 10, ff. It should be emphasized that the frightening factor is not so much rebirth but the repeated painful experience of death!

3. *Kaṭha.* I, 2, 23.

4. *Muṇḍaka* III, 1, 10.

5. *Kaṭha* I, 5 ff.

6. This is a reference to the *pañcāgni vidyā*, treated immediately before this passage.

7. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* VI, 2, 15; cf. also *Chāndogya* V, 10, 5.

8. A comprehensive coverage of the understanding of karma in various schools is given in W. D. O'Flaherty (ed.), *Karma and Rebirth in Classical Indian Traditions* and in R. Neufeldt (ed.), *Karma and Rebirth: Post-classical Developments*, See also the chapter "Karma," by H. W. Tull in *The Hindu World*, 309–31.

9. There are other expressions in Sanskrit for *fate*, such as *daiva*, *bhagya*, *niyati* etc.

10. *Muṇḍaka* I, 2, 7 ff.

11. *Chāndogya* IV, 11, 3.

12. *Muṇḍaka* II, 2, 9.

13. One of the varieties of the Śiva *naṭarāja* image, in which Śiva is shown with his right leg thrown high up, is interpreted as showing how Śiva accepts into himself all the karma of his devotees so as to offer them instant liberation.

14. The term *mukti* occurs only once in the principal Upaniṣads, namely in *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* III, 1, 3. The term *mokṣa* is used several times in *Maitrī* VI, 30.

15. S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 1, 48.

16. *Muṇḍaka* III, 2, 6.

17. *Praśna* IV, 11.

18. *Muṇḍaka* III, 3, 8 ff.

19. *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* III, 8.

20. *Kaṭha* II, 3, 8 ff.

21. *Taittirīya* II, 9.

22. *Ibid.* I, 2, 1 ff.

23. *Muṇḍaka* III, 2, 8.

14. THE PATH OF LOVING DEVOTION: *BHAKTIMĀRGA*

1. *Śabdakalpadruma* III, 463b ff. offers the following etymology under the entry *bhakti*: *Vibhāga* [division, separation] *sevā* [worship, service] and refers to the two roots *bhañj-* [to split, to disappoint] and *bha-* [to serve, to honor].

2. S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 4, 351

3. That they were not considered as of equal importance even within *bhakta* circles is demonstrated by the fact that they have not been commented upon as extensively as the *Brahmasūtras*. The real textbooks of *bhakti* are the Purāṇas, especially the Bhāgavatam and the special compendia of the various *saṃpradāyas*: Saṃhitās, Āgamas, and Tantras.

4. *Bhaktidarśaṇa*, 23 ff.

5. Swami Tyagisananda (ed. and trans.), *Aphorisms on the Gospel of Divine Love or Nārada Bhaktisūtras*. The notes offer numerous other definitions and descriptions of *bhakti*.

6. *Bhagavadgītā* XII, 6 ff.

7. P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. V, part 2, 950 ff.

8. *Kaṭha* II, 22; Muṇḍaka III, 2, 3.

9. Another striking instance is offered by the *puruṣa-sūkta*, which contains the Vaiṣṇava cosmogony *in nucleo*: everything owes its existence to a transformation of a part of the body of the *puruṣottama*.

10. A good survey of literature in English on *bhakti* (up to 1975) is provided by Eleanor Zelliot, "The Mediaeval Bhakti Movement in History: An Essay on the Literature in English." More recent literature is mentioned in Philip Lutgendorf, "Mediaeval Devotional Traditions: An Annotated Survey of Recent Scholarship," in A. Sharma (ed.), *The Study of Hinduism*, 200–60.

11. Besides the work referred to in the next note, see D. Gold, *The Lord as Guru: Hindu Sants in the Northern Indian Traditions* and J. S. Hawley, *Sants and Virtues*.

12. Charlotte Vaudeville, "*Sant mat*: Santism as the Universal Path to Sanctity," in K. Schour and W. H. McLeod, *(eds.), The Sants: Studies in a Devotional Tradition of India*.

13. *Sad-nām* is the key term in this religion, meaning the most profound revelation of God.

14. Vaudeville, "*Sant mat*," 31.

15. A famous collection is the *Bṛhatstotraratnakara* (Bombay: Sri Venkatesvar Press), containing 224 hymns, in many editions with old woodcuts. The Rāmakrishna Mission has also brought out small collections of hymns together with translations.

16. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa*.

17. Ibid. VI, 2, 14; XII, 12, 46.

18. 1 crore = 10 million.

19. *Kalyāṇa Kalpatāru* 18, 1 (August 1952): 3 ff.

20. Cf. Swāmi Rūpa Gosvāmi, *Bhaktirasāmṛtasindhu*, V. Snataka (ed.), I, 2, 90 ff.

21. *Varāha Purāṇa*, chapter 68.

22. *Padma Purāṇa* IV, 263.

23. *Bhagavadgītā* VII, 15.

24. Tyagisananda, ed., *Nārada Bhaktisūtras*, 82 ff.

25. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* VII, 5, 23 ff.

26. *Rāmānuja's Vedārthasaṁgraha*.

27. Cf. *Sarvadarśaṇasaṁgraha of* Mādhava, chapter 5, the Pūrṇaprajñā system.

28. An important reference work is S. K. De, *Early History of the Vaiṣṇava Faith and Movement in Bengal*. Recently, possibly under the influence of *bhakti* missions in the West, much scholarly literature devoted to the study of *bhakti* literature has come out. Jayadeva's *Gītāgovinda* received a large amount of attention. Cf. B. Stoler-Miller, *Love Song of the Dark Lord*; G. Kuppuswami and M. Harihara (eds.), *Jayadeva and Gītāgovinda: A Study*, with a contribution by B. Stoler-Miller, "Rādhā: Consort of Kṛṣṇa's Vernal Passion"; L. Siegel, *Sacred and Profane Dimensions of Love in Indian Traditions as Exemplified in the Gītāgovinda of Jayadeva*. See also Basanti Choudhury, "Love Sentiment and Its Spiritual Implications in Gauḍīya Vaiṣṇavism."

29. Cf. Krishna Chaitanya, *Sanskrit Poetics*. P. V. Kane, *History of Sanskrit Poetics*, 355 ff.; "The Rasa School": "*Rasa* primarily means 'taste' or 'flavor' or 'savor' or 'relish' but metaphorically it means 'emotional experience of beauty in poetry and drama.'" By contrast Swami Bon Maharaj, *Bhaktirasāmṛtasindhu*, vol. 1, n. 2: "There is no English equivalent for *rasa*. It is a purely spiritual expression that may be explained like this. When the heart is perfectly purified of all the possible dirts of the three *guṇas* or attributes of *Māyā*, the Deluding Energy of the Godhead, viz. *rajas*, *tamas* and *sattva*, and when the unalloyed soul as distinct from the physical body of flesh and blood and the subtle body of mind-intelligence-ego far transcends the realm of imagination and mental thought-world, the fourfold ingredients called *Vibhāva*, *Anu-bhāva*, *Sāttvika-bhāva*, and *Sañcari-bhāva* of mellow-sweetness of the sentiment of the innate normal nature of the *cit*-soul combine with *Sthayī-bhāva* or permanent and eternal as also unconditional relation that exists between God and the individual soul, in manifold shades and forms, it gives rise to an inexplicably wondrous flow of charm, which is *Rasa*."

30. Cf. Viśvanātha Cakravartti, *Bhaktirasamṛtasindhubindu*.

31. Kṛṣṇadāsa Goswāmi, *Caitanyacaritāṃrta*, Mādhyalīlā XIX and XXII.

32. *Vedāntaratnamañjuṣa* VI.

33. *Sarvadarśanasaṁgraha of Mādhava*, chapter 7, "The Pāśupata System." An example of what Hindus call the *pāgala* (mad-type) of *bhakti* is available in Anne Feldhaus (trans. and ann.), *The Deeds of God in Ṛddhipur*, with introductory essays by Anne Feldhaus and E. Zelliot.

34. V. A. Devasenapathi, *Śaiva Siddhānta as Expounded in the Śivajñāna Siddhiar and Its Six Commentaries*, 250 ff. On Śiva *bhakti* in South India, Carl A. Keller, "Aspiration collective et experience individuelle dans la bhakti shivaite de l'Inde du sud."

35. Translation from E. J. Thompson and A. M. Spencer, *Bengali Religious Lyrics, Śākta*, 60. Cf. also M. Lupsa, *Chants á Kālī de Rāmprasād*.

36. *Words of Godrealization*, 415.

37. *Paramārtha Sopāna*.

38. Tyagisananda (ed.), *Nārada Bhaktisūtras*, 5 ff.

15. LORD VIṢṆU AND HIS DEVOTEES

1. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 19, 64 ff.

2. See his article "Vaiṣṇavism: An Overview."

3. The most complete survey is offered in Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, chapter 17: "*Bhāgavata yā vaiṣṇava mata*." The doctrinal side is well covered in S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vols. 3 and 4. Much detail on individual branches of Vaiṣṇavism is offered in entries on Vaiṣṇavism by R. N. Dandekar and G. R. Welbon in *ER*, vol. 15, 168–81.

4. *Ṛgveda* I, 22; I, 154; VII, 100.

5. *Ṛgveda* X, 90.

6. "Śāntiparvan," *Mahābhārata* (critical ed.), vol. 16, chapters 321 ff.

7. *Bhagavadgītā* IV, 7 ff. One of the most extensive studies was done by Brajendranath Seal, in 1899, under the title *Comparative Studies in Vaishnavism and Christianity with an Examination of the Mahābhārata Legend about Nārada's Pilgrimage to Śvetadvīpa and an Introduction on the Historico-Comparative Method*. In articles in the *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Bengal* in 1907 J. Kennedy tried to prove Christian influence on the development of Viṣṇu *bhakti*. His claims were refuted by B. D. Basu (translator) *Balarāma Vedāntasūtrabhāṣya*, in *SBH*, vol. 5, appendix I: "The Origin of the Bhakti Doctrine." N. Chaudhuri in his *Hinduism*, 256 ff., again suggests Christian influence on the development of Kṛṣṇa *bhakti*.

8. The most comprehensive discussion of the theory of *avatāra*-hood may be R. Seemann's article "Versuch zu einer Theorie des Avatāra . . ."

9. D. C. Sirkar, "Viṣṇu."

10. For details consult, e.g., A. Daniélou, *Hindu Polytheism*.

11. More about these in K. Klostermaier, *Mythologies*.

12. Ibid., 73 ff.

13. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* VI, 8.

14. A. George, in *Social Ferment in India*, advances the theory that the "Rāma tradition probably goes much further back into remote layers of pre-Aryan folklore from the days of tribal struggles between Austric groups in the Gangetic valley. The word *Gaṅgā* itself has been identified linguistically with a non-Aryan Austric word signifying merely a "river." All this may account for the seeming paradox whereby the suffix "Rām," which ought to denote a blue-blooded Kshatriya prince, tends in modern India to be that of the lower castes" (236).

15. *Bālakāṇḍa* I, 1, of the *Adhyātma Rāmāyaṇa*, written probably in the fifteenth century. Of great importance is the *Yogavāsiṣṭha Rāmāyaṇa*, pertaining to the ninth to twelfth centuries, in which the Rāma story serves as frame for the exposition of Advaita Vedānta. The most popular of all books on Rāma, however, is the Hindī *Rāmacaritamānasa* by Tulāsidāsa, praised by Mahātmā Gandhi as "the greatest religious book in the world." See the critical study by C. Bulcke, *Rāmakathā* (in Hindī).

16. *India Today* published on December 31, 1992, a special issue under the title "Nation's Shame," detailing the events leading up to, and following, December 6. A court order prevented construction of a temple on the site. Archeological excavations brought to light an ancient Hindu temple structure.

17. Literature on Kṛṣṇa by Indian authors fills bibliographies. Critical-historical writing by Western scholars is growing steadily. Most of it is devoted to studying certain aspects of the Kṛṣṇa tradition. Cf. John Stratton Hawley, *Kṛṣṇa the Butter Thief*. Many books on Indian art, especially on Indian painting, deal with Kṛṣṇa as well. E.g., W. G. Archer, *The Loves of Krishna*.

18. For more detail, see K. Klostermaier, Mythologies. Also V. Schneider, "Kṛṣṇa's postumer Aufstieg."

19. See Charles S. J. White, "Kṛṣṇa as Divine Child."

20. See Norvin Hein, "A Revolution in Kṛṣṇaism: The Cult of Gopāla."

21. The most thorough attempt to establish the historicity of Kṛṣṇa has been made by A. D. Pusalker. See his "Historicity of Kṛṣṇa" in *Epics and Purāṇas of India*, 49–81, and "Traditional History from the Earliest Time to the Accession of Parikshit" in *The Vedic Age*, vol. I of *HCIP*, 271–322. Pusalker places the "Kṛṣṇa Period" ca. 1950–1400 BCE. Recent archaeological excavations in Dvārakā, the reputed capital city of Kṛṣṇa, are supposed to have confirmed these assumptions. R. N. Iyengar, "Some celestial observations associated with Kṛṣṇa-lore" in *IJHSc* 41.1 (2006):1-13 argues that based on astronomical observations mentioned in *Mahābhārata*, *Viṣṇu Purāṇa*, *Skanda Purāṇa*, and *Bhāgavata Purāṇa*, the lifetime of Kṛṣṇa can be set between 1543 and 1443 BCE.

22. The most complete Kṛṣṇa scripture is the *Bhāgavata Purāṇa*.

23. See K. Klostermaier, *In the Paradise of Kṛṣṇa*.

24. Several recent theses have devoted substantial attention to the position of Śrī. Thus E. T. Hardy, *Emotional Kṛṣṇa Bhakti*; V. Rajagopalan, "The Śrī Vaiṣṇava Understanding of *Bhakti* and *Prapatti*"; and M. R. Paramesvaran, *Studies in Śrīvaiṣṇavism*.

25. See J. A. B. van Buitenen, "The Name Pāñcarātra," for numerous references to other literature.

26. *Yatīndramatadīpikā of Śrīnivāsadāsa*.

27. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* III, 26, 12.

28. J. B. Carman in *The Theology of Rāmānuja: An Essay in Interreligious Understanding* deals only with some aspects of Rāmānuja's theology but provides extensive background and full information on the sources of Śrīvaiṣṇavism. A systematic exposition of the thought of Rāmānuja is given in Krishna Datta Bharadwaj, *The Philosophy of Rāmānuja*. The most recent systematic work is J. Lipner, *The Face of Truth*.

29. *Vedārthasaṁgraha*, S. S. Raghavachar (ed. and trans.).

30. *Śrībhāṣya* II, 1, 3.

31. *Ibid*. II, 3, 41.

32. *Vedārthasaṁgraha*, 126: a slightly condensed rendering.

33. *Śrībhāṣya* I, 1, 4.

34. The three *rahasyas* are:

a. The Tirumantra: Om nāmo Nārāyaṇāya.

b. The Dvayam: Śrīmān Nārāyaṇa caraṇauśāraṇam prapadye/Śrīmate Nārāyaṇāya namaḥ.

c. The Carama *śloka* (*Bhagavadgītā* 18, 66): Sarvadharmān parityajya māmekam śaraṇam vraja/Aham tva sarvapāpebhyo mokṣayiśyāmi mā sucaḥ.

35. A good comparison of the main points of difference is given in Narasinha Iyengar, *Mumukṣupadī of Lokācārya*, introduction.

36. The most extensive study in English is Satyavrata Singh, *Vedānta Deśika: His Life Works and Philosophy.*

37. B. N. K. Sharma, *Madhva's Teaching in His Own Words*. Also: I. Puthiadan *Viṣṇu the Ever Free: A Study of the Madhva Concept of God*. See also literature on Madhva mentioned in Chapter 27.

38. Roma Chaudhuri, "The Niṃbārka School of Vedānta."

39. "Life of Vallabha," in: S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 4, 3711–72. See also R. Barz, *The Bhakti Sect of Vallabhācārya*; M. C. Parekh, *Śrī Vallabhācārya: Life, Teachings and Movement*; M. V. Joshi, "The Concept of Brahman in Vallabha Vedānta"; and, with a polemical twist, B. S. Yadav, "Vaiṣṇavism on Hans Küng: A Hindu Theology of Religious Pluralism."

40. M. I. Marfatia, *The Philosophy of Vallabhācārya* 70–76, "*Puṣṭi* or the Doctrine of Grace."

41. An extensive summary is given in the article "Vallabha" by D. Mackichan in *ERE*, vol. 12, and in *ER*, vol. 15 by R. K. Barz. See also J. Gonda, *Die Religionen Indiens*, vol. 2, 163. Also: D. L. Habermann, "On Trial: The Love of Sixteen Thousand Gopees."

42. *History of the Sect of the Mahārājas or Vallabhācāryas in Western India*.

43. A good survey of recent English and Hindī literature on Vallabha is provided in J. R. Timm's article "Vallabha, Vaiṣṇavism and the Western Hegemony of Indian Thought."

44. An extensive list of authors and works is given in Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 4, 373–81. Marfatia, *The Philosophy of Vallabha*, provides extensive summaries of many of these works, 91–314.

45. G. H. Bhatt, "The School of Vallabha," Vallabha also wrote a short commentary on the *Brahmasūtras* with the title of *Aṇubhāṣya*, published by S. T. Pathak in the *Bombay Sanskrit and Prakrit Series*, 1921–26.

46. Bhatt, "The School of Vallabha," 348. Vallabha calls his system *Śuddhādvaita*, "Pure Non-Dualism." In 1992 an English translation by Kanti Chattopadhyay appeared (Brill) of Ramapada Chattopadhyay's commentary on the *Brahmasūtras* based on the *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* under the title *A Vaiṣṇava Interpretation of the Brahmasūtras*.

47. Bhatt, "The School of Vallabha," 356.

48. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 4, 355.

49. Bhatt, "The School of Vallabha," 357: "One may be constantly angry with the Lord and still get *sāyujya*."

50. Bhatt, quoted in Ibid., 354–55.

51. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 4, 349.

52. According to Vallabha, *bhakti* develops in the following seven stages: 1. *bhāva*; 2. *premā*; 3. *prāṇaya*; 4. *sneha*; 5. *rāga*; 6. *anurāga*; 7. *vyasana*.

53. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 4, 356.

54. The best work with substantial translations from sources is W. Eidlitz, *Kṛṣṇa-Caitanya, Sein Leben und Seine Lehre*. A good historical survey is offered by A. K. Majumdar, *Caitanya: His Life and Doctrine*. See also J. T. O'Connell, "Historicity in the Biographies of Caitanya."

55. The "*Śīkṣāṣṭaka*" in *Caitanya Caritāmṛtam* III, 20, 3–45, is considered to be his own formulation of the essence of Vaiṣṇavism.

56. See K. Klostermaier, trans., Viśvanātha Cakravarti's compendium of Rūpa Goswāmi's opus magnum, *Bhakti-rasāmṛta-sindhu-bindu*, including some background to the author and his works. See also K. Klostermaier "A Universe of Feelings" and "Eine indische Wissenschaft der Gefühle," explaining Rūpa's main ideas of *premā* and drawing some parallels. See also: N. Delmonico, "Rūpa Goswāmi: His Life, Family and Early Vraja Commentators."

57. The *Vedāntasūtras of Bādarāyaṇa with the Commentary of Bāladeva*. See also: M. Wright and N. Wright, "Bāladeva Vidyābhuṣana: The Gauḍīya Vedāntist." For post-Caitanya developments in Gauḍīya Vaiṣṇavism, see J. K. Brzezinski, "Prabodhānanda Saraswatī: From Banares to Braj" and "Prabodhānanda, Hita Harivaṃśa and the *Rādhārasasudhānidhī*."

58. See also E. Zelliot, "The Medieval Bhakti Movement in History: An Essay on the Literature in English."

59. For details consult K. Sharma, *Bhakti and the Bhakti Movements*.

60. Among Indian scholars writing in English on this subject the names of R. D. Ranade (*Pathway to God in Hindī Literature*; *Pathway to God in Marathī Literature*; *Pathway to God in Kaṇṇaḍa Literature)* and Bankey Bihari (*Sufis, Mystics and Yogis of India, Bhakta Mīrā*) deserve special mention. Also: V. Raghavan, *The Great Integrators: The Saint Singers of India*, offers a good selection of medieval religious poetry in translation. Among Western writers, Charlotte Vaudeville deserves special credit for her scholarly monographs and translations (in French and English) dealing with Kabīr, Tulasīdāsa, and others. See also: M. Neog, *Early History of the Vaiṣṇava Faith and Movement in Assam: Śaṅkaradeva and His Time*.

61. J. S. Hawley has brought out a very attractive monograph on Sūrdās with beautifully translated texts: *Sūrdās: Poet, Singer, Saint*. In a further article in the *JVS*, Hawley examines the question of "Why Sūrdās Went Blind," arriving at the conclusion that it is a spiritual blindness that Sūrdās attributes to himself and not a physical blindness.

62. See J. S. Hawley, "Author and Authority in the Bhakti Poetry of North India."

63. My own translation: following the text in R.D. Ranade's *Paramārtha Sopāna*: Sourcebook of Pathway to God in Hindī Literature. (Part I, Chapter I, No. 1).

64. A good contemporary example is Swami Ramdas, *God-Experience*.

65. Bankey Bihari, *Bhaktā Mīrā*, 109; more on Mīrābāī in chapter 22.

16. ŚIVA: THE GRACE AND THE TERROR OF GOD

1. *Stotra* 53 in *Bṛhatstotraratnākara* (96 ff.), ascribed to Vyāsa.

2. Sir Mortimer Wheeler, *The Indus Civilization*. Doris Srinivasan in "Unhinging Śiva from the Indus Civilization," tries to prove that the *liṅgas* found in remnants of the Indus civilization do not present a case for an origin of Śaivism in that civilization. The tribal/prehistoric origin of *liṅga* worship is widely accepted today.

3. B. K. Ghosh, "The Āryan Problem," 207. In the oldest ritual texts care is taken not to mention the name of this "terrible god" directly.

4. Cf. *Mahābhārata Śāntiparvan* 274; *Droṇaparvan* 201, 64–82; *Sauptikaparvan* 18; *Vāyu Purāṇa* I, 30; *Śiva Purāṇa*, *Vayavīyasaṃhitā* I, 23, and numerous other places.

5. I have developed the argument more fully in "The Original Dakṣa Saga."

6. T. M. P. Mahadevan, "Śaivism," 454.

7. Thus the idea of the Śiva *avatāras*, which never gained an importance in actual Śiva worship. Among the Vaiṣṇava Purāṇas the *Vāmana Purāṇa* has also Śaivite materials and the Viṣṇu Purāṇa explains the origin of the eight Rudras in I, 8.

8. Kumara Gupta (415–455 CE) was a Śaiva king. The Huna king Mihirakula seems to have been Śaiva, as were many of his contemporary rulers in Bengal and the Deccan. Mahendra Varman I (600–630 CE), a convert from Jainism, made his capital, Kāñcīpuram, into a stronghold of Śaivism, embellishing it with temples and statues of Śiva.

9. T. M. P. Mahadevan, in *HCIP*, vol. 4, 300ff.

10. *Ṛgveda* I, 114; II, 33; VII, 46.

11. Doris M. Srinivasan, "Vedic Rudra-Śiva," 544.

12. *Ṛgveda* I.114.4.

13. *Ṛgveda* IV.3.1.

14. D. M. Srinivasan gives interesting specific details concerning Rudra's role in some of these sacrifices and the ritual connected with it.

15. It forms chapter 16 of the *Yajurveda* according to the *Vajasaneyasaṃhitā*. English translations in *Śatapathabrāhmaṇa*, 150 ff. and in R. T .H. Griffith, *The Texts of the White Yajurveda*, 168.

16. It forms chapter 15 of the *Atharvaveda*; W. D. Whitney, trans., introduction, 769 ff. See also J. W. Hauer, *Der Vrātya: Untersuchungen über die nichtbrahmanische Religion Altindiens*.

17. *Atharvaveda* XV, 5, 1 ff.

18. *Aitareya Brāhmaṇa* I, 3, 9 ff.

19. Text and translation in S. Radhakrishnan, *The Principal Upaniṣads*, 707—50. As for content and structure, see T. Oberlies, "Die Svetāśvatara Upaniṣad: Eine Studie ihrer Gotteslehre."

20. *Svetāśvatara Upaniṣad* VI, 11.

21. *Anuśāsanaparvan*, 135.

22. The oldest among the Śaiva Purāṇas is probably the *Vāyu Purāṇa*, which was written before the second century CE according to R. C. Hazra, "The Purāṇas." The

Śiva Purāṇa, a very important source for many features of later Śaivism, belongs to the class of *Upapurāṇas*. For more detailed information consult L. Rocher, *The Purāṇas*.

23. Śiva Purāṇa, *Rudrasaṃhitā Sātīkhaṇḍa* 38, 34 ff.

24. V. Paranjoti, *Śaiva Siddhānta*, 53 ff.: "The importance attached to the dance of Śiva is due to the fact that it symbolizes in graphic, concrete, and dynamic form the religion and philosophy of Śaiva Siddhānta. Hence the dance cannot be understood without the philosophy, which it adumbrates in its movements. Love is the motif of the dance; the dance is love in practical form." On Śaiva Siddhānta see also V. A. Devasenapathi, *Śaiva Siddhānta as Expounded in the Śivajñāna-Siddhiyar and Its Six Commentaries*, and K. Sivaraman, *Śaivism in Philosophical Perspective*.

25. Śiva Purāṇa, *Śatarudrasaṃhitā*, 1 ff, and *Vāyavīyasaṃhitā* II, 9.

26. Śiva Purāṇa, *Kotirudrasaṃhitā*, 38 ff.

27. Several Āgamas have been published recently by the Institute Français d'Indologie at Pondichery, containing the *pādas* on *kriyā* (ritual) and *cārya* (mode of life). E.g. *Rauravāgama* (with an important introduction by J. Filliozat, "Les Āgamas çivaites," in vol. 1), *Mṛgendrāgama*, *Ajitāgama*, *Matāṅgaparameśvarāgama*, all edited by N. R. Bhatt.

28. Much information has been collected in the articles on Śaivism in *ER*, vol. 13, 6–20 by D. N. Lorenzen and others as well as in the chapter "Śaiva," by G. Flood, in *The Hindu World*, 119–39.

29. Mādhava, *Sarvadarśanasaṃgraha*, chapter 6, quoting from the *Gaṇakarikā*, an ancient *Paśupata* textbook.

30. Cf. V. A. Devasenapathi, *Śaiva Siddhānta*.

31. Ibid., 192.

32. Ibid., 175.

33. Ibid., 257.

34. Śrīkaṇṭha, *Brahmasūtrabhāṣya* IV, 4, 22. English translation by Roma Chaudhuri, 2 vols.

35. Jayadeva Singh in his edition and translation of the *Pratyabhijñāhṛdayam* mentions his guru, Laksman Joo, as "practically the sole surviving exponent of this system in Kashmir." Recently, however, Gopi Krsna, a layman who describes his own realization more or less according to classical Kashmīr Śaivism has brought out a number of publications that might gain more adherents and students to the system. A brief biography of Swami Laksman Joo appeared in *Hinduism Today*, 17, 7 (July 1991); 1 and 25: "Last Bhairav Master Will Teach Until Year 2006." Laksman Joo claims to have sixty thousand disciples. He named a small boy as his successor.

36. Śiva Purāṇa, *Kailāsasaṃhitā*, 17–19.

37. Mādhava, *Sarvadarśanasaṁgraha*, chapter 8.

38. Quoted by Jaideva Singh, *Pratyabhijñāhṛdayam* p. 21.

39. S. C. Nandimath, *A Handbook of Vīraśaivism*. A very attractive introduction to Vīraśaivism is provided by A. K. Ramanujan in *Speaking of Śiva*. Besides artistic renderings in English of numerous *vacanas* (lyrics by Liṅgāyat poet-saints) the book

also contains valuable introductions by A. K. Ramunjan and an essay on "Liṅgāyat Culture" by William McCormack.

40. Hayavadana Rao (ed.). Not all *Vīraśaivas*, however, accept Śrīpati's interpretation.

41. Sri Kumaraswamiji, "*Vīraśaivism*," 101.

42. Ibid.

43. Cf. S. Satchidanandam Pillai, "The Śaiva Saints of South India." Also: C. V. Narayana Ayyar, *Origin and Early History of Śaivism in South India*.

44. *Tiruvācakam* VI, 50, Ratna Navaratnam, trans., 126. The most celebrated complete translation of the *Tiruvācakam* was made by Rev. G. V. Pope in 1903, reprinted in 1970 by the University of Madras in a Jubilee edition.

45. *Tiruvācakam* XXV, 8–10; Ibid., 181.

46. T. M. P. Mahadevan, "Śaivism."

47. R. C. Majumdar, "Kāpāla and Kālāmukha Sects," 459 quoting R. G. Bhandarkar, *Vaiṣṇavism*. § 97.

48. Biographical sketch of S. Kramrisch by B. Stoler-Miller in *Exploring India's Sacred Art*, 3–33.

49. Besides her widely known monograph *Asceticism and Eroticism in the Mythology of Śiva*, Wendy Doniger O'Flaherty has written a number of scholarly articles on Śiva symbols and myths.

50. *Dancing with Śiva: a Hindu Catechism* and *Living with Śiva: Hinduism's Nandināthan Sūtra*.

51. Besides the numerous books by Gopi Krishna expounding Kuṇḍalinī Yoga, the remarkable coproduction of C. F. v. Weizsäcker and Gopi Krishna, *Biologische Basis religiöser Erfahrung*, deserves mention.

17. DEVĪ: THE DIVINE MOTHER

1. *Devīmāhātmya* I, 75 ff. (from *Mārkaṇḍeya Purāṇa*, chapter 81).

2. John Woodroff, who, under the pen name of Arthur Avalon, did much to make the Tantras known in the West, brought out a translation of the *Mahānirvāṇa tantra: The Great Liberation*. For Tantric doctrines in general his *Principles of Tantra*, a translation of the *Tantratattva* of Sivacandra Vidyaranya, may be recommended. His *Introduction to Tantra Śāstra* provides the explanation of the technical terms. More recent scholarly writing on Tantra includes H. V. Günther, *Yuganādha: The Tantric View of Life*, and A. Bharati, *The Tantric Tradition*. See also the richly illustrated volume by Ajit Mookerjee and Madhu Kanna, *The Tantric Way: Art, Science, Ritual*, with bibliography. The most recent succinct presentation is offered by K. M. Endl in the chapter "Śākta" of *The Hindu World*, 140–61.

3. Sanskrit edition Kāśī: Paṇḍit Pustakālaya, samvat 2016; English translation by Swāmi Vijñānanda, *SBH*. For a fuller treatment consult R. C. Hazra, *Studies in the Upapurāṇas*, vol. 2: *The Śākta Upapurāṇas*, 1–361.

4. For more details on Devī mythology, Śākta systems, and iconography of the Goddess see K. Klostermaier, *Mythologies*, part IV.

5. R. C. Hazra, *Studies in the Upapurāṇas*, 19 ff.: "The story of Devī's killing of the demon Mahiṣa in a previous *kalpa* and the tradition that whenever Devī kills the demons she has a lion as her mount seem to be based on the aboriginal concept of Devī as a spirit controlling wild beasts. The bell which is said to be carried by Devī might have been originally meant for scaring away wild beasts." Cf. also H. Whitehead, *The Village Gods of South India*.

6. See H. v. Stietencron, "Die Göttin Durgā Mahiṣāsuramārdiṇī: Mythos, Darstellung und geschichtliche Rolle bei der Hinduisierung Indiens."

7. *Devīmāhātmya* X, 1 ff.

8. See P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 5, part 1, 154 ff.

9. Devī Purāṇa, 38.

10. *Devī Bhāgavata*; *Śiva Purāṇa Umāsaṃhitā*, 28–45.

11. *Kālikā Purāṇa*, 15.

12. Śiva without the *i* is Śava, a corpse.

13. The five *m*s are: *mamsa* (meat), *matsya* (fish), *mudrā* (fried rice), *mada* (intoxicants), and *maithuna* (intercourse).

14. H. D. Bhattacharya, "Tantrik Religion," 320.

15. Ibid., 321.

16. *Mahānirvāṇa tantra* XVIII, 154 ff.

17. Cf. D. N. Bose, *Tantras: Their Philosophy and Occult Secrets*, chapter 10, "Tantric Symbols and Practices," explains a number of basic *yantras*.

18. For details see R. Fonseca, "Constructive Geometry and the Śrī-Cakra Diagram." A very professional study of Devī iconography is Om Prakash Misra's *Mother Goddess in Central India*.

19. Cf. John Woodroff, *Introduction to Tantra Śāstra*, 42 ff.

20. *Kālikā Purāṇa* chapter 14 is called the *rudhirādhyāya* or "blood chapter." A. P. Karmarkar, in *The Religions of India* cites many historical instances of human sacrifices in honor of Kālī. Volunteers were offered every Friday at the Kālī temple in Tanjore up to the nineteenth century. The head of the victim was placed on a golden plate before Kālī, the lungs were cooked and eaten by Tantra Yogis, the royal family ate rice cooked in the blood of the victim.

21. N. Sirkar, *Śaktipīṭhas*, rev. ed.

22. See the recent report on Kāmākhyā and its legends offered by Patricia Dold in "The Mahāvidyās at Kāmarūpa: Dynamics of Transformation in Hinduism," confirming the continued occurrence of animal and even human sacrifices.

23. Beni Kanta Kakati, *The Mother Goddess Kāmākhyā*. The snake-goddess Manasā is widely worshipped, especially in South India.

24. Cf. Maryla Falk, *Nāma-Rūpa and Dharma-Rūpa: Origin and Aspects of an Ancient Indian Conception*, 2 ff.

25. *Tripurā Rahasya*, *Jñānakaṇḍa*, A. U. Vasavada, (trans.), 156 ff.

26. Ibid.

27. A description of *Vāmācārī* practices is given in H. Wilson, *The Religious Sects of the Hindus*, 142 ff. The work also contains a translation of the *Śakti Sudhāna*.

28. V. S. Agrawala, "Mother Earth," in: *Nehru Abhinandan Granth* 490 ff.

29. D. R. Kinsley, *The Sword and the Flute: Kālī and Kṛṣṇa, Dark Visions of the Terrible and the Sublime in Hindu Mythology*; C. M. Brown, *God as Mother: A Feminine Theology in India*; D. Jacobsen and S. Wadley, eds., *Women in India: Two Perspectives*; J. S. Hawley and D. M. Wulff (eds.), *The Divine Consort: Rādhā and the Goddesses of India*; L. E. Gatwood, *Devī and the Spouse Goddess: Women, Sexuality and Marriage in India*. F. X. Clooney, S. J., in his recent work *Divine Mother Blessed Mother: Hindu Goddesses and the Virgin Mary* offers translations of Hindu and Christian hymns and an intriguing comparison and parallelism between these traditions.

30. Sanjukta Gupta and Richard Gombrich, "Kings, Power and the Goddess."

31. *BLITZ*, title page on April 11, 1970: "Tantrik priest dies half-way through *havan* to kill Indira."

18. MUDALVAN, MURUKAN, MĀL: THE GREAT GODS OF THE TAMILS

1. On Agastya see the entry in John Dowson, *A Classical Dictionary of Hindu Mythology*, 4 ff., which provides the major references for Agastya in *Ṛgveda*, *Mahābhārata*, and *Rāmāyaṇa* and specifically says: "The name of Agastya holds a great place in Tamil literature, and he is venerated in the south as the first teacher of science and literature to the primitive Dravidian tribes." The authority of Dr. Caldwell is cited, who thinks that "we shall not greatly err in placing the era of Agastya in the seventh or at least in the sixth century BC." See also information on the Agastya tradition in *HCIP*, vol. 2, 290 ff.

2. "Tamil Religion," 260b.

3. On dates concerning the *Saṅgam* (*Cankam*) see *HCIP*, vol. 2, 291 ff. and K. A. Nilakanta Sastri, *The Culture and History of the Tamils*, 127 ff. See also C. Jesudason and H. Jesudason, *A History of Tamil Literature*. A comprehensive history of Tamil literature is found in K. V. Zvelebil, *The Smile of Murukan*.

4. N. Chaudhuri, *Hinduism*, 64 ff.

5. T. Burrows, *The Sanskrit Language*.

6. Together, these areas comprise today about two hundred million people.

7. For details, see K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, vol. 1, chapter 3, "Pre-History," and F. W. Clothey, *The Many Faces of Murukan*. See also maps of prehistoric sites in South India in *HASA*, plates II, 1 and 2.

8. See the instructive article by F. W. Clothey, "Tamil Religion."

9. K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, 480 ff.

10. C. Sivaramamurti, *South Indian Bronzes*.

11. K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, 476: referring to Bruce Foote.

12. Ibid., 477.

13. D. D. Shulman, *Tamil Temple Myths*. See also: B. Oguibenine, "Cosmic Tree in Vedic and Tamil Mythology: Contrastive Analysis"; G. Kuppuswamy and M. Hariharan, "Bhajana Tradition in South India." Significant differences between northern and southern interpretations of common religious symbols exist also in other areas.

14. K. Klostermaier, "The Original Dakṣa Saga."

15. K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, 488 ff.

16. Ibid., 489.

17. Ibid., 492 (with references to Tamil sources).

18. Ibid.

19. K. Zvelebil, *Tiru Murukan*.

20. K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, 484.

21. Ibid.

22. Ibid., 485. See also: D. Handelman, "Myths of Murukan: Asymmetry and Hierarchy in a South Indian Purāṇic Cosmology."

23. Ibid.

24. Ibid., 487 ff.

25. See also F. W. Clothey, "Murukan."

26. K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, 497.

27. Peculiar features of Tamiḷnāḍu are the *Nāḍukal* (memorial stones) and *Vīrakal* (hero stones), which were erected with religious solemnities to commemorate warriors who had died in battle.

28. This division goes back to the *Tolkappiam*, an ancient Tamil grammar and reputedly the oldest document of Tamil literature, ascribed to the second century BCE.

29. See K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, 504 ff.

30. Ibid., with references to Tamil sources.

31. Ibid. Pillai emphasizes that during these sacrifices live animals were sacrificed, a practice that continues to this day in certain forms of Śiva worship.

32. See also F. A. Presler, "The Structure and Consequences of Temple Policy in Tamiḷnāḍu, 1967–81." See also "Priestly Protest," reporting on an agitation in Andhra Pradesh against the abolition of hereditary priesthood and the demand for training of temple priests.

33. J. Parthasarathi, "The Draviḍa Veda-Vedāṅga—A Revolutionary Cultural Crosscurrent," 57.

34. See K. K. Pillai, "The Non-Brahmin Movement in South India." See also C. A. Ryerson, "Meaning and Modernization in Tamil Nadu: Tamil Nationalism and Religious Culture."

35. See also K. V. Zvelebil, "Some Tamil Folklore Texts."

36. *Tirukkural*, chapter 38, 9 (380): G. U. Pope's translation.

37. K. K. Pillai, *A Social History of the Tamils*, 524 ff.

38. Ibid., 426.

39. H. Whitehead, *The Village Gods of South India*, with illustrations.

40. The author once obtained a *rahu kālam* chart from his Madras landlord who was not only a modern-educated, successful industrialist, but also a staunch believer in *rahu kālam*, during which time he refused to conduct any business.

41. N. K. Sastri, *The Culture and History of the Tamils*, 108 ff., believes that many of the accounts of religious persecution in Tamiḷnāḍu are exaggerated. But there is no doubt that violence did occur and that the various religious communities denounced each other.

42. N. K. Sastri reports that "even now Madurai conducts an annual festival in the temple commemorating the incredible impalement of eight thousand Jainas at the instance of the gentle boy saint." Ibid., 110.

43. See also F. W. Clothey, "Tamil Religions."

44. Cf. F. Kingsbury and G. E. Philips, trans., *Hymns of the Tamil Śaivite Saints*, 30–33.

45. Ibid., 25.

46. Bankey Bihari, *Minstrels of God*, part I, 118–27. More on Āṇṭāl in chapter 23.

47. See literature mentioned in chapter 15 (notes 35–37) and A. K. Ramanujan, *Speaking of Śiva*.

48. A. K. Ramanujan, *Speaking of Śiva*, 88 (Basavanna No. 820).

49. Personal observations. See also P. V. Jagadisa Ayyar, *South Indian Festivities*, for other Tamil festivals such as Bhopi Pandigai, Sankrānti, and others.

19. THE DIVINE PRESENCE IN SPACE AND TIME: *MŪRTI, TĪRTHA, KĀLA*

1. See *HASA*, 264–65.

2. For details see J. N. Banerjea, *The Development of Hindu Iconography*, chapters 1–6.

3. See Nihan Ranjan Ray, "Sculpture."

4. See H. Zimmer, *The Art of Indian Asia*, vol. 1, 259 ff; plates on 268 ff.

5. E.g., the famous group of temples at Belur, Mysore.

6. Lively accounts are found in Elliot and Dowson (eds.), *The History of India as Told by Its Own Historians: The Muhammadan Period*. Some doubt has been expressed as to the truth of these reports, whose writers evidently wanted to impress their (Muslim) readers.

7. J. P. Waghorne and N. Cutler (eds.), *Gods of Flesh/Gods of Stone: The Embodiment of Divinity in India*.

8. A concise and comprehensive description of the technicalities of *mūrtis* can be found in the article "Ikonographie des Hinduismus" in V. Möller, *Götter und Mythen des indischen Subkontinents*, vol. 5 of H. W. Haussig (ed.), *Wörterbuch der Mythologie*, 86–112, with bibliography of primary and secondary sources.

9. Cf. J. N. Banerjea, *Hindu Iconography*, chapter 8. A seminal work is S. Kramrisch, *Indian Sculpture*. Also of great interest is H. Zimmer, *Kunstform und Yoga im indischen Kultbild*.

10. K. Vasudeva Sastri and N. B. Gadre (eds.), Tanjore Sarasvati Mahal Series No. 85 (1958). Two complete manuals of Hindu architecture are available in Western language translations: *Mānasāra*, P. K. Acharya, trans., and *Mayamata*, 3 ed. and trans. B. Dagens.

11. For details see T. Bhattacharya, *The Canons of Indian Art*, chapters 14 to 20.

12. There are special works giving rules for restoration of images and special rites for the re-consecration.

13. That is milk, curds, butter, dung, and urine.

14. *Bṛhatsaṃhitā* of Varāhamihira, published with a Hindī translation by Pandit Acutyananda Jha Sarmana, Chaukhambha Vidyābhavan Sanskṛt Granthamālā No. 49 , chapter 60, slightly condensed. An English translation by M. R. Bhat has recently been published in two volumes by Motilal Banarsidass.

15. The ritual of Viṣṇu worship as followed at Śrīraṅgam is described in *Śrī Parameśvara Saṃhitā*. A very detailed study, with illustrations, of Kṛṣṇa worship in the Caitanyite tradition, relying mainly on the *Haribhaktivilāsa* by Gopāla Bhaṭṭa, the authoritative work for it, is R. V. Joshi, *Le rituel de la dévotion Kṛṣṇaite*.

16. Cf. N. Ramesan, *Temples and Legends of Andhra Pradesh*, 70 ff.

17. *Arthapañcakam* of Pillai Lokācārya, no. 19.

18. One such complete manual detailing the daily ritual in South Indian Śiva temples is available in a French translation: H. Brunner-Lachaux (ed. and trans.), *Somaśambhupaddhatī*.

19. The technical expression for this is *nyāsa*: see R. V. Joshi, *Le ritual*. . . . 87 ff.

20. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* XI, 27, 20 ff.

21. One of the earliest such government-appointed board was established to regulate the affairs of possibly the most famous and richest temple in India, the Tirupati Devasthānam in Andhra Pradesh.

22. Stella Kramrisch in the early 1920s made the first attempt to study Hindu temples with the aid of ancient manuscripts on architecture, resulting in her opus magnum, *The Hindu Temple*. Barbara Stoler-Miller edited essays by Kramrisch covering a span of almost fifty years and touching upon virtually all aspects of Hindu art under the title *Exploring India's Sacred Art*. It also contains a brief biography of Kramrisch and a full bibliography. Much recent work has been done by the Indologist-architect M. W. Meister, editor of the *Encylopedia of Indian Temple Architecture* and author of several important articles in scholarly journals, such as "Maṇḍala and Practice in Nāgara Architecture in North India" and "Measurement and Proportion in Hindu Architecture." See also his article "Hindu Temples" in *ER*, vol. 14, 368–73.

23. S. Kramrisch, *The Hindu Temple*, vol. 1, 97.

24. For an interpretation, see A. Volwahsen, *Living Architecture: Indian*, 43 ff.

25. S. Kramrisch, *The Hindu Temple*, vol. 1, 97.

26. A very informative article dealing with this issue is R. Kulkarni's "Vāstupāda-maṇḍala" with many diagrams and tables.

27. The most perfect application of this scheme can be seen in the city of Jaipur. On city planning in general the *Viśvakarman Vāstuśāstra*, an authoritative work, can be consulted. The most systematic modern Western work on the subject is D. Schlingloff, *Die altindische Stadt*.

28. The details of the calculation are given in A. Volwahsen, *Living Architecture*, 50–55.

29. Ibid., 51.

30. Cf. O. Fischer, *Die Kunst Indiens*, plates 253 ff.

31. B. Rowland, *The Art and Architecture of India*, plate 112.

32. Ibid., plates 101 and 118.

33. The placing of the capstone on top of such a tall structure was a marvelous engineering feat of the time. According to tradition a four-mile-long ramp was built upon which it was inched up. A different theory is held by some Western authors. See A. Volwahsen, *Living Architecture*, 180 ff. and B. Rowland, *The Art and Architecture of India*, plate 121b.

34. Cf. A. Volwahsen, *Living Architecture*, 145.

35. Cf. B. Rowland, *The Art and Architecture of India*, plate 103a.

36. Ibid., plate 106.

37. Ibid., plate 104.

38. Ibid., plate 124.

39. Ibid., plate 120a.

40. Ibid., chapters 15–17. Also J. C. Harle, *The Art and Architecture of the Indian Subcontinent*. Much fascinating detail on the technicalities of temple building, the tools used, and the organization of the trades employed can be gathered from A. Boner, S. R. Sarma, R. P. Das, *New Light on the Sun Temple of Konārka: Four Unpublished Manuscripts Relating to Construction History and Ritual of This Temple*. The work also contains reproductions of the late-medieval palm leaf manuscripts with the complete "blueprint" of the temple and appropriate annotations.

41. D. L. Eck, *Darśan: Seeing the Divine Image in India*.

42. *Maitrī Upaniṣad*, VI, 14 ff.

43. P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 5, part 1, 253–462, offers a list of *vratas* containing more than a thousand individual feasts and observances.

44. *Dharmayuga* brought out an issue dedicated to this feast on August 30, 1964; Also P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 5, part 1, 124 ff.

45. For details see P. V. Kane, Ibid., 154–87.

46. For details see Kane, Ibid., 227 ff. *The Illustrated Weekly of India* brought out a special *Mahāśivarātrī* issue 87, no. 8 (February 20, 1966). See also the very detailed and interesting study by J. B. Long, "Festival of Repentance: A Study of Mahāśivarātrī."

47. The Gītāpress brought out a special volume *Tīrthāṅka* [in Hindī] in 1956 describing, on more than seven hundred pages with numerous illustrations, thousands of *tīrthas*. See also M. Jha (ed.), *Dimensions of Pilgrimage*; R. Salomon (ed. and trans.), *The Bridge to the Three Holy Cities, the Samāyāna-Praghaṭṭaka of Nārāyaṇa Bhaṭṭa's Triṣṭhalīsetu*; E. A. Morinis, *Pilgrimage in the Hindu Tradition: A Case Study of West Bengal*.

48. The *Padma Purāṇa* contains a great number of *tīrtha māhātmyas*, as does the *Matsya* and *Agni*. The *Padma Purāṇa* has a long *khaṇḍa* in honor of Kāśī, which is perhaps the *sthala purāṇa* itself.

49. An interesting essay about a trip from the source of the Ganges to her entering the sea is J. J. Putnam and R. Singh, "The Ganges—River of Faith."

50. See H. von Stietencron, "Suicide as a Religious Institution."

51. *Kalyāṇa Kalpatāru*, 39, 12 (March 1966).

52. L. B. Havell, *Vārāṇasī, the Sacred City: Sketches of Hindu Life and Religion*. Also Diana Eck, *Vārāṇasī, the City of Light*. Valuable information also in P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 4, 618–42.

53. Quite instructive are the two special issues "Homage to Varanasi" brought out by the *Illustrated Weekly of India* 85, nos. 6 and 7 (9 and 16 February 1984) with numerous illustrations.

54. *Vārāṇasī at a Glance*, 17.

55. Cf. the section "Tīrthayātra" in Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 4, 552–827 including a list of *tīrthas* over one hundred pages long, with thousands of names and indications of further information. A visit to a *Kumbhamelā*, which is held in turn every three years in Allahābad (Prayāga), Hardwar, Ujjain, and Nasik gives a good impression of the fervor with which also today millions of Hindus engage in *tīrthayātra* and the observance of holy times. See also the report on the *Kumbhamelā* in Hardwar in 1986 in *India Today* (May 15, 1986), 74–85. According to press reports, thirty million pilgrims participated in the 2004 Kumbhamelā at Ujjain.

56. Good information on the history of Tirupati (and other major centers) in N. Ramesan, *Temples and Legends of Andhra Pradesh*, 56–69. At a pilgrimage to Tirupati in 1996 the author picked up a booklet, "Balajī Śrī Venkateśwara: Collected Myths, Legends, Chronicles," retold by Sri Muniswami, published by Chukkala Singaiah Chetty, Tirupathi (n.d.).

57. A great amount of detail on the architecture of these places can be found in M. W. Meister (ed.), *Encyclopedia of Indian Temple Architecture*, vol. 1, South India.

58. C. J. Fuller, *Servants of the Goddess: The Priests of a South Indian Temple*; W. P. Harman, *The Sacred Marriage of a Hindu Goddess*; S. Padmanabhan, *Temples of South India*; D. D. Shulman, *Tamil Temple Myths: Sacrifice and Divine Marriage in the South Indian Tradition*.

59. V. N. Hari Rao not only published a monograph on *The Śrīraṅgam Temple: Art and Architecture* but also translated *Koil Olugu: The Chronicle of the Śrīraṅgam Temple*, which provides insight into the vicissitudes of this famous place of pilgrimage.

60. For more details see F. W. Clothey, "Pilgrimage Centers in the Tamil Culture of Murukan."

61. For more details see K. R. Vaidyanathan, *Sri Krishna, the Lord of Guruvayūr*.

20. THE HINDU SOCIAL ORDER: *CATURVARṆĀŚRAMADHARMA*

1. L. Dumont, *Religion/Politics and History in India: Collected Papers in Indian Sociology*, 38 n. 10.

2. J. H. Hutton, *Caste in India: Its Nature, Function and Origins*.

3. *Homo Hierarchicus*, English translation. A very useful work is P. H. Prabhu's *Hindu Social Organization: A Study in Socio-Psychological and Ideological Foundations*. Also recommended is the work of the anthropologist Irawati Karve, *Hindu Society: An Interpretation*, highlighting especially the great diversity of Indian society and its customs in the various parts of India.

4. In "Orientalist Constructions of India" Inden writes: "Indological discourse, I argue, holds (or simply assumes) that the essence of Indian civilization is just the opposite of the West's. It is the irrational (but rationalizable) institution of 'caste' and the Indological religion that accompanies it, Hinduism. Human agency in India is displaced by Indological discourse not onto a reified State or Market but onto a substantialized caste" (402). However, caste *is* essential for Hindu society and has been understood as such not only by Indologists but by Indians themselves, high and low.

5. *Ṛgveda* X, 190.

6. Dagmar Gräfin Bernstorff, "Das Kastensystem im Wandel."

7. An important issue became the question of intercaste marriages and the position of the "mixed castes." See *Manusmṛti* X, 6–73.

8. Apart from encyclopedic works like E. Thurston and K. Rangachari's, *Tribes and Castes of South India* and parallels in other parts of India, village or regional studies like M. N. Srinivas, *Religion and Society among the Coorgs of South India*, and books inspired by this seminal work give a good idea of the actual working of caste.

9. *Article 17*: "Untouchability is abolished and its practice in any form is forbidden. The enforcement of any disability arising out of Untouchability shall be an offense punishable in accordance with law."

10. The story is told in the *Anuśāsanaparvan* of the *Mahābhārata*. Comments of the editor of the critical edition, vol. 18, lviii. Orthodox Hindus expressed resentment against Svāmi Bhaktvedānta's claiming Brahmin status for the members of ISKCON.

11. Dumont refers to G. Dumezil's *Mitra-Varuna* and A. M. Hocart's *Les Castes*.

12. "The Conception of Kingship in Ancient India," in *Religion/Politics*, 62 ff.

13. Arvind Sharma, *The Puruṣārthas: A Study in Hindu Axiology*. Also C. Malamoud, "On the Rhetoric and Semantics of *Puruṣārtha*." See also the essays on *dharma* (B. Holdrege), *artha* (H. Scharfe), *kāma* (D. Killingley) and *mokṣa* (K. Klostermaier) in S. Mittal and G. Thursby (eds.), *The Hindu World*.

14. A rich source of information on these matters is P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 2, part 2.

15. *Hinduism* in Wm. Theodore de Bary (general ed.), *Sources of Indian Tradition*, vol. 1, p. 200–361.

16. "Another Path," 41.

17. For an overall view see U. N. Ghosal, *A History of Indian Political Ideas: The Ancient Period and the Period of Transition to the Middle Ages*. For the question of Brahmanic vs. Kṣatriya views see R. M. Dandekar, "Ancient Indian Polity."

18. *Manusmṛti* I, 98–101.

19. See especially *Bhagavadgītā*, III, 35.

20. "Sacred kingship" in India and in other cultures had been the topic of a congress of the International Association for the History of Religion. Cf. *Numen*, supplement no. 4, with C. M. Edsman's introductory essay, "Zum Sakralen Königtum in der Forschung der letzten hundert Jahre," 3–17. Important essays on this topic by M. Biardeau, R. Inden, and A. C. Mayer are also contained in T. N. Madan (ed.), *Way of Life: King, Householder, Renouncer—Essays in Honor of Louis Dumont*. The relationship between kingship and local temple cults is explored by R. Inden, "Hierarchies of Kings in Early Mediaeval India" in this work (99–125); and S. Gupta and R. Gombrich, "Kings, Power and the Goddess."

21. The term is *daṇḍa*, literally a stick, an instrument of punishment, as which the scepter has to be understood throughout in this tradition.

22. The term is *kheda*, meaning exhaustion; other manuscripts have *dhainya*.

23. *Śāntiparvan* 59, 12 ff.

24. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 13; *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* IV, 14.

25. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 13, 61–63.

26. One of the best examples is the *Rājadharma* section in the *Mahābhārata Śāntiparvan*, 1–128.

27. See *The Kauṭilīya Arthaśāstra*, R. P. Kangle, ed. and trans., 3 parts, containing the critical text, a translation, and a study. See also U. N. Ghosal, "Kauṭilīya."

28. The difference between the Kauṭilīyan idea of kingship and European absolutism is explored in N. P. Sil, "Political Morality vs. Political Necessity: Kauṭilya and Machiavelli Revisited."

29. The *Arthaśāstra* concludes with the maxim: "What humankind lives by that is *artha*, the science that deals with the means of conquering and possessing the earth is *arthaśāstra*."

30. *Jāti* is derived from the root *jā-*, "to be born," and is usually translated as "subcaste." In fact it is the *jātis* that determine the real place of a Hindu in society since every *varṇa* contains a hierarchy of numerous *jātis*.

31. Modernization is not necessarily Westernization: "Modernity, in that sense, is not new; it is a recurring historical force, a recurring opportunity 'which, taken at the flood, leads on to fortune, omitted, all the voyage of your life is bound in shallows and miseries.' Ultimately, we today are striving for the most strategic thing in our time, a new identity for ourselves and for the world. It is no less than an identity with the spirit of the age, the fulfillment of a new *karma*, and here the responsibility has lain squarely on the elites of history" (4).

32. Compare, e.g., the *prāyaścittas* for killing a cow and for killing a *caṇḍāla*.

33. The following letter to the editor of the *Times of India* (Bombay, March 20, 1968) on "Harijan's Plight" by Rajaram P. Mukane from Thana is quite telling: "Millions

of untouchables in this country continue to suffer shameful humiliations 20 years after independence. Almost every aspect of our life is infested with casteism and communalism. The Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh disclosed in the Assembly last week that a Harijan youth was roasted alive on a charge of theft. The committee on untouchability constituted by the Union Government recently revealed that three untouchables were shot dead by caste Hindus for growing their moustaches upwards instead of downward, in keeping with the local Hindu tradition, and that an untouchable youth was killed in Mysore for walking along the street wearing chappals. Everyone remembers how in Maharastra three Harijan women were stripped naked and made to walk before the public on the roads. These are not isolated incidents. Such atrocities are perpetrated everywhere in our country due to the virus of casteism and untouchability, although the practice of the latter has been banned by law. The law against untouchability is almost inoperative because of the indifferent attitude of the so-called upper-caste Hindus holding key positions. For Hinduism the cow and other such things seem to occupy a more significant position than human dignity. . . ." More recent examples of injustices committed against the former outcastes can be found in A. George, *Social Ferment in India*, chapter 7: "The Scheduled Castes," 202 ff.

34. See B. R. Ambedkar, *What Congress and Gandhi Have Done to the Untouchables*. Dr. Ambedkar resented the appellation *Harijan* for the outcastes: it was a term used to designate the children of *devadāsis*, whose father was unknown.

35. Some idea of the issues that the Dalits are bringing up may be gathered from M. R. Anand and E. Zelliot (eds.), *An Anthology of Dalit Literature*. In New Delhi a (Christian) "Center for Dalit Studies" has opened in 2002 that is to develop a "Dalit theology." See A. King, "Dalit Theology: A Theology of Outrage." In I. Bocken, W. Dupre, P. van der Velde (eds.), *The Persistent Challenge*, 53–78. Nowadays Brahmins also have to perform lowly jobs such as riksha pullers and sanitation workers in order to make a living—there is not much left of the privileged position of former times! See Francois Gautier, "Are Brahmins the Dalits of Today?" http://in.rediff.com/news/2006/may/23.

21. *SAṂNYĀSA*: THE HIGHEST HINDU ASPIRATION

1. *Manusmṛti* X, 74 ff.

2. *Manusmṛti* VI, 37 threatens those with punishments in hell who take *saṃnyāsa* without having begotten a son and performed the proper rites. See also *Viṣṇusmṛti* V, 13.

3. More detailed background information can be found in I. C. Oman, *The Mystics, Ascetics and Saints of India* (first published in 1903); H. H. Wilson, *Religious Sects of the Hindus* (first published in *Asiatick Researches* XVI [1828] and XVII [1832]; S. Chattophadyaya, *The Evolution of Theistic Sects in Ancient India*; G. S. Ghurye, *Indian Sādhus*.

4. *Mahābhārata*, Anuśāsanaparvan, 141.

5. The *śikhā*, also called *choṭī*, is the little wisp of hair left at the place of the *brahmārandra*, where according to Vedic belief, the *ātman* leaves the body. It is never cut, while the rest of the head is shaved ritually quite often. It is, even today, a sign of Brahmanic orthodoxy and is cut off only if someone takes *saṃnyāsa*, whereby he technically ceases to belong to the community that observes *dharma*.

6. *Paramahaṃsa Upaniṣad*, condensed rendering from *108 Upanisadeñ, Brahmā Vidyā Khaṇḍa*, no. 33, 526 ff.

7. P. Olivelle has edited and translated several classical texts relating to *saṃnyāsa: Vasudevāśrama's Yatidharmaprakāśa: A Treatise on World Renunciation*; *Rules and Regulations of Brahmanical Asceticism* [text and English translation of Yādavaprakāśas's *Yatidharmasamuccaya*]. See also his *Renunciation in Hinduism: A Medieval Debate*, which contrasts texts from the Śaṅkara and the Rāmānuja traditions.

8. Viśveśvarasarasvatī, *Yatidharmasaṅgraha*, V. G. Apte (ed.), 154.

9. *Vedārthasaṅgraha*, no. 251.

10. An early example is *Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad* II, 6 mentioning fifty eight generations of gurus ending with "Parameṣṭhin from Brahman." Later sectarian sūtras carry lengthy lists of names, too.

11. *Upadeśasahasrī*, no. 6.

12. Concerning the legal aspects of *saṃnyāsa*, see P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 2 , part 2, 933 ff.

13. Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, "*saṃpradāya khaṇḍa*," chapters 67–75.

14. On the life and work of Śaṅkara and the order founded by him see: W. Cenkner, *A Tradition of Teachers: Śaṅkara and the Jagadgurus Today*. Also: Yoshitsugu Sawai, "Śaṅkara's Theology of Saṃnyāsa."

15. Also some other ancient establishments claim to have been founded by Śaṅkarācārya and to possess his *guru paraṃparā*, expressed in the titles *jagadguru* and Śaṅkarācārya given to the resident chief ascetic. See, e.g., T. M. P. Mahadevan, *The Sage of Kanchi*, describing the life of Śrī Jagadguru Śaṅkarācārya of Kāmakothi Pīṭha, His Holiness Śrī Chandrasekharendra Sarasvatī on the completion of sixty years of spiritual rulership as the sixty-eighth Head of the Pīṭha. Śaṅkara is supposed to have founded a great many other *āśramas* like the Summeru and Paduka Maṭhas at Vārāṇasī and the Vadakkāri Madaur and Naduvilai Madaur in Kerala. Their *guru paraṃparā* is disputed. A reader of the first edition of the *Survey* who had made a special study of the succession of the Śaṅkara *maṭhas* informed me that today the *saṃnyāsi* names ending in Pūrī, Sāgara, Āśrama, Giri, Vāna, or Pārvata are rare, and the most frequently used are Bhārati, Tīrtha, and Sarasvatī. He mentioned that all the orders today greet each other or sign documents with the words *Iti Nārāyaṇasmaraṇam* or *Nārāyaṇasmṛtiḥ*. He also provided me with several pages of arguments, concluding that the Kāmakothi Pīṭha at Kāñchīpuram is not one of the four original *maṭhas* founded by Śaṅkara and that a 1979 meeting of the four undisputed *maṭhas* (called Chaturamnyāya Sammelan) did not mention Kāmakothi Pīṭha (letter by S. Vidyasankar, July 21, 1992).

16. In order to enhance their prestige non-Śaṇkarite *sādhus*, as e.g., the Neo-Caitanyas, also adopt these titles.

17. Cf. S. G. Ghurye, *Indian Sādhus*, chapter 6.

18. W. Cenkner, *A Tradition of Teachers*, 134.

19. S. G. Ghurye, *Indian Sādhus*, chapter 10.

20. Cf. T. M. P. Mahadevan, in *HCIP*, vol. 5, 458. See also H. H. Wilson, *Religious Sects*, 131 ff. and 142 ff. Rāmānuja, *Śrībhāṣya*, II, 2, 36; S. G. Ghurye, *Indian Sādhus*, 48 ff.

21. This group, founded in the early seventeenth century with centers in Banares, Gazipur, and Jaunpur, is classified as *sudhārak* (reformist) in Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, 739. The traditional Aghoris are unapproachable to outsiders.

22. A. S. Raman, "Homage to Varanasi," *Illustrated Weekly of India* 85, nos. 6–7.

23. For a full-length monograph, see A. K. Banerjea, *The Philosophy of Gorakhnāth*.

24. Besides the information offered by Ramdas Gaur, see H. H. Wilson, *Religious Sects*, 148 ff.

25. Pandit Srinarayan Sastri Khiste, "Śrīvidyā," in *Kalyāṇa Devībhāgavatam Aṅgka*.

26. Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, 730 ff.

27. W. S. Deming, *Rāmdās and the Rāmdāsis*.

28. Besides the text editions, translations, and works mentioned by C. Vaudeville in *Kabīr Granthavālī* (*Doha*), G. H. Westcott, *Kabīr and the Kabīr Panth*, is still very recommendable.

29. Details in Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, 735 ff.

30. Karpātrijī Mahārāj, *Rāmrājya aura Marksvāda* [in Hindī].

31. It was interesting to see the comments and reports in the dailies and weeklies of India in the days following the incident, especially the rather interesting opposite versions offered by the left-wing *Blitz* and the right-wing *Organizer*.

32. Cf. the Hindū Viśva Pariṣad publication *Viśva Hindū*, started in Bombay in 1964; special edition in January 1966, on occasion of a conference at the *Kumbha Melā* at Allahābad.

33. See K. Klostermaier, "Vaiṣṇavism and Politics: The New Dharma of Braj?" describing a meeting with Swāmi Vāmadeva and Swāmi Muktānanda, the present Secretary General of the organization. The appendix to the article offers a translation of a Hindī pamphlet containing the goals and demands of the movement.

34. As the Delhi paper *Pioneer* reports in its March 3, 1993, issue, the Sant Samiti appears to gain importance. The Sant Samiti, under the direction of Swāmi Vāmadeva, through frequently held *sant sammelans* (gatherings of *sādhus*), has taken up the task to continue the movement to "liberate" the major Hindu temple sites at Kāśī, Mathurā, and Delhi.

35. D. D. Kosambi has critically edited *The Epigrams Attributed to Bhartṛhari Including the Three Centuries*. The Advaita Āśrama Calcutta has brought out the text with translation of the *Vairāgya Śatakam* (1963) according to the rather heavily interpolated "vulgate" text. The extract here is from nos. 2–7 and 99–100.

36. Mādhava Ashish, "The Sādhu in Our Life."

22. *STRĪDHARMA*: THE POSITION OF WOMEN IN HINDUISM

1. Minoti Bhattacharyya, "Hindu Religion and Women's Rights."

2. *Ṛgveda* V, 28.

3. *Ṛgveda* VIII, 91, 1; I, 117, 7; X, 40, 1; X, 145, 16.

4. See also E. B. Findly, "Gārgī at the King's Court" and Uma Deshpande, "Some Ṛgvedic Poetesses: A Study."

5. *Ṛgveda* I, 116, 16.

6. *Ṛgveda* I, 48, 1.14–15.

7. *Ṛgveda* X, 125.3.4.5.

8. *Ṛgveda* V, 84.

9. A convenient collection of all *smṛti* references to *strīdharma* is provided in Sadhu Charan Prasad, *Dharmaśāstrasaṅgraha* [Sanskrit and Hindī], section 13, 209–22.

10. English translation by I. Julia Leslie.

11. *Manusmṛti* 5, 150–56; *Vyāsasmṛti* 2, 18–20.

12. *Manu* 2, 66–67.

13. *Manu* 5, 150–56. *Atrismṛti* 13, 3–137 goes one step further: like *Śūdras*, it says, women "fall" (i.e., they commit a sinful act) if they practice *japa*, *tapasya*, *samnyāsa*, mantras, *dhyāna*, or *devapūjā*.

14. *Manu* 9, 2–11.

15. See *Yājñavalkyasmṛti* 1, 70–82, for specifics, also *Manu* 11, 177–78.

16. *Manu* 9, 12 ff.

17. *Vyāsasmṛti* 2, 18–40.

18. *Aṅgirasasmṛti* 35–38.

19. See also *Vyāsasmṛti* 2, 38–40.

20. *Dakṣasmṛti*, 213.

21. In the *smṛtis*, *svayamvara* was the course of action to be taken if a father failed to find a husband for his daughter five years after she had attained puberty.

22. A. K. Majumdar, *Caitanya: His Life and Doctrine*, 290.

23. N. Chaudhuri, *Hinduism*, 286.

24. The most recent monograph of Āṇṭāl (also spelled Āndāl) containing a complete translation of her *Tiruppavai* and her *Nacciyar Tirumoli* (with notes) in contemporary idiomatic English is Vidyā Deheja, *Āṇṭāl and Her Path of Love*. The book also contains a good bibliography on *āḷvārs*.

25. See also D. Hudson, "Āṇṭāl Āḷvār: A Developing Hagiography."

26. See the traditional account of Mīrābāī's legend, together with a reproduction in the original languages of many of her poems and translations into English of a few of these, in Bankey Bihari, *Bhakta Mīrā*. See also: W. M. Callewaert, "The 'Earliest' Song of Mīrā (1503–1546)," with a good bibliography of editions of Mīrābāī's songs.

27. See "Śrī Ānandamayī," by Stephen (Umananda) Quong.

28. *Young India* (September 15, 1921).

29. *Young India* (October 21, 1926).

30. For detail and present-day discussion see A. Sharma, *Satī*. Also, Dorothy Stein, "Burning Widows, Burning Brides: The Perils of Daughterhood in India."

31. K. Klostermaier, "The Original Dakṣa Saga."

32. There is an extensive eyewitness description by J. Z. Holwell of a *satī* performed in 1742 in P. J. Marshall, *The British Discovery of Hinduism*, 94 ff.

33. G. H. R. Tillotson, "The Indian Travels of William Hodges."

34. D. Stein, "Burning Widows, Burning Brides," 483. *Spiegel Online* carried on September 21, 2006, a report about the *satī* of a 95-year-old woman that took place the previous day in Raipur, Madhya Pradesh.

35. For more detail, see Meena Khandelwal, *Women in Ochre Robes: Gendering Hindu Renunciation*, offering interesting narratives of Indian and non-Indian women renunciants. See also Catherine Ojha, "Feminine Asceticism in Hinduism: Its Tradition and Present Condition." Vishal Agarwal has compiled a website publication *Women in Hindu Dharma: A Tribute* (2004) for the Hindu Students Society of the University of Minnesota. www.hindurashtra.org/women-in-hinduism. A. Chowgule circulated on June 7, 2006, a news item about an *upanayana* of two girls performed at Shankar Krupa by Sudhakar Sharma of the Ārya Samāj of Bangalore.

36. March 12, 2005.

23. HINDU STRUCTURES OF THOUGHT: THE *ṢAḌDARŚANAS*

1. *Manusmṛti* II, 114 (Bühler's translation in *SBE* XXV).

2. *Manusmṛti* II, 156.

3. *Manusmṛti* II, 171.

4. Some interesting details are presented in a lighthearted manner by Kuppuswamy Sastri in a contribution to "The Library Movement" under the title "Kośavan ācāryah" (i.e., one who has a library is a teacher, or: a teacher is one who has a library). Reprinted in S. S. Janaki (ed.), *Kuppuswamy Sastri Birth Centenary Commemoration Volume*, Part I. This claim is also supported by the information on the scholastic engagement of the Śaṅkarācāryas past and present, in W. Cenkner, *A Tradition of Teachers*, especially chapter 4: "The Teaching Heritage After Śaṅkara," 84–106.

5. A popular maxim says: *Svadeśe pūjyate rājā vidvān sarvatrā pūjyate* i.e., while a king is honored in his own realm (only), a scholar is honored everywhere.

6. The thirty two different *vidyās* mentioned in the Upaniṣads can be seen as the beginning of different school traditions of Hinduism.

7. *Vādavāda*, a study of different viewpoints and polemics, became an integral part of traditional Indian learning. As T. R. V. Murti says: "polemic (*parapakṣanirākaraṇa*) is an integral part of each system" in "The Rise of the Philosophical Schools."

8. The text used as motto for this chapter provides the rationale for Śaṅkara to develop his extensive commentary on the *Brahmasūtras*.

9. Not only are a number of highly philosophical *stotras* ascribed to Śaṅkārācārya—hymns to different deities that are recited by ordinary Hindus in their daily worship—also the vernacular religious poetry of such favorites of contemporary Hindus like Tulsīdās, Kabīr, Sūrdās, Tukārām, and others is often highly speculative.

10. *Manusmṛti* II, 11.

11. *Tantravārttika* I, 3, 4.

12. S. Radhakrishnan mentions in *Indian Philosophy*, vol. 2, 20 n. 4, that Bhīmācārya in his *Nyāyakośa* included Sāṁkhya and Advaita Vedānta under the *nāstika*, i.e., unorthodox systems. He specifically quotes the sentence: *Māyāvādivedānti api nāstika eva paryavasāna sampadyate* ("In the end also the Vedāntin holding the opinion of illusionism [*māyāvāda*] turns out to be a *nāstika*, i.e., a non-believer in the Veda"). This sentence is not found in the fourth edition, revised by V. S. Abhyankar.

13. *Brahmasūtrabhāṣya* I, 1, 5.

14. S. Radhakrishnan, *Indian Philosophy*, vol. 2, 19.

15. Ibid., 20 ff.

16. Ibid., 24: "The six systems agree on certain essentials." In a footnote Radhakrishnan quotes Max Müller's statement—with reference to Vijñānabhikṣu, who in the fourteenth century attempted to bring about a unified *darśana*—"that there is behind the variety of the six systems a common fund of what may be called national or popular philosophy, a large *mānasa* lake of philosophical thought and language far away in the distant North and in the distant past, from which each thinker was allowed to draw for his own purposes." F. M. Müller, *The Six Systems of Indian Philosophy,* xvii. Radhakrishnan made a bold statement of the unity of Hindu philosophy in his popular *The Hindu View of Life*.

17. The term *darśana* has been common in India since the second century. Before that the term *anvīkṣikī*—later restricted to *logic* seems to have served. This issue is competently discussed by W. Halbfass in "Indien und die Geschichtsschreibung der Philosophie."

18. Thus the commentaries on Gaṅgeśa's *Tattvacintāmaṇi* were called *Didhiti*, *Gaṅgādhārī*, *Kārṣikā*, *Candrakālā*, *Nakṣatramālikā*, etc. See R. Thangasami Sarma, *Darśanamañjarī*, part 1, 64 ff.

19. The aforementioned author uses the titles *Nyāya*, *Vyākārana*, *Vedānta*, *Śiromaṇī*, showing that he is qualified in logic, grammar, and Vedānta.

20. Thus K. H. Potter, in his *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophy*, restricts selections of text extracts to those portions that have a parallel in contemporary analytic Western philosophy.

21. K. H. Potter has assembled a very extensive *Bibliography of Indian Philosophies*, with additions published in *JIPh*. For professionals the as yet incomplete *New Catalogus Catalogorum*, appearing from the University of Madras (thirteen volumes so far), is the most valuable bibliographic resource, listing not only published editions and translations but also manuscripts and their location.

22. The text has been published several times (e.g., Pune: Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute) and was translated into English, without *Śaṅkaradarśana*, more than a century ago by Cowell and Gough. This translation has been reprinted many times. See my translation of chapter 16: *Śaṁkaradarśana*, in *Brahmavidyā: The Adyar Library Bulletin*, vol. 61 (1997): 147–253.

23. See Kuppuswamy Sastri's introduction to his *Primer of Indian Logic*.

24. Ibid., 104.

25. D. Krishna et al. (eds.), *Saṃvāda: A Dialogue between Two Philosophical Traditions*.

24. HINDU LOGIC AND PHYSICS: NYĀYA-VAIŚEṢIKA

1. S. N. Dasgupta, *History of Indian Philosophy*, vol. 1, 282.

2. See the evidence offered by S. N. Dasgupta, Ibid.

3. It has only been preserved in a Chinese translation; this has been edited and translated and commented upon by H. Ui.

4. The best known may be the *Bhāṣāpariccheda* with *Siddhānta Muktāvalī* by Viśvanātha Nyāyapañcānana; ed. and trans. Swami Madhavananda.

5. K. Sastri, "Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika—Origin and Development," introduction to Kuppuswamy Sastri *Primer of Indian Logic*, 104.

6. In addition to sections on Nyāya and Vaiśeṣika in the major handbooks on Indian philosophy, besides the English-language works by S. N. Dasgupta and S. Radhakrishnan, the French works by L. Renou and J. Filliozat as well as M. Biardeau and S. Siauve, the German works by P. Deussen and E. Frauwallner, and the Sanskrit survey by Thiru Thanghasamy deserve consultation. The following specialized works will be found useful for more advanced students: D. H. H. Ingalls, *Materials for the Study of Navya-Nyāya Logic*; B. K. Matilal, *The Navya Nyāya Doctrine of Negation*; S. C. Chatterjee, *The Nyāya Theory of Knowledge*; U. Mishra, *The Conception of Matter According to Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika*. Some important and very informative essays on Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika are found in S. K. Maitra, *Fundamental Questions of Indian Metaphysics and Logic*. W. Halbfass, *On Being and What There Is*, subtitled "Classical Vaiśeṣika and the History of Indian Ontology," offers not only an up-to-date description of Vaiśeṣika research but also an incisive comparative study of ontology in the Greek and Indian contexts. An indispensable source is Sati Chandra Vidyabhusana, *A History of Indian Logic*. The most authentic representation of Nyāya and *Vaiśeṣika*—historically and doctrinally—is found in R. Thangaswami Sarma, *Darśanamañjarī*, Part I [in Sanskrit], which not only offers abundant information on the literature of Nyāya and *Vaiśeṣika* and their authors but also has many charts and diagrams illustrating the interconnection of works and concepts.

7. Early writers use the word Nyāya as a synonym with *Mīmāṃsā*.

8. *Arthaśāstra* 2, 30, a text often referred to in this connection. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* I, 9, 121, has the same enumeration of sciences. In this text the Goddess (after the churning of the Milk Ocean) is addressed as the embodiment of all knowledge (*vidyā*) specifically of *anvīkṣikī*, *trayī*, *vārta*, and *daṇḍanīti*.

9. Kuppuswamy Sastri, "Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika," 107.

10. *Vaiśeṣikardarśana* by Anatalal Thakur, ed. and trans. N. Sinha.

11. W. Halbfass in an excursus "The Concept of Viśeṣa and the name of the Vaiśeṣika System" in *On Being*, 269–75, offers alternative suggestions.

12. *Padārthadharmasaṅgraha*, no. 156, trans. Ganganatha Jha.

13. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 1, 363.

14. These "nine things" are: *buddhi*, *sukha*, *duḥkha*, *icchā*, *dveṣa*, *prayatna*, *dharma*, *adharma*, *samṣkāra*.

15. *Nyāyasūtra* with *Vatsyāyana Bhāṣya*, ed., trans., and comm. Ganganatha Jha.

16. *Maṇikana, A Navya-Nyāya Manual*, ed. and trans. E. R. Sreekrishna Sarma, introduction, xvii.

17. *Nyāya Sūtra* I, 1, 22.

18. Ibid. IV, 1, 66.

19. See G. Chemparathy, *An Indian Rational Theology: Introduction to Udayaṅa's Nyāyakusumāñjalī.*

20. Udayanācārya's *Nyāyakusumāñjali*, with the commentary of Haridāsa Bhaṭṭācārya, trans. E. B. Cowell.

21. *Nyāya-bhāṣya* IV, 1, 21 ff.

22. *Tarkabhāṣā of Keśava Miśra*, ed. and trans. Ganganatha Jha.

25. HINDU METAPHYSICS AND PSYCHOLOGY: SĀṀKHYA-YOGA

1. The best-known text of Haṭha Yoga is the *Haṭhayogapradīpika* by Svātmārāma Yogīndra.

2. 2. See chapter 21.

3. E.g., *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* II, 25, 13 ff.; III, 28.

4. A. B. Keith, *The Sāṁkhya System*, 18. The most comprehensive recent study of *Sāṁkhya* is G. J. Larsen, *Classical Sāṁkhya*. See also H. Bakker, "On the Origin of the *Sāṁkhya* Psychology" with an extensive bibliography. G. J. Larsen makes an important point in his essay "The Format of Technical Philosophical Writing in Ancient India: Inadequacies of Conventional Translations." Comprehensive information on the development of *Sāṁkhya* is contained in E. Frauwallner, *Geschichte der Indischen Philosophie*, vol. 1, 228 ff. and 472 ff.

5. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 1, 264.

6. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* III, 28.

7. The best edition and translation with ample comments is that by S. S. Suryanarayana Sastri. Also *Sāṁkhya Kārikā of Mahāmuni Śrī Īśvarakṛṣṇa*, with the commentary *Sārabodhinī* of Paṇḍit Sīvanārāyaṇa Śāstri with *Sāṅkhya Tattvakaumudī* of Vācaspati Miśra.

8. *Sāṁkhyadarśana*, ed. Pyarelal Prabhu Dayal and trans. J. R. Ballantyne.

9. Ed. and trans. under the title *The Yoga Upaniṣads*, by A. Mahadev Sastri and T. R. Srinivasa Ayyangar.

10. A good edition is that by Swāmi Vijñāna Āśrama. A complete English translation of Patañjali's *Yoga Sūtras* with Vyāsa's *Bhāṣya* and Vācaspati Miśra's *Tattva Vaicāradī* has been published by J. H. Woods in *HOS*, vol. 17. Students may find useful I. K. Taimni, *The Science of Yoga*, which offers the text and the translation of the *Yoga Sūtra* and a good running commentary that avoids the technicalities of the

classical commentaries. Valuable recent treatments of Yoga are: S. N. Dasgupta, *Yoga as Philosophy and Religion*; J. W. Hauer, *Der Yoga als Heilsweg*; G. Feuerstein, *The Philosophy of Classical Yoga*; G. M. Koelman, *Pātañjala Yoga: From Related Ego to Absolute Self*; I. Whicher, *The Integrity of Yoga*. Special problems connected with *Sāṁkhya*-Yoga are addressed in these recent papers: Swami Ranganathananda, "The Science of Consciousness in the Light of Vedānta and Yoga"; Mohan Singh, "Yoga and Yoga Symbolism"; S. Bhattacharya "The Concept of *Bideha* and *Prakṛti-Laya* in the *Sāṁkhya-Yoga* System"; C. T. Kenghe, "The Problem of the Pratyayasarga in *Sāṁkhya* and Its Relation with Yoga"; K. Werner, "Religious Practice and Yoga in the Time of the Vedas, Upaniṣads and Early Buddhism"; G. Oberhammer, "Das Transzendenzverständnis des Samkhyistischen Yoga als Strukturprinzip seiner Mystik"; G. Oberhammer, "Die Gotteserfahrung in der yogischen Meditation"; M. Eliade's *Yoga: Immortality and Freedom* has become a classic in its own right: it not only describes Patañjali Yoga but compares it to other phenomena and has an exhaustive bibliography of works up to 1964. Controversial new ideas on classical Yoga are advanced in G. Oberhammer, *Strukturen Yogischer Meditation*.

11. *Tejobindu Upaniṣad* VI, 107.

12. P. Hacker, "Śaṅkara der Yogin und Śaṅkara der Advaitin: Einige Beobachtungen." A full translation of the work has been made by James Legget.

13. *Sāṁkhya Kārikā*, 1.

14. This is the traditional interpretation given to *duḥkhatraya*.

15. *Sāṁkhya Kārikā*, 2.

16. Ibid., 18.

17. Ibid., 8.

18. Ibid., 63.

19. Ibid., 67.

20. *Yoga Sūtra* I, 5 ff.

21. Ibid. I, 23 ff.

22. Ibid. II, 5 ff.

23. According to Hatha Yoga the *utthita padmāsana* confers superhuman vision and cures troubles of the respiratory tract; *śupta padmāsana* cures illnesses of the digestive organs, *bhadrāsana* activates the mind, *dhastricāsana* regulates body temperature, cures fever, and purifies the blood, *guptāṅgāsana* cures venereal diseases, and so forth. There are centers in India, like the Yoga Research Institute at Lonavla, in which medical research is done on the effects of yoga on body and mind.

24. *Yoga Sūtra* II, 54.

25. Ibid. III, 1–3.

26. Ibid. III, 16 ff.

27. Ibid. IV, 34: *puruṣārthaśūnyānām guṇānām pratiprasavaḥ / kaivalam svarūpa pratiṣṭhā vā citiśaktir iti*.

28. These notions find a surprising parallel in contemporary scientific thought. See Prigogine-Stenger, *Order Out of Chaos*.

26. HINDU THEOLOGY, OLD AND NEW: MĪMĀṂSĀ AND VEDĀNTA

1. B. G. Apte (ed.), *Śābarabhāṣya*; English translation: Ganganatha Jha.

2. Prabhākara Miśra wrote a voluminous subcommentary to the *Śābarabhāṣya* called *Bṛhati*, S. K. Ramanatha Sastri (ed.), Kumārila Bhaṭṭa wrote the famous *Ślokavārtika*, another subcommentary on the first part of it, as well as the *Tantravārttika* and the *Tupṭīkā*, subcommentaries on the later parts, S. K. Ramanatha Sastri (ed.); Ganganatha Jha has published complete English translations of the *Ślokavārtika* and the *Tantravārtika*.

3. S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 1, 371. Concerning the influence of Mīmāṃsā, Ganganatha Jha, *Pūrva-Mīmāṃsā in Its Sources*, chapter 33, has some interesting things to say. An important source for *Mīmāṃsā* studies is the seven-volume *Mīmāṃsākośa*, Kevalanda Sarasvatī (ed.). Important and relevant observations on this issue are also found in M. M. Deshpande, "Bhāṣā," chapter 22 of S. Mittal and G. Thursby (eds.), *The Hindu World*.

4. As W. Cenkner in *A Tradition of Teachers* reports, the study of Mīmāṃsā is one of the subjects that students in the schools associated with the present Śaṅkara *maṭhas* have to take. See also F. Staal (ed.), *A Reader on the Sanskrit Grammarians* and K. Kunjunni Raja, *Indian Theories of Meaning*. See also H. G. Coward and K. Kunjunni Raja (eds.), *The Philosophy of the Grammarians*, vol. 5 of *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies*.

5. *Jaimini Sūtras* I, 1, 2: *codanalakṣano'artho dharmaḥ*.

6. Ibid. I, 2, 1.

7. *Śābarabhāṣya* I, 1, 22: "There can be no creator of this relation because no soul is cognized as such by any of the means of cognition. If there had been such a creator, he could not have been forgotten." Cf. also: Kumārila Bhaṭṭa, *Ślokavārttika* XVI, 41 ff.

8. Ganganatha Jha, *Pūrva-Mīmāṃsā in Its Sources*, 178 ff.

9. *Jaimini Sūtras* VI, 1, 6 ff.

10. Ganganatha Jha, *Pūrva Mīmāṃsā*, 264 ff.

11. *Jaimini Sūtras* IV, 3, 15.

12. *Śābarabhāṣya* VI, 1, 1.

13. *Nyāyaratnākara*: "Liberation must consist in the destruction of the present body and the nonproduction of the future body." Quoted by G. Jha, *Pūrva-Mīmāṃsā*, 38.

14. *Prakāraṇapañcika*, *Tattvāloka*, 156.

15. O. Gächter, *Hermeneutics and Language in Pūrvamīmāṃsā: A Study in Śābara Bhāṣya* with bibliographic references to both Eastern and Western authors.

16. H. G. Coward, *The Sphoṭa Theory of Language: A Philosophical Analysis* with extensive bibliography. The complete text has been edited by Prof. K. V. Abhyankar and Acharya V. P. Limaye in the University of Poona Sanskrit and Prakrit Series.

17. Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, 589.

18. According to S. K. Belvalkar, *Shree Gopal Basu Mallik Lectures on Vedānta Philosophy*, part 1, chapter 4: "Vedānta in the Brahmasūtras," (142), Jaimini, the author of the *Mīmāṃsāsūtra*, wrote a *Śarīrakasūtra* that sought to harmonize the teaching of

the *Sāmaveda Upaniṣads*, particularly the *Chāndogya Upaniṣad*, and this sutra was incorporated within and forms the main part of the present text of the *Brahma Sūtra*.

19. Among the widely recognized *Vedāntācāryas* are: Śaṅkara, Rāmānuja, Madhva, Vallabha, Bhāskara, Yadavaprakāśa, Keśava, Nīlakaṇṭha, Vijñānabhikṣu and Baladeva. They are the founders of separate branches of Vedānta philosophy. There are several comparative studies of the different schools of Vedānta such as V. S. Ghate, *The Vedānta* ; O. Lacombe, *L'absolu selon le Vedānta*.

20. Cf. Ramdas Gaur, *Hindutva*, 591 ff.

21. Other commentaries interpret Vedānta in the light of sectarian dogma under the names of Dvaitādvaita (Nimbārka), Śuddhādvaita (Vallabha), Acintyabhedābheda (Baladeva), and so forth.

22. Several attempts have been made to establish an earlier birth date for Śaṅkara: some Western scholars assign him to the seventh century CE, some Indian scholars believe that he was born in the sixth century BCE. See note 29.

23. A complete list with a critical analysis is given in S. K. Belvalkar, *Lectures on Vedānta Philosophy*, 218 ff. See also: R. T. Vyas, "Roots of Śaṅkara's Thought."

24. Swami Nikhilananda has brought out an English paraphrase of the *Māṇḍukyopaniṣad with Gauḍapāda's Kārikā and Śaṅkara's Commentary*. See also T. Vetter, "Die Gauḍapādīya-Kārikās: Zur Entstehung und zur Bedeutung von (A)dvaita."

25. *Maitrī Upaniṣad* VI, 15; *Muṇḍaka* II, 2, 8.

26. Contained in H. R. Bhagavat (ed.), *Minor Works of Śrī Śaṅkarācārya*, pp. 374–402.

27. Several complete English translations of the *Śaṅkarabhāṣya* are available: G. Thibaut (*SBE*, vols. 34 and 38); Swami Gambhirananda (Calcutta: Advaita Ashrama, 1965) makes use of some major classical commentaries. P. Deussen's German translation is still of importance. Out of the numerous publications dealing with Śaṅkara and his Advaita Vedānta a few may be mentioned: S. G. Mudgal, *Advaita of Śaṅkara: A Reappraisal*; Haripada Chakraborti, "Śaṅkārācarya," in *Asceticism in Ancient India*; D. N. Lorenzen, "The Life of Śaṅkarācārya," in F. Clothey and J. B. Long (eds.), *Experiencing Śiva*; P. Hacker, "Eigentümlichkeiten der Lehre und Terminologie Śaṅkaras: Avidyā, Nāmarūpa, Māyā, Īśvara" and *Vivarta: Studien zur Geschichte der illusionistischen Kosmologie und Erkenntnistheorie der Inder*; E. Deutsch, *Advaita Vedānta: A Philosophical Reconstruction* and E. Deutsch and J. A. B. van Buitenen (eds.), *A Source Book of Advaita Vedānta*. See also, R. V. Das, *Introduction to Śaṅkara*; K. S. Murty, *Revelation and Reason in Advaita Vedānta*. Authoritative and important studies on various aspects of Advaita Vedānta are also contained in the essays by S. K. Maitra, *Fundamental Questions of Indian Metaphysics and Logic*, and H. G. Coward (ed.), *Studies in Indian Thought: Collected Papers of Prof. T. R. V. Murti*. The most exhaustive survey of the source literature for Advaita Vedānta is R. Thangaswami, *A Bibliographical Survey of Advaita Vedānta Literature* [in Sanskrit].

28. Sureśvara in his *Naiṣkarmyasiddhi* refers to Śaṅkara as "the source of pure knowledge . . . and of illumination," calling him "omniscient," and "the guru of gurus," comparing him to Śiva himself: Śaṅkara is one of the popular names of Śiva. The *Naiṣkarmyasiddhi*, K. K. Venkatachari (ed. and trans.). For Sureśvara's teaching and his

relationship to Śaṅkara see the introduction to R. Balasubramanian (ed. and trans.), *The Taittirīyopaniṣad Bhāṣya-Vārtika of Sureśvara*.

29. A. Nataraja Aiyer and S. Lakshminarasimha Sastri, the authors of *The Traditional Age of Śrī Śaṅkarāchārya and the Maths*, not only provide the lists of all the successors to Śaṅkarācārya relying on eminent scholars who "have already proved that the date of Śaṅkara is 509–477 BC" (preface) but also bring excerpts from court cases that were initiated in the 20th century in order to settle the claims of candidates and counter-candidates to some *gaddis* (headships of *maṭhas*).

30. For biographical details see M. Yamunacarya, *Rāmānuja's Teachings in His Own Words*, 1–39; also J. B. Carman, *The Theology of Rāmānuja: An Essay in Interreligious Understanding*, chapter 2: "Rāmānuja's Life." For Rāmānuja speculative theology takes second place to active worship and self-surrender to Viṣṇu, described before in the context of the *bhaktimārga*. While Śaṅkara sees the highest human ideal in *saṃnyāsa* and objectless meditation, Śrī Vaiṣṇavism is family oriented and lays great importance on image worship and temple ceremonial.

31. See: K. D. Bharadwaj, *The Philosophy of Rāmānuja*; A. Sharma, *Viśiṣṭādvaita Vedānta: A Study*.

32. R. Balasubramanian, former head of the S. Radhakrishnan Institute for the Advanced Study in Philosophy at the University of Madras, which under T. M. P. Mahadevan's leadership had become the leading modern scholarly center for Advaita studies, responds to this criticism in *Some Problems in the Epistemology and Metaphysics of Rāmānuja*.

33. S. N. Dasgupta, *HIPh*, vol. 3, 471.

34. The last verse of the *Vedāntasūtra* meaning "no return, on account of the scripture words."

35. *Rāmānujabhāṣya* , G. Thibaut (trans.), *SBE*, vol. 48. Text edition: *Śrī Bhagavad Rāmānuja Granthamālā*, P. B. Annangaracharya Swami (ed.).

36. For details see: B. N. K. Sarma, *Madhva's Teachings in His Own Words*, 1–26, and also the major works of the same author: *Philosophy of Śrī Madhvācārya*; *A History of the Dvaita School of Vedānta and Its Literature*, 2 vols. A thorough study of Madhva's thought: S. Siauve, *La doctrine de Madhva*. See also: I. Puthiadam, *Viṣṇu the Ever Free: A Study of the Madhva Concept of God*.

37. Text and French translation with introduction and notes in: S. Siauve, *La voie vers la connaissance de Dieu sélon l'Aṇuvyākhyāna de Madhva*.

38. *Aṇuvyākhyāna*, 13.

39. *Mahānārāyaṇopaniṣad*, 1 ff.

40. R. Raghavendracharya (ed.), *Madhva Brahmasūtrabhāṣya with several commentaries*; S.S. Rao (trans.), *Madhva's Commentary on the Brahmasūtras*.

41. Swami Nikhilananda (ed. and trans.), *Ātmabodha*; Swami Jagagananda (ed. and trans.), *Upadeśasahasrī*; Swami Madhavananda (ed. and trans.), *Vivekacudāmaṇī*.

42. Swami Nikhilananda (ed. and trans.), *Vedāntasāra*.

43. Swami Swahananda (ed. and trans.), *Pañcadaśī*. Vidyāraṇya is assumed to be identical with Mādhavācārya, the author of the famous *Sarvadarśanasaṃgraha*, head of

Śṛṅgerī Maṭha from 1377 to 1386. The nineteenth-century work *Vedāntasāgara* [Hindī] by Swami Niścaldas enjoys a very great reputation in India. A Sanskrit version of this work has also been published.

44. S. S. Suryanarayana Sastri (ed., trans., and comm.), *Vedāntaparibhāṣa*.

45. S. S. Raghavacar (ed. and trans.), *Vedārthasaṅgraha*.

46. Swami Adidevananda (ed. and trans.), *Yatīndramatadīpikā*.

47. V. Krsnamacarya (ed. and trans.), *Vedāntakarikāvalī*.

48. English translation by M. S. Rajagopala Aiyangar.

49. P. Nagaraja Rao (ed. and trans.), *Vādāvalī*.

50. Many of the aforementioned classics of Vedānta, especially the minor works of the great *ācāryas*, are being printed today in India with vernacular translations and commentaries in large editions by popular publishing houses. It is quite amazing to see the widespread interest in this philosophically quite sophisticated literature, which presupposes familiarity with the technical terminology of the medieval Vedānta tradition. It would be hard to find anything comparable in any Western country.

27. HINDUISM AND BUDDHISM

1. For more detail on the Buddha's life and teaching see K. Klostermaier, *Buddhism: A Short Introduction*.

2. P. V. Kane, *HDhS*, vol. 5, part 2 , 913 ff.

3. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* III, 18.

4. *Ślokavārttika* I, 3, 7, Swami Dvarika Dass Sastri (ed.), Ganganatha Jha (trans.).

5. *Tattvasaṅgraha of Śāntarakṣita with the Commentary by Kāmalaśīla*, 2 vols., Swami Dvarika Dass Sastri (ed.), G. Jha (trans.).

6. *Vedāntasūtras* II, 2, 18–32.

7. *Śaṅkarabhāṣya* II, 2, 18–27 is directed against the Sarvāstivādis, 28–31a against the Vijñānavādis, and 31b–32 against the Śūnyavādis.

8. Trans. G. Thibaut, *SBE*, vol. 34, 427 ff.

9. *Selections from the Work of Swami Vivekananda*, 366.

10. Ibid., 494.

11. *Young India*, November 24, 1927.

12. Ibid.

13. Ibid.

14. *Young India*, December 8, 1927.

15. *Discovery of India*, 117.

16. Ibid., 120.

17. Jawaharlal Nehru, *Speeches 1953–1957*, 430 ff.: "Valedictory Address at the Seminar on Buddhism," New Delhi, November 29, 1956.

18. Marie Seton, *Panditji: A Portrait of Jawaharlal Nehru*, 454.

19. B. R. Ambedkar, *The Untouchables*.

20. D. Keer, *Dr. Ambedkar: Life and Mission*, 497.

21. Chandra Bharill, *Social and Political Ideas of B. R. Ambedkar*, 245.

22. Ibid., 256.

23. Ibid., 257.

24. *Journal of the Mahabodhi Society*, December 1959, 353.

25. Vir Savarkar, "Essentials of Hindutva," 12.

26. Ibid., 13.

27. Ibid., 15.

28. HINDUISM AND CHRISTIANITY IN INDIA

1. A. Chowgule, *Christianity in India*, 1 ff.

2. Much historical evidence supporting the historicity of the contents of the Acts of St. Thomas has been collected by Fr. Herman D'Souza, *In the Steps of St. Thomas*.

3. H. D'Souza mentions some fakirs in Sindh "who profess themselves as followers of Thuma Bhagat, i.e., Thomas the Saint. They practice a number of Christian rites and possess a book which they call the Gospel of St. Mathew," 17.

4. Quoted in S. C. Neill, *A History of Christianity in India: The Beginnings to* AD 1707, 146.

5. Ibid.

6. Sītā Ram Goel, *Catholic Ashrams: Samnyasis or Swindlers*, uses the example of de Nobili and his mission methods as an argument for his thesis that the indigenization of Christianity in India amounts to nothing but fraud and deception.

7. Early Protestant reformers, like Martin Luther, wrote about Judaism and Islam, the two non-Christian religions present in Europe at that time, albeit in a negative and defensive way.

8. The British East India Company was chartered in 1600 to carry out trade in India. It was dissolved when in 1874 the British Crown took over government in "British India." The Danish East India Company was chartered in 1616. It acquired a small strip of coastal land south of Madras (Tranquebar) and the settlement of Serampur (Śrīrāmpur) near Calcutta in 1755. Both were sold to the British East India Company in 1845.

9. Heinrich Ziegenbalg became the author of the first Tamil grammar in a European language. It was written in Latin and published in 1716 in Halle. He also translated three Tamil works into German.

10. It was finally edited and published by the Dutch Indologist Wilhelm Caland in 1926 at Amsterdam.

11. Quoted in: H. von Glasenapp, *Das Indienbild deutscher Denker*, 167.

12. Hans-Werner Gensichen, who devoted much energy to making Ziegenbalg's accomplishments known, calls it "an early example of a dialogue that plays out in the mutual readiness of an encounter on the human level" and that "attempts to understand the other as he understands himself." H. W. Gensichen, *Invitatio ad Fraternitatem*, 23 (my translation).

13. W. Carey, together with his entire family and some companions, had tried to embark for Calcutta in 1793 to begin missionary work there. Being without a royal permit, he was taken off the boat. A month later, having secured a royal permit from the king of Denmark, Frederick VI, he sailed on a Danish vessel and secured the protection of Colonel Bie, the Danish Governor, a friend of the famous German missionary W. Schwartz in Tranquebar. Ironically, it was the salary that the British East India Company paid to Carey in his capacity as instructor in Bengali and Sanskrit at the company college in Calcutta from 1801 onward that kept the Serampore enterprise alive.

14. For details see *The Story of Serampore and Its College*, published by the Council of Serampore College, n.d.

15. Quoted in R. D. Boyd, *An Introduction to Indian Christian Theology*, 41.

16. Ibid., 55.

17. E.g., the Kristakula Ashram in Tirupati (Andhra Pradesh), the Christavashram in Manganam (Kerala), and the Kristaseva Ashram in Pune (Mahārāṣṭra).

18. F. Heiler wrote a biography while Sundar Singh was still alive: *Sundar Singh: Apostel des Ostens und des Westens*. See also: A. J. Appasamy, *Sundar Singh: A Biography*.

19. K. L. Sheshagiri Rao, *Mahatma Gandhi and C. F. Andrews: A Study in Hindu-Christian Dialogue*.

20. Yisu Das Tiwari's youngest son, Dr. Ravi Tiwari, president of Serampore College, recently published a volume, *Yisu Das: The Witness of a Convert*, with a biography of Yisu Das, some autobiographical writings, and tributes by friends and colleagues.

21. J. N. Farquhar initiated a multivolume series, The Religious Life of India, which began appearing from 1920 onward from the (YMCA) Association Press in Calcutta, and which dealt with a great many different castes and sects in a scholarly manner. Justin Abbot produced a series, Poet Saints of Maharashtra, consisting of texts and translations of major Mahratti religious classics, published from 1926 onward in Poona by the Scottish Mission Industries Press in Poona. One of the most successful Christian enterprises in India has been the educational system established by various churches in the major centers. There are much sought-after Christian high schools and university colleges in Delhi, Kolkata, Mumbai, Chennai, and other cities frequented by a majority of Hindu students.

22. For a good summary see S. Wesley Ariarajah, *Hindus and Christians: A Century of Protestant Ecumenical Thought*, 17–31.

23. Ibid., 21.

24. Ibid., 20.

25. See ibid., 52–88.

26. R. Boyd, *An Introduction*, 163. See also: D. A. Thangasamy, *The Theology of Chenchiah*.

27. R. Boyd, *An Introduction*, 184.

28. Eric E. Sharpe, *Not to Destroy but to Fulfil*, 272 ff.

29. Thus, already, Warren Hastings, in a letter written in 1784, shortly after the appearance of the first English translation, had remarked that the *Bhagavadgītā* represented "a theology accurately corresponding with that of the Christian dispensation, and most powerfully illustrating its fundamental doctrines." Quoted in E. Sharpe, *The Universal Gita*, 8.

30. His autobiographical essay *My Theological Quest* appeared as the first booklet in the Indian Christian Thought Series from the CISRS Bangalore 1963.

31. Originally published in 1922 by Oxford University Press, it was reprinted by Motilal Banarsidass in Delhi in 1967. Farquhar also is the author of *Modern Religious Movements in India*, the first systematic attempt to describe nineteenth- and twentieth-century developments of Hinduism in an objective, sympathetic way. Published originally in 1914 by Oxford University Press, it was also reprinted by Motilal Banarsidass in 1967.

32. Cf. E. Sharpe, *Not to Destroy*. Farquhar, as previously mentioned, also initiated the series Religious Life of India.

33. Thus vol. 7, 3 and 4, are devoted to "The Christian and the Hindu Views Concerning Man," vol. 10, 1 to "Concepts of Love and Non-Violence," vol. 10, 3 to "Hindu and Christian Concepts of Ultimate Truth," with Christian as well as Hindu contributions in each.

34. For details see Ariarajah, *Hindus and Christians*, 133–165.

35. German translation *Hindus vor dem universalen Christus*.

36. For a report see *Religion and Society* 16, 2 (June 1969): 69–88.

37. *Viṣṇu-Nārāyaṇa: Texte zur indischen Gottesmystik*, Jena 1917.

38. Thus P. Lochhaas of the Lutheran Church of America. This and other such quotes can be found in Steven Gelberg, "Krishna and Christ: ISKCON's Encounter with Christianity in America," in H. Coward (ed.), *Hindu-Christian Dialogue*, 138–61.

39. It is interesting to note that Christian "de-programming" of youths who had joined the new religious movements was considered successful if they ate meat, drank liquor, and engaged in extramarital sexual relations.

40. References and more materials in S. Gelberg, "Krishna and Christ."

41. "Hindu Influence on Christian Spiritual Practice," in H. Coward (ed.), *Hindu-Christian Dialogue*, 198 ff. See also K. Klostermaier, "Samnyāsa: A Christian Way of Life in Today's India?" and "Hindu-Christian Dialogue: Revisiting the Tannirpalli Trinity's Original Vision."

42. The proceedings were published in *Hindu-Christian Dialogue: Perspectives and Encounters*. Motilal Banarsidass has published an Indian edition.

43. Under the joint editorship of Harold Coward and Anand Amaldass, the first issue appeared in Autumn 1988. It contains a major article by Coward: "Hindu-Christian Dialogue: A Review," 1–5, with a rich bibliography.

44. *Catholic Ashrams: Samnyasis or Swindlers?* The second, enlarged edition (1994) contains an exchange of open letters between Swami Devananda and Bede Griffith 1987–89.

45. Various websites submit the writings of American Hinduism scholars to critique from a Hindu standpoint.

46. In the essay "The Future of Hindu-Christian Dialogue," in H. Coward (ed.), *Hindu–Christian Dialogue*, 262–74, I have expressed myself on this issue in greater length.

47. In an Internet communication dated April 27, 2004, *Indians against Christian Aggression www.christreview.org*, vivid complaints are voiced against "The Hijacking of Hinduism," citing some quite outrageous instances of perverting Hindu scriptural texts and symbols.

29. HINDUS AND MUSLIMS IN INDIA

1. See the report in *India Today* of April 8, 2002 "Secular Nemesis: A Communal Rage is Sweeping India."

2. See also the article "Islam in South Asia" by Peter Hardy in *ER*, vol. 7, 390–404.

3. E. C. Sachau, *Alberuni's India*, 22.

4. Riffat Hassan, "The Basis for a Hindu-Muslim Dialogue and Steps in That Direction from a Muslim Perspective," 129.

5. See also the article "Kabīr" by Charlotte Vaudeville in *ER* vol. 8, 226–27.

6. Muhammed Hedayetullah, *Kabīr: The Apostle of Hindu-Muslim Unity*. Kabīr scholarship has flourished in the last half century and as a result many doubts have been thrown on the authenticity of many sayings popularly attributed to Kabit. C. Vaudeville suspended indefinitely the projected second volume to her *Kabir I* (Oxford University Press) because of the uncertainty of authorship of many Kabīr texts.

7. Ibid., preface, xiii.

8. Quoted in Bikrama Jit Hasrat, *Dārā Shikūḥ: Life and Works*, 189.

9. Ibid, xxvi.

10. R. C. Majumdar, H. C. Raychaudhuri, K. Datta, *An Advanced History of India*, 728. See also the article "Sayyid Ahmad Khan" by C. W. Troll in *ER*, vol. 1, 155–57.

11. Rajmohan Gandhi, *Eight Lives: A Study of the Hindu-Muslim Encounter*, 19.

12. *Aligarh Institute Gazette*, June 12, 1897, quoted in R. Gandhi, *Eight Lives*, 45.

13. Rajmohan Gandhi, *Eight Lives*, 123.

14. The name *Pakistan* has been explained in several ways. Apparently it was the invention of some Indian students in England. According to some it means "Land of the Pure"; according to others it is a composite of the initial letters of the provinces out of which it was formed.

15. Volume 3 of the Gandhi Series, edited and published by Anand T. Hingorani.

16. Z. Haq, *Prophet Muhammad in Hindu Scripture*, 2.

17. *Dārā Shukūḥ: Life and Works*.

18. Although even Hasrat misquotes some titles of Sanskrit works, he is exceptionally well informed about Hinduism.

19. Azad Faruqi, *Sufism and Bhakti*, 44.

20. Ibid., 157.

21. http:/hinduforce.4t.com.

22. www.satyamevajayate.info.

30. HINDU REFORMS AND REFORMERS

1. I am thinking specifically of the Nātha movements, such as the Gorakhnātha and the Kabīr Panth, the Sikh community founded by Gurū Nānak and similar groups. See G. H. Wescott, *Kabīr and the Kabīrpanth*; M. A. Macauliffe, *The Sikh Religion: Its Gurus, Sacred Writings and Authors*, and more recent works by H. McLeod.

2. *India Hindu and India Christian*, 12.

3. Ibid., 40 ff. See also C. T. Jackson, *The Oriental Religions and American Thought*, chapter 5, "The Missionary View."

4. *Chips from a German Workshop*, vol. 2, 313.

5. Lecture in Westminster Abbey, December 3, 1873.

6. The first major work was J. N. Farquhar, *Modern Religious Movements in India*. Since then countless studies have been produced by Indian and foreign scholars. See N. S. Sarma, *Hindu Renaissance*.

7. *Complete Works of Swāmi Vivekānanda*, vol. 3, 151.

8. Ibid., vol. 5, 152.

9. S. C. Crawford, *Ram Mohan Roy: Social, Political and Religious Reform in Nineteenth-Century India*; see also the entry "Roy, Ram Mohan" by D. L. Haberman in *ER*, vol. 12, 479–80. As a source still indispensable is M. C. Parekh, *The Brahmo Samāj*.

10. A party of orthodox Brahmins, in an attempt to get the law rescinded, traveled to London to state their case; Ram Mohan Roy also journeyed there, dying in Bristol in 1833.

11. Important contemporary documents are collected in J. K. Majumdar, *Raja Rammohun Roy and Progressive Movements in India, Volume 1. A Selection from Records (1775–1845)*, 19, reproducing the list of names of those who voted for and against the abolition of *satī*.

12. The cover story of *India Today*, June 15, 1986, 26–33, "Female Infanticide: Born to Die." Also child marriages are still quite common in India as the feature article, "Wedding of the Dolls," (74–77) in the same magazine demonstrates.

13. See M. C. Parekh, *The Brahmo Samāj*.

14. The text with English translation by Hem Chandra Sarkar appeared as a centenary edition.

15. See M. C. Parekh, *Brahmarshi Keshub Chander Sen*.

16. See Lala Lajpat Rai, *The Ārya Samāj*. Major work on Dāyānanda Sarasvatī and the Ārya Samāj has recently been done by J. Jordens, whose findings are apt to revise some of the prevailing impressions. Dāyānanda's main work is *Satyārtha Prakāśa*, published first in the Aryan Era year of 1972949060 and reprinted many times (English translation Allahabad: Kal Press, 1947).

17. D. G. Tendulkar, *Mahātmā*, 8 vols.; Suresh Ram, *Vinoba and His Mission*.

18. *Young India*, October 6, 1921.

19. *Ibid*.

20. Modhi Prasad, *Kaka Kalelkar: A Gandhian Patriarch*, with a foreword by Lal Bahadur Shastri, 22.

21. The source of all books about Rāmakrishna is the voluminous *Gospel of Rāmakrishna*, an English rendering of the transcript by "M" of all the utterances of Rāmakrishna over many years. See Swāmi Nirvedānanda, "Śrī Rāmakrishna and Spiritual Renaissance," published by the Ramakrishna Mission Institute of Culture in Calcutta. There is a large amount of literature informing about the main figures of the Rāmakrishna Mission and its activities published by this movement. Jeffrey Kripal aroused the ire not only of members of the Rāmakrishna Order by his Freudian reading of the "Gospel" in his *Kālī's Child*.

22. *Collected Works*, vol. 3, 139.

23. *Ibid*. 27–29.

24. The Śrī Aurobindo Ashram Pondichéry has published all the writings of Śrī Aurobindo and informs through numerous magazines, films, and so forth also about its present activities.

25. An informative survey of the work of S. Radhakrishnan, together with an autobiographical sketch is given in: P. Schilpp (ed.), *The Philosophy of Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan*. His son, the historian S. Gopal, wrote a biography that is intimate as well as scholarly: *Radhakrishnan: A Biography*.

26. *Bunch of Thoughts*, 123.

27. *The Collected Works of Śrī Ramaṇa Maharṣi*, 8 vols., A. Osborne (ed.). A. Osborne, *Ramaṇa Maharṣi and the Path of Self-Knowledge*. See also Sing Kamath *Śrī Maharṣi: A Short Life-sketch*, with many photographs.

28. For his works consult the bibliography. About him see the brief biography of his successor, Svāmi Cidananda, *Light Fountain*, and K. S. Ramaswami Sastri, *Sivananda—The Modern World Prophet*.

29. The numerous and often reprinted books by Jiddu Krishnamurti are transcripts of his public addresses and questions and answers noted down by his numerous followers. One of the most popular is his *The First and Last Freedom* with a foreword by Aldous Huxley. One of the last, his *The Awakening of Intelligence*, Avon Books, 1976, contains a by now famous interview with physicist David Bohm. About him see Pupul Jayakar, *J. Krishnamurti: A Biography*.

30. See G. Das Gupta, *Mother As Revealed to Me*.

31. See *Autobiography of a Yogi* and the magazines of the Yoga Fellowship.

32. Martin Eban (ed.), *Maharishi the Guru: The Story of Maharishi Mahesh Yogi*. See also the numerous periodical publications of this movement.

33. See *Back to Godhead*, the magazine of the Hare Krishna Movement, which gives in each issue several times complete lists of the works of the founder guru. The movement has undergone severe stresses after the demise of its founder and was virtually split in half by the formation of the ISKCON Reform Movement (IRM), which claims the allegiance of a fair number of ISKCON centers.

34. His works have been collected under the title *Wanderings in the Himalayas*.

35. See his twelve-volume commentary on the *Bhagavadgītā* and his monthly publication, *Tapovan Prasad*, as well as the pamphlets issued in connection with the Sandeepany Sadhananlaya.

36. See *Satya Sai*, 6 vols.

37. H. Sunder Rao, "The Two Babas."

38. "Call to Revive Hinduism: Viswa Sammelan," *Times of India*, December 10, 1977.

39. Cf. M. N. Roy, *Materialism*. In the foreword to the second edition he wrote: "Since this book was written in 1934 and first published in 1940 religious revivalism has gained ground in philosophical thought. Mystic and irrationalistic tendencies have become more and more pronounced even in social philosophy and political theories. These developments are the symptoms of an intellectual crisis." See also his *New Humanism*.

40. P. C. Chatterji, *Secular Values for Secular India*.

41. *Illustrated Weekly of India* February 5, 1965. It must be kept in mind that this English-language weekly does not necessarily reflect the opinion of the traditional non-English-speaking Hindus.

42. *Seminar* 64, December 1964.

43. S. K. Haldar, Ibid., 20 ff.

44. J. D. M. Derret, *The Death of a Marriage Law: Epitaph for the Rishis*. A. S. Altekar blames this opposition on a misunderstanding: "This utter and pitiable ignorance of the real nature of Hinduism is at the root of the amazing opposition, which measures like the Hindu Code have evoked in the recent past even in educated circles. . . . Our ancient *rishis* never expected that the rules that they had laid down would be regarded as binding forever by their descendants. They themselves have pointed out the necessity of making periodical changes in them." ("Hinduism a Static Structure or a Dynamic Force?" in *Nehru Abhinandan Granth*, 421 ff.) Altekar refers here to *Manusmṛti* IV, 60.

45. As Peter Robb ("The Challenge of Gau Mata: British Policy and Religious Change in India, 1880–1916") has shown, the agitation against cow slaughter, which is a major political issue in today's India, has a rather long history.

46. V. K. Sinha, "Secularization."

47. T. N. Madan, "Secularism in Its Place."

48. See also P. C. Upadhaya, "The Politics of Indian Secularism."

49. See, e.g., the article "Nice People, Nasty Mood" by Madhu Jain.

50. More on this issue in: K. Klostermaier, "Truth and Tolerance in Contemporary Hinduism."

31. MAHĀTMĀ GANDHI: A TWENTIETH-CENTURY *KARMAYOGI*

1. The best and most detailed biography is D. G. Tendulkar: *Mahātmā: Life and Work of M. K. Gandhi*, with a preface by Pandit Nehru, 8 vols. The Government of India published Gandhi: Collected Works in 90 vols. 1958–86.

2. Several editions from Navajivan Publishing House, the literary heir of Gandhi's writings. It also appeared in a Penguin edition in 1986.

3. *Mahātmā* I, 39.

4. Ibid., 44.

5. Ibid., 71.

6. *Autobiography*, 365.

7. See *Mahātmā* I, 75–78.

8. *A Guide to Health*, Madras, 1930, 3: "The relation of the body and the mind is so intimate that if either of them got out of order, the whole system would suffer. Hence it follows, that a pure character is the foundation of health in the real sense of the term, and we may say that all evil thoughts and evil passions are but different forms of disease."

9. *Mahātmā* I, 103.

10. *Hind Swarāj or Indian Home Rule* appeared first serialized in *Indian Opinion*. As a separate booklet it appeared in Bombay in 1910. Edition used: Navajivan, 1944.

11. Gokhale on Gandhi: "A purer, a nobler, a braver and a more exalted spirit has never moved on this earth." *Mahātmā* I, 137.

12. Quoted according to the Navajivan edition, 1955.

13. *Mahātmā* II, 99.

14. *Young India*, December 31, 1931.

15. *Young India*, November 4, 1926.

16. *To the Students*, 46.

17. *Young India*, September 25, 1924.

18. *Mahātmā* II, 92.

19. *Mahātmā* II, 347.

20. *To the Students*, 47.

21. *Mahātmā* IV, 50 ff.

22. *To the Students*, 48.

23. *Harijan*, July 28, 1946.

24. *Constructive Program*, 13.

25. *Harijan*, July 20, 1947: "*Satyāgraha* can rid society of all evils, political, economic, and moral."

26. Preface to the English edition of *Hind Swarāj*, 1938.

27. Facsimile of Gandhi's "Talisman" in *Mahātmā* VIII.

28. *Constructive Program*, 12.

29. *Young India*, May 4, 1921.

30. *Harijan*, October 3, 1947.

32. *HINDŪTVA*—HINDUISM-HINDU *DHARMA*

1. There are notable exceptions. Journals like *Seminar* have long warned of "Hindu Fascism," and several scholars have studied the development of right-wing political Hinduism.

2. An extract (in translation) from *Ānanadamaṭha* with the full text of the "Bande Mātaram" is provided in William Theodore de Bary (gen. ed.), *Sources of Indian Tradition*, vol. 2, 156 ff. The Akhil Bhāratīya Sant Samiti, an organization of *sādhus* in support of Hindu political parties, founded in 1989 by Svāmi Vāmadeva, advocates the readoption of the "Bande Mātaram" as the national anthem of India, because it considers the "Janaganamana," the present anthem, "a manifestation of slave-mentality . . . since it was sung at the welcoming ceremony of King George V in India." Translation of the manifesto of the Sant Samiti in *JVS* 1, 1 (1992): 176–79.

3. See M. J. Harvey, "The Secular as Sacred? The Religio-political Rationalization of B. G. Tilak."

4. The full text of the manifesto is reproduced in M. Pattabhiram (ed.), *General Elections in India 1967: An Exhaustive Study of Main Political Trends*, 217 ff.

5. Samagra Savarkar Wangmaya, *Hindū Raṣṭra Darśan*.

6. A very well-researched account of the background of N. Godse and the events up to and including Gandhi's assassination is given in L. Collins and D. Lapierre, *Freedom at Midnight*.

7. M. A. Jhangiani, *Jana Sangh and Swatantra: A Profile of the Rightist Parties in India*. Also V. P. Varma, *Modern Indian Political Thought* and S. Ghose, *Modern Indian Political Thought*.

8. Quoted in M. A. Jhangiani, Ibid., 10.

9. See the election manifesto in Pattabhiram, *General Elections in India*, 204 ff.; also Deendayal Upadhyaya, "Jana Sangh" and "A democratic alternative."

10. See K. Saxena, "The Janatā Party Politics in Uttar Pradesh (1977–79)." The vindictiveness of the Janatā government vis-à-vis the former congress leaders is quite vividly described in chapter 15 of the biography of the former president of India, *Giani Zail Singh*, by Surinder Singh Johar.

11. *India Today* (February 15, 1993), 59–63.

12. The *Viśva Hindū Pāriṣad* publishes a monthly *Hindū Viśva*. In a special issue, brought out before the Prayāga Sammelan January 1966, a number of prominent leaders

spelled out the essence of the movement in Hindī and English articles e.g., S. S. Apte, "Viśva Hindū Pariṣad. Confluence of Hindu Society."

13. The article in *India Today* quoted at the beginning of this chapter calls the Viśva Hindū Pariṣad "the intellectual arm of the RSS, with a million dedicated workers in 2,500 branches all over India."

14. Information on the origin and structure of the RSS is contained in literature mentioned in note 7. *Seminar* 151 (March 1972) had a major article on the RSS by D. R. Goyal and provided a fairly extensive bibliography (40 ff.). More recent publications are referred to in P. Dixit, "Hindu Nationalism." *The Illustrated Weekly of India's* cover story in its March 12, 1978, issue was "How Powerful is the RSS?" It also carried an interview with Balasaheb Deoras. The RSS is publishing a weekly magazine, *The Organiser*. See also C. P. Barathwal, "Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh: Origin, Structure and Ideology." "Open Offensive," *India Today*, (June 30, 1989), 58–61, claims that the RSS has over twenty-five thousand branches in almost twenty thousand cities and villages with about two million activists and five million members.

15. *Bunch of Thoughts*, chapter 1, "Our World Mission," 9 ff.

16. *Illustrated Weekly of India* (March 12, 1978), 11. See also L. Rattanani and Y. Ghimire's recent report on the RSS, "Manning All Battle Stations," *India Today* (January 15, 1993), 55.

17. His principles are laid down in *Rām Rājya aur Marxvād*.

18. Cf. K. P. Karunakaran, "Regionalism."

19. *The Illustrated Weekly of India* devoted its March 15, 1970 issue to the theme "Private Armies." Meanwhile much has been written on them.

20. See, e.g., A. George, *Social Ferment in India*. Also K. K. Gangadharan, "Shiv Sena."

21. P. C. Chatterji, "Secularism: Problems and Prospects," chapter 7 in *Secular Values for Secular India*, gives a fairly detailed account of some of the major recent communal riots and their genesis. See also S. P. Aiyar, *The Politics of Mass Violence in India*.

22. Louis Dumont, in a very incisive study, "Nationalism and Communalism" in *Religion/Politics and History in India*, 89–110, operates with a definition of *communalism* provided by W. C. Smith in *Modern Islam in India*, 185, as "that ideology which emphasizes as the social, political and economic unit the group of adherents of each religion, and emphasizes the distinction, even the antagonism, between such groups." *Communalism* is, in a certain sense, a specifically Indian phenomenon, large enough to make sure that the routine Western sociology and political science approach to Indian society is inadequate. Nirmal Mukarji, "The Hindu Problem."

23. Moin Shankar, "Social Roots of Communalism."

24. December 1991, 13/12, 1 and 4.

25. See also "Swāmis in Politics," *Hinduism Today* 13/7, July 1991, 25–26.

26. "Pilgrim's Protest," *India Today* (March 15, 1993), 74–76.

27. D. Upadhyaya, "A Democratic Alternative," 23: "Ideology-based parties and policy-oriented politics are desirable, for they alone can sublimate politics and distinguish

it from the game of self-aggrandizing power-hunting . . . an education of the people on an ideological and programmatic basis is necessary so that they are freed of caste-ism, communalism and regionalism."

28. See "One-Nation Challenge," *India Today*, February 15, 1993, 15.

29. See "Nice People, Nasty Mood," Ibid., 72–73.

30. Chaman Lal, in *Hindu America*, offers arguments for a long-standing naval connection between India and Central America.

31. R. C. Majumdar, in *Hindu Colonies in the Far East*, collected rich materials to document this expansion.

32. More detail on the Hindu heritage in South Asia in K. Klostermaier, "Hindu Missions in India and Abroad."

33. A. S. Altekar, "Hinduism, A Static Structure or a Dynamic Force," 425.

34. Somen Das, an Indian Christian theologian, critical of traditional Christianity, published in 1996 a series of essays, under the title *Dharma of the Twenty-first Century: Theological-Ethical Paradigm Shift*, that comes close to adopting the Hindu notion of *dharma*.

33. INDIA AND THE WEST

1. R. C. Majumdar, *The Classical Accounts of India*. Also J. Schwab, *The Oriental Renaissance: Europe's Rediscovery of India and the East, 1680–1880*.

2. Arrian's "Anabasis of Alexander" (second century CE) is based on the now lost writings of Aristobulos and Ptolemy, who had accompanied Alexander. See also Plutarch, *Life of Alexander*, ch. 64. English translations of these and other sources in R. C. Majumdar, *The Classical Accounts of India*. A standard work on this period is W.W. Tarn, *The Greeks in Bactria and India*.

3. Diodorus Siculus, *Historical Library*, vol. 17, 107.

4. Alisaunder, *Alexander: Alexander and Dindimus*, Latin text 10 ff.: my translation.

5. I. K. K. Menon, "Kerala's Early Foreign Contacts."

6. A famous Pāli work, *Milindapañha* describes questions placed before the Buddhist sage Nāgasena by Menander of Sagala in northwestern India. English translation: T. W. Rhys Davids, *The Questions of King Milinda*.

7. For details see J. Schwartzberg (ed.), *HASA*: "Campaign and Empire of Alexander the Great" and "India as Known to Early Greeks."

8. For more details see: E. Benz, *Indische Einflüsse auf die frühchristliche Theologie*.

9. A great many interesting articles on this subject are contained in R. Baine Harris (ed.), *Neoplatonism and Indian Thought*. See also E. Elintoff, "Pyrrho and India." An attempt to prove the independent origin of Greek philosophy over against those who assume an Indian influence was undertaken by H. J. Krämer, *Der Ursprung der Geistmetaphysik*.

10. For more details see: J. Filliozat, *Les rélations extèrieures de l'Inde*, 1. Les échanges de l'Inde et de l'Empire Romain aux premiérs siécles de l'ere chretienne, 2.

La doctrine brahmanique a Rome au Illeme siécle. See also Klaus Karttunen, "On the Contacts of South India with the Western World in Ancient Times, and the Mission of the Apostle Thomas."

11. The legend itself is of uncertain age. It found its expression in Nicolas Novotitch's *Life of Issa*, which is supposed to be the translation of a manuscript in a Tibetan monastery containing the life story of Jesus. Quite a few Indians have accepted it. See for instance Pundit Shunker Nath, *Christ: Who and What He Was*: Part 1. *Christ a Hindu Disciple, nay a Buddhist Saint*, Part 2. *Christ a Pure Vedāntist*. The Danish scholar Christian Lindtner goes even further by claiming that the Gospels of the New Testament are based on (inadequate) translations from Buddhist Sanskrit texts into Koine Greek. See his essay "Some Sanskritisms in the New Testament Gospels." Lindtner also announced a forthcoming monograph on the topic. See also the website www.jesusbuddha.com,

12. Tertullian, *Apologia versus gentes*, in *Migne Patrologia Latina*, vol. 1, 1080 ff.

13. *Migne Patrologia Latina*, vol. 17, 1167 ff.

14. Evidence of lively exchange between India and the Arab countries is collected in J. Duncan M. Derett's: "Greece and India Again: The Jaimini-Aśvamedha, the Alexander Romance and the Gospels." Interesting details are also presented in an Internet article, "India and Ancient Egypt," by www.arianuova.org. There is increasing interest in finding links between Hindu India and South America. Thus The Council of Elders of the Sacred Mayas, Guatemala held in 2005 a conference on "Hindu-Maya Cultural Similarities." BBC News 2006/08/03 carried an item "Peru link to Indian archeological find?"

15. Edward C. Sachau, trans., *Alberuni's India: An Account of the Religion, Philosophy, Literature, Geography, Chronology, Astronomy, Customs, Laws and Astrology of India about* A.D. 1030.

16. R. E. Latham (trans.), *The Travels of Marco Polo*. On India: 233–68. See also: Heimo Rau, "The Image of India in European Antiquity and the Middle Ages."

17. One of the most interesting accounts of South Indian Hinduism in the early eighteenth century is the recently discovered work by the Lutheran missionary Bartholomaeus Ziegenbalg (1682–1719), *Traktat vom Malabarischen Heidentum* (1711), which was never printed. See Hans-Werner Gensichen, "Abominable Heathenism—a Rediscovered Tract by Bartholomaeus Ziegenbalg." The work of Abbé Dubois (1770–1848), *Hindu Manners, Customs and Ceremonies*, first published by the East India Company in 1816, has become a classic in its own right and has been reprinted many times by Oxford University Press.

18. G. H. R. Tillotson, "The Indian Travels of William Hodges."

19. Ibid., 378 ff.

20. W. Leifer, *Indien und die Deutschen: 500 Jahre Begegnung und Partnerschaft*. Gita Dharampal compiled a bibliography of early German writing about India: "Frühe deutsche Indien-Berichte (1477–1750)."

21. *Systema Brahmanicum* (Rome: 1792); *Reise nach Ostindien* (Berlin: 1798).

22. P. J. Marshall (ed.), *The British Discovery of Hinduism in the Eighteenth Century*.

23. For more detail see G. H. Hampton, *Oriental Jones: A Biography of Sir William Jones 1746 1794* and *The Life and Mind of Oriental Jones: Sir William Jones, the Father of Modern Linguistics*.

24. For details on the *Ezour Vedam*, used as a source for Indian traditions by Voltaire, see M. Winternitz, *Geschichte der indischen Literatur*, vol. 1, 12 n. 1.

25. A brief history of French Indology is given in P. S. Filliozat's "The French Institute of Indology in Pondichery." A major contribution to Indian studies was also made by Russian and Polish scholars. In Russia especially, the study of Indian languages is flourishing today. Italian, Dutch, Belgian, and Finnish scholarship in Indian studies is alive, too, to a lesser degree perhaps in Spain and Latin American from where, however, some very good work has come out recently.

26. At the age of twenty five he wrote his epoch-making work: *Über das Conjugationsystem der Sanskrit Sprache in Vergleichung mit jenen der griechischen, lateinischen, persischen und germanischen Sprache. Nebst Episoden des Ramajan und Mahabharat in genau metrischen Übersetzungen aus dem Originaltexte und einigen Abschnitten aus den Vedas*. F. Staal, *A Reader on the Sanskrit Grammarians*, has assembled many valuable documents and comments on the history of Western Sanskrit scholarship.

27. The first complete translation of the Bible into Sanskrit was published by W. Carey from Serampore between 1808 and 1818; it was later improved upon by W. Yates and J. Wenger. For further details see: J. S. M. Hooper, *Bible Translation in India, Pakistan, Ceylon*, second edition: revised by W. J. Culshaw.

28. The *Sanskrit Wörterbuch* together with *Nachträge* has been reprinted by Motilal Banarsidass in 1991.

29. Published originally by Oxford University Press and reprinted several times by other publishers recently, the *Sacred Books of the East* have not yet been replaced as a standard work, although such series as *Sacred Books of the Buddhists*, *Sacred Books of the Jains*, and *Sacred Books of the Hindus* offer a larger number of text translations in the designated areas.

30. For more complete information consult: P. J. Chinmulgund and V. V. Mirashi (eds.), *Review of Indological Research in Last 75 Years*.

31. Hindu scholars like R. G. Bhandarkar, S. N. Dasgupta, S. Radhakrishnan, T. M. P. Mahadevan, and T. R. V. Murti, to name just a few, spent considerable time lecturing in the West.

32. For more details see: Dale Riepe, *The Philosophy of India and Its Impact on American Thought*. See also C. T. Jackson, *The Oriental Religions and American Thought: Nineteenth-Century Explorations*.

33. The journal *Philosophy East and West*, published by the University of Hawaii, has remained one of the principal instruments for the continued discussion of the conferences' issues.

34. Dale Riepe, *The Philosophy of India*, 275 ff.: "If the American empire meets with the fate of the British, if Americans cannot resolve their life-and-death struggle with the intelligent use of technology, if the alienation in American society cannot be alleviated, then a new attitude may gradually replace the 300-year reign of optimism.

Such eventualities may lead to more philosophers turning to contemplation, meditation and increased poring over the Hindu and Buddhist scriptures."

35. Ibid.

36. The case is well stated by Malati J. Shendge in her essay "The Interdisciplinary Approach to Indian Studies."

37. Ananda Coomaraswamy, *Transformation of Nature in Art*, 4.

38. *Indian and Western Philosophy: A Study in Contrasts*; *Facets of Indian Thought*.

39. *Philosophies of India*, J. Campbell (ed.); *Myths and Symbols in Indian Art and Civilization*.

40. *Nāma-Rūpa and Dharma-Rūpa: Origin and Aspects of an Ancient Indian Conception*.

41. *Introduction génerale a l'étude des doctrines hindoues*.

42. *The Hindu Temple*; *The Presence of Śiva*.

43. India and Europe: An Essay in Understanding," "On Being and What There Is: Classical Vaiśeṣika and the History of Indian Ontology."

44. The case has been convincingly stated by Jaideva Singh in his edition and translation of the *Pratyabhijñāhṛdayam* by the numerous references to the earlier translation of the text by K. F. Leidecker.

34. HINDUISM AND SCIENCE

1. The Chinese *Records of the Western World*, compiled between the seventh and tenth centuries (translated by S. Beal, *Si-yu-ki: Buddhist Records of the Western World*) contain a full description of this curriculum (*Si-yu-ki*, vol. 1, 78 ff.)

2. P. V. Kane has topically summarized in his monumental *History of Dharmaśāstra* the contents of this vast literature.

3. The most famous is the aforementioned Kauṭilya *Arthaśāstra*, ascribed to the prime minister at the Maurya court, who provides fascinating details of many departments in the vast administration of that empire.

4. Some important texts will be mentioned later.

5. One such text, the *Kṛṣi-Parāsara*, has been edited and translated by G. P. Majumdar and S. C. Banerji and published by the Asiatic Society Calcutta in 1960.

6. These high ethical demands were not only applicable to students of *adhyātmavidyā*, as articulated by Śaṅkara in *Upadeśa-sahasrī*, 3 ff. but also to students in the professions, such as medicine, as stated in *Cāraka Saṃhitā* 8, 13 and others. [Cf. the Shree Gulabkunverba Ayurvedic Society's *The Cāraka Saṃhitā* (Jamnagar, 1949), vol. 1 (Introduction), 162–86.]

7. The success of modern Western science is based on reductionist analysis, that is, isolating parts of a complex whole that are treated as separate entities. Science-based technology similarly pursues limited objectives disregarding everything that does not pertain to a particular aim.

8. Betty Heimann, *Facets of Indian Thought*, 37 contrasts this notion with the Greek *kósmos*, idea: "*Ṛta*, the World-balance or World-course, is not as for instance

its equivalent in Greece, a purposeful order brought into the cosmos by a selective teleological plan laid down by the mastermind of a creator. Not before the things themselves come into being are they planned and then created . . . each single function is appropriate to the thing concerned, but serves at the same time to fulfil the purpose of the Whole."

9. *Taittirīya Upaniṣad* I, 7 S. Radhakrishnan (trans.), *The Principal Upaniṣads*, 535.

10. In the *Trimūrti*, the Hindu "Trinity," Viṣṇu has the role of "preserver."

11. See especially Prajāpati's teaching in *Chāndogya Upaniṣad* VIII, 7.

12. However, the intention with which the study was undertaken differed.

13. Translated into English by E. Sachau under the title *Alberuni's India*.

14. For more information on *Jyotiṣa Vedāṅga* see V. M. Apte, "The Vedāṅgas."

15. Besides these there were others, such as the *Kaśyapa Saṃhitā*.

16. Govinda Krishna Pillai in *Vedic History*, ix, writes: "The measuring rods used by Mohenjo Daro architects are still being used. Their limits and their proportions are still the guides for indigenous architects and builders."

17. See Guy Beck, *Sonic Theology*.

18. See W. Kaufmann, *Rāgas of North India*.

19. A succinct account of the development of Indian linguistics is provided in the historical resumé of *The Philosophy of the Grammarians*, G. Coward and K. Kunjunni Raja (eds.).

20. See Subhash Kak: "The Science of Consciousness in Ancient India" in T. S. R. Rao and S. Kak (eds.) *Computing Science in Ancient India*, pp. 91–106

21. See A. K. Biswas, "Brass and Zinc Metallurgy in the Ancient World: India's Primacy and the Technology Transfer to the West." The section "Indian Sciences." In G. Flood (ed.) *The Blackwell Companion to Hinduism, 345–409* offers additional information on several of the areas mentioned.

35. HINDUISM AND ECOLOGY

1. In classical Hindu mythology, Yamunā is considered the sister, not the daughter, of Yama.

2. Anil Agarwal, "Can Hindu Beliefs Help India Meet Its Ecological Crisis," 175.

3. Ibid.

4. V. B. Mishra in an interview with David Suzuki in "Matrix of Life," Part 2 of the David Suzuki Video Series *The Sacred Balance* (2003).

5. Some examples of this can be found in K. Klostermaier, "Hinduism, Population, Consumption and the Environment."

6. David Lee, "The Natural History of the *Rāmāyaṇa*."

7. *Bhāgavata Purāṇa* (BhP) XI, 7–9.

8. Ibid. II, 7, 4.

9. Ibid. XI, 7, 19 ff.

10. Ibid. XI, 9, 27 ff.

11. By equating "the scriptural means of terminating misery" with the perceptible in which "there is no certainty or finality," it sets itself up against the "new religion" of post-Gupta, scripture-based Hinduism.

12. The question has been extensively addressed by E. Frauwallner in the first volume of his *Geschichte der Indischen Philosophie*.

13. On this see G. Feuerstein, *The Philosophy of Classical Yoga*, chapter VII, "Pātañjala Yoga and Classical Sāṁkhya."

14. Cf. *Bhagavadgītā* (*BG*) 5,6; 13, 29 ff.

15. *Kārikā* 59.

16. *BhP* III, 27, 12 ff.

17. J. H. Masui, "Introduction to the Study of Yoga," 19 ff.

18. G. J. Larson, "The Format of Technical Philosophical Writing in Ancient India: Inadequacies of Conventional Translations."

19. Cf. György Doczi, *The Power of Limits*.

20. *Pañcadaśī* (*PD*) IX, 89.

21. *PD* IV, 54 ff.

22. See M. Hiriyanna, "*Svabhāva-vāda* or Indian Naturalism."

23. *PD* VI, 144.

24. In the light of this, the following remark by J. A. Wheeler, a leading contemporary astrophysicist, is interesting: "The golden trail of science is surely not to end in nothingness . . . not machinery, but magic may be the better description of the treasure that is waiting." "From Relativity to Mutability," 203.

25. *PD* VI, 147.

26. *PD* V, 30.

27. Swami Prajnananda, *The Bases of Indian Culture*, 139 ff.

28. *PD* VI, 152.

29. *PD* VI, 160.

30. Satya Deva Mitra, "The Advaitic Concept of *Abhāsa*," 267 ff.

31. *PD* VI, 161.

32. *PD* VI, 165.

33. *PD* VI, 166.

34. *PD* VI, 183. I am using the words *implicate* and *explicate* so as to evoke an association with the way in which the physicist David Bohm (*Wholeness and the Implicate Order*) uses them, recalling Nicholas of Cusa's example.

35. *PD* VI, 211.

36. *PD* VI, 243.

37. *PD* VI, 252.

38. *Ṛgveda* X, 90, 13 and 14.

39. *Bhagavadgītā* XI, 7.

40. J. A. B. van Buitenen, *Rāmānuja on the Bhagavadgītā*, chapter 7, 4 ff.

41. Ibid., 7, 12.

42. Ibid.

43. *Yatīndramatadīpikā of Śrīnivāsadāsa*, Avatāra 7.

44. J. A. B. van Buitenen, *Rāmānuja on the Bhagavadgītā*, chapter 7, 13.

45. Ibid., 7, 14.

46. M. Yamunacharya, *Rāmānuja's Teachings in His Own Words*, 80 ff.

47. Śaṅkara on *Brahma Sūtra* I, 1, 2: "that omniscient, omnipotent cause from which proceed the origin, subsistence, and dissolution of this world—which is differentiated by names and forms, contains many agents and enjoyers, is the abode of the fruits of actions, these fruits having their definite places, times, and causes, and the nature of whose arrangement cannot even be conceived by the mind, that cause, we say, is Brahman." Rāmānuja on *Brahma Sūtra* I, 1, 2: "this entire world with its manifold wonderful arrangements, not to be comprehended by thought, and comprising within itself the aggregate of living souls from Brahmā down to blades of grass, all of which experience the fruits in definite places and at definite times."

48. See C. Deegan, "The Narmadā: Circumambulating a Landscape" and W. F. Fischer, "Sacred Rivers, Sacred Dams: Competing Visions of Social Justice and Sustainable Development along the Narmadā."

36. HINDU MEASURES OF TIME

1. P. V. Kane, *History of Dharmaśāstra*, vol. 5, part 1.

2. http://sanjayrath.tgripod.com/Article/hindu_calendar.htp

3. *Rāṣṭrīya Pañcāṅga*, published every year (in English and several Indian vernaculars), The Director General of Observatories, Government of India, New Delhi.

4. *Viśva Pañcāṅgam*, Kāśī Hindū Viśva Vidyālaya, (published every year in Hindī).

5. *Manusmṛti*.

6. *Viṣṇu Purāṇa*.

37. INDIAN CHRONOLOGY

1. Reported in *Spiegel Online*, May 31, 2005.

2. *MLBD Newsletter*, January 1993, 7.

3. See H. D. Sankalia, "Paleolithic, Neolithic and Copper Ages." Major archaeological research published by B. Allchin and F. R. Allchin, *The Rise of Civilization in India and Pakistan*. G. C. Possehl (ed.), *Harappan Civilisation: A Contemporary Perspective*. For locations of Stone Age archaeological sites in India, see *HASA*, plate II, 1; Neolithicum and Chalcolithicum plate II, 2 with reproductions of characteristic artifacts and appropriate text information, 263–66. For a map of locations of Harappan and other contemporary South Asian cultures see *HASA* plate II, 3 and text on 266 ff.

4. J. F. Jarrige, "Die frühesten Kulturen in Pakistan und ihre Entwicklung"; G. Quivron, "Die neolithische Siedlung von Mehrgarh."

5. *HASA* map "India as Revealed in the *Mahābhārata*," plate III A, 2. 164 ff. Text and bibliography: 266.

6. *HASA* map "India as Revealed in the *Rāmāyaṇa*," plate III A, 1, 164. Text and bibliography: 266.

7. *HASA* map "Vedic India," plate III A, 162 ff. Text and literature: 266.

8. J. G. Shaffer, "Prehistory" in "Addenda and Corrigenda," *HASA*, 265a.

9. See P. C. Sengupta, *Ancient Indian Chronology*, illustrating some of the most important astronomical methods. Also: S. C. Kak, "The Indus Tradition and the Indo-Āryans."

10. See A. D. Pusalker, "Historical Traditions," *HCIP*, vol. 1, 271–336. F. E. Pargiter, *Ancient Indian Historical Tradition*, starting from Purāṇic records, takes a notably different departure and assumes that the Aryans entered India from the mid-ranges of the Himālayas and settled around Banares ca. 2300 BCE before spreading westward and eastward.

11. P. C. Sengupta, *Ancient Indian Chronology*, 101 ff.

12. Internet communication April 5, 2005 IANS.

13. S. B. Roy, "Chronological Infrastructure of Indian Protohistory" and "Chronological Framework of Indian Protohistory—The Lower Limit."

14. S. Kalyanaraman in "Revival of the Legendary River Sarasvatī" reports on projects undertaken by the Indian government to bring the river system back to life after six thousand years of dormancy.

15. M. R. Mughal, "Recent Archaeological Research in the Cholistan Desert."

16. On this see H. Bechert, *On the Dating of the Historical Buddha*, and the reply by Dissanayake discussed in K. Klostermaier, *Buddhism: A Short Introduction*, 27, note 4.

17. About these and other eras used in India, see L. Renou and Jean Filliozat (eds.), *L'Inde Classique*, vol. 2., appendix 3, "Notions de chronologie," 720–38.